

### Dashboard Indicators for the Northeast Ohio Economy: Prepared for the Fund for Our Economic Future

by Randall Eberts, George Erickcek, and Jack Kleinhenz



#### FEDERAL RESERVE BANK OF CLEVELAND

**Working papers** of the Federal Reserve Bank of Cleveland are preliminary materials circulated to stimulate discussion and critical comment on research in progress. They may not have been subject to the formal editorial review accorded official Federal Reserve Bank of Cleveland publications. The views stated herein are those of the authors and are not necessarily those of the Federal Reserve Bank of Cleveland or of the Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System.

Working papers are now available electronically through the Cleveland Fed's site on the World Wide Web: **www.clevelandfed.org/research.** 

# Dashboard Indicators for the Northeast Ohio Economy: Prepared for the Fund for Our Economic Future

by Randall Eberts, George Erickcek, and Jack Kleinhenz

The Fund for Our Economic Future (The Fund) is a multiyear collaborative effort "to encourage and advance a common and highly focused regional economic development agenda that can lead to a long-term economic transformation of the Northeast Ohio (NEO) economy." One of the strategies pursued by the Fund is to create and regularly update Dashboard Indicators for the Northeast Ohio Regional Economy. The Dashboard is intended to provide a framework for understanding the regional economic process and to track the region's economic progress. This report presents the methodology used to construct and design the dashboard.

The Federal Reserve Bank of Cleveland is publishing this paper as part of our working paper series in order to further academic discussion of regional economic growth factors. Federal Reserve Bank of Cleveland economists served as advisors on this project; however, the views stated in the report are those of the authors and are not necessarily those of the Federal Reserve Bank of Cleveland or of the Board of Governors of the Federal Reserve System.

Randall Eberts and George Erickcek are at the W.E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research, and Jack Kleinhenz is at Kleinhenz and Associates.

# **Table of Contents**

Exec	cutive Summaryi					
	Background and Approachi					
	Key Findings i					
I.	Introduction1					
II.	Analyzing Economic Growth Dynamics of the Region					
	Starting Point					
	Selecting Relevant Data7					
	Identifying Underlying Factors7					
	Description of the Factors					
	Skilled Workforce					
	Urban Assimilation12					
	Legacy of Place					
	Income Equality13					
	Locational Amenities					
	Business Dynamics					
	Urbanization/Metro Structure					
III.	Measures of Regional Growth15					
V.	Rankings of Metropolitan Areas According to Factor Scores22					
	Skilled Workforce23					
	Urban Assimilation25					
	Racial Inclusion					
	Legacy of Place					
	Income Equality					
	Locational Amenities					
	Business Dynamics					
	Urban/Metro Structure					
VI.	Constructing the Dashboard Indicators					
VII.	Lessons for the NEO Economy41					
VIII	Conclusion					
Spec	Special Acknowledgement46					
App	endix A: Primary Source Data47					

### **Background and Approach**

The Fund for Our Economic Future (The Fund) is a multiyear collaborative effort "to encourage and advance a common and highly focused regional economic development agenda that can lead to a long-term economic transformation of the Northeast Ohio (NEO) economy." Over 80 organizations, including philanthropic foundations, corporate giving programs, chambers of commerce and local governments, have contributed nearly \$30 million to the Fund.

The Fund pursues three related strategies:

- making grants to nonprofit organizations that have the potential to make a substantial economic impact on the regional economy
- conducting a public outreach effort, Voices & Choices, which strives to create a shared agenda among the citizens and leaders of North-east Ohio for revitalizing the regional economy
- creating and regularly updating the Dashboard Indicators for the Northeast Ohio Regional Economy the subject of this report. The Dashboard is intended to provide a framework for understanding the regional economic process and to track the region's economic progress.

This report presents the methodology used to construct the framework, create the indicators based on this framework, and design the dashboard. The methodology is noteworthy in that it yields indicators that reflect the key features of the underlying process of economic growth in the region. Basing the NEO indicators on such a methodology sets them apart from those created for other regions. Too often, indicators that are interesting and seemingly useful are assembled into a reporting system with the idea that the user can pick and choose. Stakeholders have little way of knowing which indicators track key factors in the region's economic development process. The NEO indicators, on the other hand, are constructed from the viewpoint of "less is more." We include only those indicators that closely relate to regional economic growth and that are critical for understanding and tracking the regional growth process.

### **Key Findings**

Preparation of the Dashboard indicators began with an analysis of 118 metropolitan areas similar in size to those in Northeast Ohio. From that analysis, 40 variables were identified that together provide a comprehensive view of these regional economies. A statistical technique was applied to "distill" a small number of factors from the 40 variables in such a way that the factors still encompassed the information contained in the 40 variables. Another statistical technique was applied to determine the degree to which each of the factors was related to economic growth. Each was shown to be highly correlated with growth in four areas of economic activity: employment, output, per capita income, and productivity. The eight growth factors identified were:

- 1. Skilled Workforce
- 2. Urban Assimilation
- 3. Racial Inclusion
- 4. Legacy of Place
- 5. Income Equality
- 6. Locational Amenities
- 7. Business Dynamics
- 8. Urbanization/Metro Structure.

These eight growth factors were chosen to be the Dashboard indicators. These resulting indicators reflect not only economic factors but also social attributes and physical and cultural amenities. The analysis shows that both economic and noneconomic factors contribute to regional growth.

Our analysis suggests that a skilled workforce is the primary driver of economic growth. Of the eight factors, this factor is the most highly correlated with growth in three of the four areas of economic activity investigated: output, per capita income, and productivity. A skilled workforce includes not only the educational attainment of the workforce as measured by post-secondary degrees, but also the ability of companies to integrate these skills as measured by the proportion of knowledge-based occupations and patents created. Indeed, the analysis shows that a region's skilled workforce contributes significantly to its productivity growth. Those metro areas excelling with respect to a skilled workforce – Boulder, Colorado; San Jose, California; and Austin, Texas – all experience high productivity growth rates. The NEO region could fare better on the skilled workforce factor: The Cleveland-Lorain-Elyria area and Akron rank near the middle of the 118 metro areas (43rd and 55th, respectively), while Youngstown-Warren and Canton-Massillon are in the bottom quartile.

Business dynamics is the primary driver of metropolitan employment growth. This factor includes not only the opening and expansion of businesses but also the closing and contraction of existing businesses. Both dimensions together capture the vitality of a region as manifested through the process of creative destruction, whereby aging and less productive enterprises are replaced with newer, more innovative ones. The NEO region does not fare as poorly with respect to business dynamics. The four metro areas are within the second quartile of cities, with Canton-Massillon ranked 31st, Akron 34th, Cleveland-Lorain-Elyria 44th and Youngstown-Warren 54th. It is noteworthy that these NEO metro areas outrank areas such as Austin and Seattle, but this factor weights equally job loss and job creation. The resulting indicators also suggest that it is not only economic factors that impact a region's growth. The analysis shows that the social values of racial inclusion and income equality are contributing factors toward economic growth, as well.

In the four areas of economic growth investigated, the NEO economy fares poorly. The region is in the bottom quartile with respect to employment growth and real output growth. The four NEO metro areas are ranked slightly higher with respect to per capita income growth and productivity. During the past decade, Akron ranked 45th in per capita income growth and Cleveland-Lorain-Elyria ranked 35th in productivity growth. Youngstown-Warren is near the bottom on all four measures.

#### **Lessons and Conclusions**

Several key lessons emerge from this analysis, which are important for developing a shared regional vision and agenda.

- 1. There is no "silver bullet" that will turn a slow-moving economy based on traditional industries into a vibrant, high-performance one.
- 2. A skilled workforce and strong business dynamics are most highly correlated with regional economic growth.
- 3. The pursuit of social goals, such as racial inclusion and income equality, can enhance regional economic growth.
- 4. While positively related to per capita income growth, locational amenities are not as important to regional growth as the other factors included in the analysis.
- 5. The region's growth is impeded by legacy costs, which are the result of an aging infrastructure and an unpopular climate

Going forward, the NEO Dashboard of Regional Indicators will track these eight factors over time for each of the four NEO metro areas. In addition, the ranking of the four metro areas with respect to these factors and the four measures of regional growth will be updated annually to monitor the relative progress of the region.

The evidence-based approach used to construct the Dashboard yields regional economic indicators that local stakeholders can use to gain insights into how to structure an economic development agenda that focuses on issues that are directly related to growth. The indicators, by encompassing not only important economic factors but also societal values, allow the region's stakeholders to advance a highly focused regional economic development agenda that can lead to a long-term economic transformation, both in terms of promoting economic growth and in improving its civil society.

## I. Introduction

The Fund for Our Economic Future (The Fund) is a multiyear collaborative effort "to encourage and advance a common and highly focused regional economic development agenda that can lead to a long-term economic transformation of the Northeast Ohio (NEO) economy." Over 80 organizations, including philanthropic foundations, corporate giving programs, chambers of commerce and local governments, have contributed nearly \$30 million to the Fund.

The Fund pursues three related strategies::

- making grants to nonprofit organizations that have the potential to make a substantial economic impact on the regional economy;
- conducting a public outreach effort, Voices & Choices, which strives to create a shared agenda among the citizens and leaders of Northeast Ohio for revitalizing the regional economy; and
- creating and regularly updating Dashboard Indicators for the Northeast Ohio Regional Economy – the subject of this report. The Dashboard is intended to provide a framework for understanding the regional economic process and a set of meaningful indicators that can be used to track the region's economic progress.

This report presents the methodology used to develop the Dashboard Indicators and a discussion of the indicators, with an explanation for interpreting them.<sup>1</sup>

Many organizations concerned about the economic development of their region have established a set of indicators that measure the economic vitality of their region. However, many of these efforts share the pitfall of including too many indicators, which can be confusing and misleading. Too often, indicators that are "interesting" and seemingly useful are assembled into a dashboard system with the idea that the user can "pick and choose." The approach ignores whether or not the indicators have a meaningful relationship with the underlying regional or local economy. In developing the Dashboard Indicators for Northeast Ohio, we adopted the adage that "less is more." Like the dashboard

<sup>1.</sup> A preliminary step for this study was a statistical analysis comparing the economic competitiveness of the NEO region to other metropolitan areas. The NEO competitive analysis study is not included in this working paper but is available upon request from the W.E. Upjohn Institute. The data shows that Northeast Ohio's subpar industrial performance is due to two factors. First, most of its traditional core industries face shrinking national and international markets. Second, the competitiveness of the industries in the region is mediocre. The region is home not only to industries that are growing more slowly than the nation overall but also to companies that are less competitive than their counterparts elsewhere. Some regions are fortunate to excel in both factors, but many which we associate with high growth succeed primarily because of their above-average competitiveness. For example, Austin, San Diego, Seattle, and Indianapolis have grown because their companies are more competitive than companies in the same industry located elsewhere.

of a car, which displays only those indicators that are necessary to properly operate and maintain the vehicle, our regional dashboard should include only those indicators necessary to understand and monitor regional growth. We constructed eight such indicators from 40 economic, demographic, and social variables that we demonstrate through empirical analysis are highly correlated with regional economic growth.

The first step in this effort was the development of a framework to analyze and understand the economic growth dynamics of the region. The analysis tells us what the determinants of economic growth are, which matter most in regional development, and where Northeast Ohio stands in terms of the determinants. This information enables us to prioritize and select economic variables – such as the percentage of adults holding graduates degrees – according to the extent to which they are correlated with measures of economic growth. The factors that are shown to contribute the most to growth are included in the Dashboard.

Because of the multidimensional nature of the regional growth process, it is important that the Dashboard Indicators are based on sound empirical evidence. Doing so is important for the success of economic development initiatives for several reasons:

- Regional economic growth is dictated by powerful market forces. Appropriate and effective intervention must be based on understanding how to nudge these forces in the direction that the region prefers and how to turn local assets "into the wind," so to speak, so that market forces can carry the region forward. Attempting to stand against the wind is futile and foolish. Therefore, it is critical that policymakers and economic planners understand which forces drive the regional economy, the direction they are pushing the local economy, and how to use these forces to their advantage.
- 2. Understanding these forces helps the region's stakeholders to envision the region's possible future courses. Wishing to become another region, which has evolved from an entirely different resource base and is subject to different historical circumstances, contributes little to a concrete strategy for the future. Rather, understanding the possible contributors to future growth and taking stock of the region's assets are important steps in pursuing a viable economic development strategy.
- Economic development is a never-ending process, and economic planners must continue to monitor and discuss their region's progress while charting their future course. A set of local economic development indicators provides a basis for ongoing policy discussion and planning and a means of assessing progress.

There is considerable experience from which to better understand the factors that contribute to regional growth. Each of the more than 300 metropolitan areas in the country has pursued economic development efforts for decades and continues to respond to its specific circumstances in line with its own aspirations for rate and quality of growth. Each metropolitan area obviously has unique attributes and challenges, but it is safe to say that there are more similarities than differences in the challenges they face and the measures they have taken to address them. While a region must set its own agenda, the process of developing regional strategies can benefit from the rich set of experiences taking place in hundreds of regional economic development "laboratories" across the country. Understanding which metropolitan areas excel and which lag behind with respect to specific factors that affect growth can help local leaders hone in on policies that have been successful in some areas and that might prove appropriate for the NEO region.

Our approach to developing the Dashboard Indicators was based upon rigorous empirical analysis. The analysis identifies broad factors that are associated with the economic growth of metropolitan areas. By estimating the extent to which these factors are correlated with economic growth, they provide a framework for prioritizing public initiatives. We constructed indicators using these broad factors and the variables that are statistically associated with them.

The Dashboard Indicators were developed in seven steps.

- 1. The organizing committee of the Fund for Our Economic Future outlined five themes of regional growth that they wanted to investigate or track. We would determine to what extent each was important for regional economic growth and in what way in steps 1–5.
- 2. We identified variables that measure various attributes of these five themes, and added other variables that we know from past research affect economic growth. For example, in order to investigate one of the preselected areas, a skilled workforce, we identified the following variables as measures: percentage of the population holding a bachelor's degree, percentage holding a graduate degree, number of major universities located in the area, percentage of professional occupations, and a composite measure of the skill content of workers. In total, we identified 40 variables. Next we compiled data on those variables for 118 U.S. metropolitan areas that were similar in size to those in Northeast Ohio.<sup>2,3</sup>

<sup>2.</sup> Only metropolitan areas that are between 200,000 and 3 million in population were included in the study.

<sup>3.</sup> In an earlier version of this report "Building a Set of Dashboard Indicators for the Northeast Ohio Economy," we included 43 variables for 157 metro areas. The reduction in the number of metro areas examined is due to the non-availability of current statistics for 49 of these metro areas.

3. We applied a statistical technique to the data to group these variables into factors. The technique groups variables based on how strongly correlated they are with each other. Eight factors were generated which captured 90 percent of the variation of the 40 variables. Based on which variables fall into which factor, factors can be interpreted in an intuitive way. For example, some of the variables selected for the area of a skilled workforce did, in fact, turn out to be related to each other: percentage of the population with a graduate degree, percentage with a bachelor's degree, the composite measure of skill content of different workers, and the percent of the workforce in professional occupations. However, other variables grouped with these as well, but these reflect the same concept: productivity in the information sector, the number of patents per employee, and the percent of the population between 15 and 65 years old.

The eight factors derived from the analysis are:

- Skilled workforce
- Urban assimilation
- Racial inclusion
- Legacy of place
- Urban/metro structure
- Locational amenities
- Business dynamics
- Income equality.
- 4. The eight factors gleaned from the empirical analysis were related back to the five preselected themes identified by organizing committees. Several of the areas correspond to the factors resulting from the analysis, but additional factors were identified as well. The resulting indicators reflect not only economic factors but also social attributes and physical and cultural amenities. The analysis shows that both economic and noneconomic factors contribute to regional growth.
- 5. We applied another statistical procedure to determine the degree to which these eight factors are correlated with four measures of economic growth: employment, per capita income, output, and productivity. The technique determines how much of the variation across the 118 metro areas in these measures of growth is explained by each of the eight factors. All were highly correlated with at least some of the economic growth measures.
- 6. We ranked the set of metropolitan areas in each of the eight factors, as a way of gaining a better understanding of how to interpret the factors (and not to establish a set of comparison metropolitan areas).

7. Once the relationship between the factors and regional growth were estimated, the final step was the construction of the eight dashboard indicators to track the area's relative performance. These indicators are weighted indexes based on the variables that cluster around each of the identified factors. The eight indicators and the variables that characterize them are shown in table 1.

#### Table 1. Components of the Eight Dashboard Indicators

#### **Skilled Workforce**

- Productivity in information sector
- Number of patents per employee
- Graduate degree
- Bachelor's degree
- Skill differences
- Professional occupation
- Percent of population between 16 and 64

#### **Urban Assimilation**

- Percent Asian
- Percent minority business employment
- Percent foreign born
- Percent homeownership
- Commuter time
- Cost-of-living index
- Percent Hispanic

#### **Racial Inclusion**

- Percent Black
- Isolation index
- Dissimilarity index

#### **Legacy of Place**

- Number of governmental units
- Climate index
- Gross change in employment due to business churning
- Crime index
- Percent of houses built before 1940

#### **Income Equality**

- Ratio of income of top 10 to bottom 10
- Percent of children living in high-poverty neighborhoods

#### **Locational Amenities**

- Major university presence
- Transportation index
- Arts index
- Health index
- Recreation index

#### **Business Dynamics**

- Percent of businesses employing fewer than 20 workers
- Gross change in employment due to business churning
- · Concentration in manufacturing employment

#### **Urban/Metro Structure**

- · Percent of metro population in core city
- Concentration of poverty in core city

# II. Analyzing Economic Growth Dynamics of the Region

#### **Starting Point**

As a starting point in our analysis of the economic growth dynamics of the region, we first examined several themes suggested by the project's organizing committee. These themes were believed to be important in the development of a regional economic dashboard – either as important aspects of growth to track or suggestions about which characteristics of the region might contribute to economic growth. These themes were:

- Economic growth and employment
- Education and workforce
- Equity and fairness
- Quality of life and place
- Cooperation and governance.

Next, these themes were divided into subcategories. The themes and the subcategories identified for each are displayed in table 2.

#### Table 2. Conceptual Themes of the Regional Framework

#### **Economic Growth and Employment**

- 1. Industry structure/clusters
- 2. Knowledge-based economy
- 3. New industry development
- 4. Improving the business environment
- 5. Entrepreneurship

#### **Education and Workforce**

- 1. Workforce development to meet societal and business needs
- 2. Lifelong learning including K-12 education

#### **Equity and Fairness**

- 1. Create an open, diverse, and international community
- 2. Age
- 3. Ethnic/immigrant
- 4. Access to basic services

#### **Quality of Life and Place**

- 1. Core city/neighborhood regeneration
- 2. Arts and culture
- 3. Keep communities' distinctive attributes
- 4. Safety

#### **Cooperation and Governance**

- 1. Regional cooperation
- 2. Public sector efficiency
- 3. Civic engagement/entrepreneurship
- 4. Public/private partnerships

#### **Selecting Relevant Data**

For each of the subcategories, we identify a list of variables for which it is possible to find comparable data for a broad sample of metropolitan areas, and then we added other variables that we know from past research affect economic growth.<sup>4</sup> A total of 40 variables were identified. We based our final selection of variables on 1) their connection to the specific economic area we wish to monitor, 2) their reliability, 3) their timeliness (the data should be available with a lag of two years or less), and 4) their availability (most data should be available on an annual basis and be reasonably inexpensive to acquire). However, for several of the factors found to be associated with economic growth, timely economic variables are not available.

Each theme is associated with a number of variables. For instance, the skill content of a region's workforce cannot be captured merely by one variable, such as the percentage of residents with bachelor's degrees. Skills are acquired in other ways, and they are reflected in the prevalence of certain kinds of occupations, such as professional and technical occupations, and in knowledge generated by those skilled individuals — measured, perhaps, by the number of patents held in a region. Therefore, one would expect that regions with a high concentration of these attributes would be associated with a highly skilled workforce.

We intend these variables to measure "inputs" rather than "outputs," and they are for the most part expected to serve the function of defining policy issues and informing the formulation of policy. The set of variables may be related in a hierarchical fashion, in that some variables may be considered intermediate inputs that relate to higher-order inputs, which in turn affect outputs. For example, patents may affect the production process which improves productivity. In this sense, patents affect the output of goods and services through productivity changes. While it is important at this stage to recognize the hierarchical nature of some inputs, we will keep the analysis relatively simple and will not dwell much on this issue.

#### **Identifying Underlying Factors**

We compiled data on the 40 variables for 118 U.S. metropolitan areas that were similar in size to those in Northeast Ohio. These data were obtained from various sources, but most came from government agencies, such as the Bureau

<sup>4.</sup> We start out with data for all metropolitan areas and then select a subset of metro areas based upon various criteria pertinent to each stage of the analysis. We use metropolitan areas (and primary metropolitan areas, where appropriate) as our definition of a region. Four metropolitan statistical areas (MSAs) and primary metropolitan statistical areas (PMSAs) lie within the NEO region: Akron, Canton-Massillon, Cleveland-Lorain-Elyria, and Youngstown-Warren. While there are small regions of NEO that are not included in these definitions, the four metro areas comprise the bulk of the population and economic activity in the area. The only criterion we use initially to restrict our sample to comparable metropolitan areas is to include only those with populations greater than 200,000 and less than 3,000,000. We have benefited greatly from the set of indicators that Ziona Austrian has compiled at Cleveland State University.

of the Census, the Bureau of Labor Statistics, and the Bureau of Economic Analysis. The list of variables is displayed in table 3, and a list of variables along with their sources is included in Appendix A.

In the data we look for relationships among the variables. Identifying these relationships can offer insights into how to think about the components of growth. Should education be viewed as a distinct component or is it observed consistently with other closely related components such as research and development? If so, perhaps the two components should not be disentangled but rather considered together as one larger factor when formulating development strategies.

To identify the underlying factors among the 40 variables, we use the statistical technique of factor analysis. Factor analysis estimates a small number of common factors from a larger set of variables. This technique, in essence, seeks to discover if the observed variables can be explained largely or entirely in terms of a much smaller number of variables called factors.

In this case, we collapse 40 variables into 8 independent factors. It is important to point out that these factors are not absolute. Others factors may be equally valid. Therefore, we do not claim that our list of factors is a complete description of the economic development process. Rather, we submit that after several iterations of analyzing the data using factor analysis, these factors appear to be the ones that best summarize the large set of variables associated with regional economic development.

The eight factors capture more than 90 percent of the variance of these 40 variables. The factors and their "factor loadings" are shown in table 4.<sup>5</sup> In order to determine which variables should be included with each factor, we look across the row for each variable and determine which factor loading has the highest absolute value (positive or negative). We assign the variable with the largest value to that particular factor (i.e., column). In some cases, the factor loadings might be small, which indicates that that particular variable does not have a sufficient correlation with any of the factors, and these variables are not included. However, all but a few of the 40 variables are associated with one of the eight factors.<sup>6</sup>

<sup>5.</sup> The factor loadings are the correlation coefficients between the variables (rows in table 4) and factors (columns). The squared factor loading is the percent of the variance in that variable explained by the factor. For instance, for the loading of 0.938 on the variable bachelor's degree means that the first factor accounts for 88 percent (.938\*.938) of the variance of this variable. To obtain the percent of the variance in all the variables accounted for by each factor, add the sum of the squared factor loadings for that factor (column) and divide by the number of variables (Garson, Factor Analysis, www2.chass.ncsu.edu/garson/pa765).

<sup>6.</sup> In order to make the output more understandable and to facilitate interpretation of the factors, common practice is to rotate the initial factor loadings. We use the varimax rotation, which is an orthogonal rotation of the factors to maximize the variance of the squared loadings of a factor (column) on all the variables (rows) in a factor matrix. This technique minimizes the number of variables which have high loadings on any one given factor, resulting in each factor tending to have either high large or small loadings of particular variables on it. This makes it easy to identify each variable with a single factor.

# Table 3.Variables Associated with the Five Themes of Regional DevelopmentOffered by the Organizing Committee

#### I. Economic Growth and Employment

- Productivity of the information sector
- Number of patents per employee
- Percentage of businesses employing fewer than 20 workers.
- Employment dynamics (churning) as measured by the sum of jobs created due to startups and expansions plus the jobs lost due to closings and contractions divided by base employment

#### **II. Education and Workforce**

- Percentage holding bachelor's degree
- Percentage holding graduate degree
- Major universities located in the metropolitan area
- Percentage professional occupations
- Composite measure of skill content of workers (skill differences)

#### **III. Equity and Fairness**

- Percentage African American
- Percentage Hispanic
- Percentage Asian
- Percentage foreign born
- Income gap (income at the 90th percentile minus income at 10th percentile divided by income at the 10th percentile)
- Spatial concentration of poverty (percent of children in high-poverty census tracts)
- Racial dissimilarity index
- Racial isolation index
- Homeownership rate
- Concentration of poverty in the core city
- Percentage minority business ownership
- Dependency: the percentage of the population less than 16 and greater than 65

#### IV. Quality of Life and Place

- Commuting times
- Art index (Places Rated Almanac)
- Recreation index (Places Rated Almanac)
- Crime index (Places Rated Almanac)
- Health index (Places Rated Almanac)
- Transportation index (Places Rated Almanac)
- Cost of living
- Climate Index

#### V. Cooperation and Governance

- Number of city governments within metropolitan area divided by metro population
- Core city's share of metropolitan population

# Additional Variables not Associated with the Five Themes

- Percentage of housing stock built before 1940
- Concentration of manufacturing jobs

Variable	Skilled workforce	Urban assimilation	Racial inclusion	Legacy of place	Income equality	Locational amenities	Business dynamics	Urban/ metro structure
Professional occupation	0.955	0.062	-0.042	0.053	-0.032	0.033	0.017	-0.010
Graduate degree	0.906	0.064	-0.077	0.006	0.010	0.039	0.075	0.058
Bachelor's degree	0.881	0.177	-0.049	0.063	-0.182	0.131	0.081	-0.089
Skill differences	0.612	-0.083	0.199	0.011	-0.188	0.152	-0.041	0.075
% population >16 or 64	-0.660	0.056	0.142	0.125	0.018	-0.081	0.280	0.142
Number of patents/emply.	0.480	0.142	-0.181	-0.120	-0.176	-0.017	-0.087	0.073
Productivity information sec.	0.456	0.271	-0.042	-0.013	-0.011	_0.049	0.152	_0.025
% foreign born	0.097	0.927	-0.105	0.023	0.084	0.055	0.153	0.084
% minority business emply.	0.031	0.884	0.056	0.125	0.223	-0.087	0.076	-0.012
% Hispanic	-0.138	0.770	-0.260	0.122	0.250	-0.030	0.142	-0.123
Cost of living index	0.342	0.683	-0.149	0.222	-0.132	-0.002	0.098	0.141
% Asian	0.341	0.663	-0.180	0.104	-0.056	-0.033	-0.192	0.032
Commuter time	0.144	0.549	0.256	0.167	-0.080	-0.149	0.168	0.303
% homeownership	-0.160	-0.537	0.223	0.068	-0.349	-0.124	-0.027	0.324
Isolation index	0.024	0 121	0 0 2 8	0.025	0 192	0 167	0.017	0.071
Disimiliarity index	0.157	-0.121	0.720	0.334	0.102	0.16/	-0.017	0.071
% Black	0.061	0.107	0.020	0.004	0.007	0.104	0.058	0.141
	0.001	-0.121	0.307	0.277	0.374	_0.000	-0.030	
Climate index	-0.076	0.469	-0.247	0.623	0.187	-0.050	0.343	0.097
Gross change in emply. due	0.163	0.356	-0.042	0.618	0.142	0.120	0.470	-0.075
No. governmental unite	0 164	0.287	0 117	0 4 4 0	0.210	0.070	0.071	0.028
Crime index	-0.104	-0.307	0.117	-0.447	-0.210	-0.070	-0.071	0.038
% of bourses built < 1940	0.130	-0.217	0.127	0.030	-0.332	-0.133	-0.123	0.172
	_0.035	_0.030	0.137	-0.878	-0.030	0.027	-0.110	0.080
% children living in high pov. nbds.	-0.358	0.195	0.128	0.075	0.814	-0.029	0.039	-0.183
Income inequality	_0.005	0.387	0.285	0.206	0.765	_0.028	0.122	_0.054
Transportation index	0.126	-0.099	0.168	-0.026	0.043	0.824	-0.074	-0.155
Recreation index	0.083	-0.108	0.372	0.142	-0.265	0.584	0.214	0.184
Arts index	0.525	0.241	0.248	-0.087	-0.244	0.535	-0.067	0.053
Major university	0.487	0.026	0.074	0.107	0.104	0.520	-0.085	0.086
health Index	0.445	0.003	0.196	0.019	0.186	0.451	-0.037	0.045
% businesses employing <20 workers	-0.023	0.200	-0.032	0.177	-0.047	-0.109	0.832	0.226
Gross change in employment due to business churning	0.163	0.356	-0.042	0.618	0.142	0.120	0.470	-0.075
Concentration in manufacturing employment	-0.096	-0.151	0.016	-0.261	-0.288	-0.077	-0.693	0.164
Concentration of poverty in core city	0.089	0.107	0.124	-0.141	-0.034	-0.071	0.037	0.716
% metro pop in core city	0.128	-0.034	-0.154	0.098	0.262	-0.021	-0.109	-0.762

# Table 4. Elements of the Regional Framework

As shown in figure 1, the statistically identified factors correspond nicely to the themes initially identified by the project's organizing committee. However the analysis identified other themes that were not included in the original list. Furthermore, some of the suggested themes were outcome measures, and not input measures, such as, economic growth and employment and these were eliminated.





#### **Description of the Factors**

#### Skilled Workforce (Column One)

Consider the first column in table 4. This factor loads most highly on variables related to the workforce. We see high factor loadings for the percentage of the population with a bachelor's degree and the percentage with graduate degrees. We also find that occupations with high education content, such as professional occupations, are also associated with this factor. In addition, variables measuring patents per employee and productivity of the information sector are also correlated with these other variables. The variable "skills differences" is a composite measure of the skills of the labor force as reflected in educational levels and occupations, and this, too, is included in this factor. Since these variables all load with the same sign, they are positively correlated. That is, metropolitan areas with a high percentage of bachelor's degrees also have a high number of patents per employee. Because of the dominance of education and workforce variables underlying this factor, we label it "skilled workforce."

#### **Urban Assimilation (Column Two)**

The next factor, as shown in column two, includes variables that have to do with ethnic diversity (percent Asian, Hispanic, or foreign born), minority business ownership, and homeownership. Note that variables reflecting racial and income isolation, such as racial diversity (black), racial isolation and dissimilarity indexes, and income inequality, are missing from this factor. These variables load highly on two different factors. It is noteworthy that a high cost of living, a low rate of homeownership, and long commutes also load with ethnic diversity, suggesting that these metropolitan areas are experiencing strong pricing pressure on real estate. Because of the distinct ethnic and immigrant aspects underlying this factor and the association with areas experiencing a high cost of living and low homeownership rates, we classify the underlying theme of this set of variables as "urban assimilation."

#### **Racial Inclusion (Column Three)**

Included in the list of variables are two indexes of racial inclusion. One is racial isolation index and the other is a racial dissimilarity index (dism2000). These variables, along with a measure of the percentage of the population that is African American, all exhibit high loadings on this factor. That these variables all have the same sign clearly points to the underlying factor of racial inclusion. It should be noted that the analysis has separated the racial dimension of inclusion from the economic dimension. The income measures of inclusion (or conversely isolation) form their own factor, as shown in the last column of table 4. The two income inequality measures exhibit high loadings together but low loadings in the third column. The same is true for the racial isolation measures with respect to income equality — they have low correlations (low loadings) in the last column. All this leads to the conclusion that race and income are two distinct dimensions of social inclusion.

#### Legacy of Place (Column Four)

Some metropolitan areas are plagued by what can best be described as high "legacy of place" costs These costs may be related to a declining industrial base that has left the area with an older infrastructure, high unemployment, a population with lower educational attainment and thus fewer opportunities, a disproportionate need for human services, and a tax base that is not sufficient to support the demand for services without raising taxes. We have included several measures that capture these circumstances. The percentage of housing stock put in place before 1940 measures the age of the city and reflects the costs of maintaining older infrastructure such as roads and sewers. Older cities may also be associated with higher demand for other services and require higher tax rates to support them, particularly if the tax base is shrinking or not growing sufficiently. Thus, we find that variables that reflect crime rates are associated with this factor. In addition, the structure of local government, as measured by the number of municipalities per capita in the local metropolitan area, is also positively correlated with these legacy of place costs, in that metropolitan areas with more fragmented government structures may be associated with higher costs. In addition, we find that these attributes are less likely to be found in areas with favorable climates, as evidenced by the negative loading of the climate index. Finally, business churning, which partly reflects a region's past and present business and entrepreneurial environment, is also associated with this factor. Churning is a measure of the business activity in the area. It is constructed by adding the number of jobs gained due to startups and expansions over a three-year period, subtracting the number of jobs lost due to contractions and closings over the same period, and dividing by employment in the base period. This variable is also included in the "business dynamics" (column seven). We classify the factor underlying the variables in this grouping as "legacy of place."

#### **Income Equality (Column Five)**

This underlying factor is related conceptually to racial inclusion (column 3), but focuses on income not race. It is measured by an income inequality index, constructed by taking the difference between the income at the 90th percentile of the income distribution and at the 10th percentile and dividing the result by the 10th percentile income. The other measure is the percentage of children under the age of 18 living in census tracts with poverty rates of 20 percent or higher. Both of these variables load high on this factor.

#### Locational Amenities (Column Six)

This factor includes most of the quality-of-life variables that were compiled for the analysis. These include indexes measuring the transportation system, recreational opportunities, the arts, and health services. Joining these quality-of-life variables is the presence of a major research university in the metropolitan area. The two quality-of-life indexes that did not load high on this factor are crime rate and climate. Crime and climate loaded high on the "legacy cost" factor. The quality-of-life variables that did coalesce with this factor are those that can be constructed privately or publicly. In other words, a region can invest in arts and cultural institutions and transportation infrastructure, whereas they have little control over climate.

#### **Business Dynamics (Column Seven)**

Three variables loaded highly on this factor – churning (also included in legacy of place), the proportion of small establishments, and the concentration of manufacturing. It is important to note that churning is the addition of the gross flows of jobs, which is a measure of business activity, not a measure of net employment change. The concentration of manufacturing is measured by the location quotient. Metropolitan areas that score high on this factor are characterized by high business activity in small establishments outside of the manufacturing sector.

#### Urbanization/Metro Structure (Column Eight)

This factor includes important variables describing the government structure of the metropolitan area, particularly as it pertains to the core city, and the core city's share of poverty. The poverty variable measures the core city's share of poverty relative to its share of the metropolitan population. A value greater than one indicates that its share of poverty is greater than its share of the population. Thus, a negative relationship suggests that poverty is less concentrated in the core city. This variable has ramifications for the ability of government entities to share tax revenue across a broader population and spread the costs of poverty over a larger population and tax base. It is curious, however, that the variable called the number of municipalities per capita within a metropolitan area is not part of this group. The evidence is clear that the degree of fragmentation is not related to the core city's population share. The factor loading of the fragmentation variable, the number of governmental units, on this factor is quite low (0.038), and the factor loading of the population share of the core city on this factor is also low (-0.156), indicating that there is little correlation between the two variables. While other labels may also fit this factor, we have associated it with metro government structure and its consequences with respect to poverty.

Our analysis examined the data with respect to four measures of regional growth – percentage change in output, employment, productivity, and per capita income.<sup>7</sup> Together these measures offer a comprehensive view of the economic development of regions. Output growth is the clearest measure of a region's business performance and is the regional counterpart of the nation's gross domestic product. Employment growth reflects employment opportunities for local residents as well as for in-migrants. In fact, many argue that it is employment opportunities that attract people to an area, but still others may find a region attractive for other reasons. Productivity – output per employee — is a key factor determining the region's overall competitiveness. Per capita income growth measures the income-generating aspect of a region. Employment opportunities are important, but additional jobs must also be accompanied by pay increases or a greater share of high-paying jobs in order for a region's standard of living to improve, as reflected in higher incomes per person. We expect to find that certain factors will affect these three measures differently.

We examine the past ten years, 1994 to 2004, for most of the analysis. Unfortunately, due to data limitations only 118 metropolitan areas are included in the sample. The 2004 data from the U.S. Census American Community Survey (ACS), from which a large share of our data is derived, are still limited to only 118 of the 187 metro areas that had a population of between 200,000 and 3,000,000 individuals in 2000. The ten-year time span covers approximately a full business cycle and provides sufficient time for short-term disturbances or interventions to work through the regional economies. Regardless of which of the four measures of economic growth is used, the four metropolitan areas in NEO grew at a modest pace during the period, as shown in tables 5 through 8. In terms of employment growth, all four of the NEO metro areas grew at a rate below the average, 16.5 percent for the 118 metro areas, during the period. Akron achieved the highest percent change in employment, 6.5 percent, with Youngstown-Warren lagging the other three with a 3.5 percent decline. In terms of output growth, none of the NEO metro areas achieved the sample's average growth of 45.4 percent during the ten-year period. As shown on table 6, Akron was the only metro average in the NEO region to exceed the average percent increase in per capita income, 45.9 percent, during the period (1993 to 2003). On the other hand, the Cleveland MSA achieved greater-than-average productivity growth, surpassing the sample's average of 20.7 percent for the ten-year period.

<sup>7.</sup> In our previous report, Building a Set of Dashboard Indicators for the Northeast Ohio Economy, we included change in population as a measure of regional growth. Reviewers of that report recommended that we drop population as a measure and use output and productivity in its place. Population is strongly correlated with employment growth, and several reviewers argued that by itself it is not necessarily a good measure of a region's development as it can be associated with sprawl.

# Table 5.Change in Employment 1994–2004

Rank	Metropolitan Area	Percent Change	Rank	Metropolitan Area Pe	ercent Change
1	Sarasota-Bradenton,FL	49.3	60	Indianapolis, IN	16.3
2	Fayetteville-Springdale-Rogers, AF	R 42.5	61	Des Moines, IA	15.7
3	Austin-San Marcos,TX	42.0	62	Montgomery, AL	15.3
4	Fort Myers,FL	41.2	63	Lancaster, PA	15.3
5	Boise City, ID	40.9	64	Spokane, WA	14.9
6	West Palm Beach, Fl	40.3	65	Jackson, MS	14.8
7	Orlando El	39.5	66	Corpus Christi TX	14 7
8	Valleio-Egirfield-Nang CA	39.3	67	Macon GA	14.6
9	Provo-Orem LIT	35.4	68	Atlantic-Cape May NI	14.0
10	San Luis Obisno. CA	35.0	60	Fugana Springfield OP	12.6
10	Charlesten North Charlesten SC	247	70	Appleton Oshkesh Neengh W/	13.0
10	Change CA	34./	70		10.2
12	San Diego, CA	34.0	71	Mobile, AL	13.1
13	lampa-St. Petersburg, FL	32.2	/2	Kansas City, MO-KS	13.0
14		31.3	/3	Grand Rapids, MI	12.9
15	Raleigh-Durham-Chapel Hill, NC	31.3	/4	Fayetteville, NC	12.7
16	Hamilton-Middletown, OH	30.6	/5	Allentown-Bethlehem-Easton, PA	12.2
17	Fort Lauderdale, FL	30.3	76	Little Rock, AR	11.9
18	Daytona Beach, FL	30.0	77	Newark, NJ	11.6
19	Stockton-Lodi, CA	29.9	78	Miami, FL	11.2
20	Colorado Springs, CO	29.6	79	Birmingham, AL	11.1
21	Orange County, CA	28.5	80	Tulsa, OK	11.0
22	Modesto, CA	28.3	81	Shreveport-Bossier City, LA	8.5
23	Ventura, CA	27.0	82	Galveston-Texas City, TX	8.2
24	Jacksonville, FL	26.8	83	Augusta-Aiken, GA-SC	8.2
25	Santa Rosa, CA	25.6	84	Jersev City, NJ	7.9
26	Monmouth-Ocean. NJ	25.2	85	Bergen-Passaic.NJ	7.4
27	Madison WI	25.0	86	Pittsburgh PA	7.3
28	Bakersfield CA	20.0	87	Milwaukee-Waukesha WI	7.3
29	Dutchess County NY	24.6	88	Greenville-Spartanburg-Anderson SC	6.8
30	Salt Lake City LIT	24.0	89	Akron OH	6.5
31	Lincoln NE	27.7	90	York PA	6.5
30	Fort Piorco, El	20.7	01	Greenshore Winston Salem High Point	NC 6.5
3Z 22	Lakeland Winter Haven El	22.0	71	Devensort Malina Pack Ida IA II	1NC 0.5
24	Eart Worth TY	22.0	72	Pooria Polin II	5.9
34		22.4	73		J.0 5.5
33		22.3	74	New Orleans 1.4	5.5
30		21.4	95	New Orleans, LA	5.2
3/		21.2	90 07	San Jose, CA	5.0
38	lucson, AZ	21.0	97	Forf Wayne, IN	4.9
39	lacoma, WA	20.9	98	Syracuse, NY	4.8
40	Boulder-Longmont, CO	20.9	99	Lansing-East Lansing, MI	4./
41	Fresno, CA	20.7	100	Ufica-Rome, NY	4.2
42	Oklahoma City, OK	20.6	101	Reading, PA	3.8
43	Nashville, TN	20.5	102	Beaumont-Port Arthur, TX	3.6
44	Baton Rouge,LA	20.4	103	Erie, PA	3.2
45	Denver, CO	19.6	104	Scranton-Wilkes-Barre-Hazleton, PA	3.2
46	Oakland, CA	19.5	105	South Bend, IN	3.1
47	Richmond-Petersburg, VA	19.1	106	Cleveland-Lorain-Elyria, OH	3.0
48	Salinas, CA	18.9	107	Canton-Massillon, OH	2.8
49	Springfield, MO	18.1	108	Kalamazoo-Battle Creek, MI	2.6
50	Pensacola, FL	17.9	109	Rochester, NY	1.0
51	Lubbock, TX	17.9	110	Rockford, IL	0.8
52	Melbourne-Titusville-Palm Bay, FL	17.4	111	Buffalo-Niagara Fall, NY	0.3
53	Lexington, KY	17.3	112	Dayton-Springfield, OH	-0.6
54	Trenton, NJ	17.2	113	Toledo, OH	-0.8
55	Middlesex-Somerset-Hunterdon, N	J 17.1	114	Binghamton, NY	-2.2
56	, Seattle-Bellevue-Everett, WA	16.7	115	Saginaw-Bay City-Midland, MI	-3.0
57	Santa Barbara, CA	16.6	116	Youngstown-Warren, OH	-3.5
	SAMPLE AVERAGE	16.5	117	Hickory-Morganton-Lengir, NC	-6.6
58	Ann Arbor, MI	16.4	118	Flint. MI	-11.5
59	Visalia-Tulare-Porterville, CA	16.4		· ····, · · ·	11.0
Sourc	e: Economy.com				

### Table 6. Change in Real Output 1994 to 2004 (billions of dollars)

Rank	Metropolitan Area P	ercent Change	Rank	Metropolitan Area Per	rcent Change
1	Boise City, ID	153.8	60	Birmingham, AL	36.3
2	AustinSan Marcos,TX	144.3	61	Lancaster,PA	36.2
3	San Jose,CA	134.6	62	Daytona Beach,FL	36.0
4	BoulderLongmont,CO	111.2	63	LakelandWinter Haven,FL	35.9
5	Colorado Springs,CO	81.9	64	Knoxville,TN	35.2
6	RaleighDurhamChapel Hill,NC	80.6	65	Fort Pierce,FL	34.7
7	FavettevilleSprinadaleRoaers,AR	79.7	66	Fresno,CA	33.8
8	San Diego, CA	77.1	67	Pensacola.FL	33.2
9	Jersev City, NJ	75.7	68	Tacoma WA	31.7
10	West Palm Beach Fl	72.0	69	AllentownBethlehemFaston PA	31.6
11	Fort Myers FI	66.8	70	FugeneSpringfield OR	30.9
12	Santa Rosa CA	66.2	71	Johnson City TNVA	30.4
13	Salt Lake City UT	65.3	72	Baton Rouge LA	30.2
14	ProvoOrem LIT	62.6	73	AppletonOshkoshNeengh WI	29.2
15	SeattleBellevueEverett WA	61.3	74	RichmondPetersburg VA	27.2
16	Orange County CA	60.9	75	Des Moines IA	22.1
17	Vontura CA	50.0	76	Oklahoma City OK	20.3
19	Fort Worth TY	57.7	70	Spokapo WA	20.0
10		57.7	70		20.1
17		55.0	/0 70		27.7
20	Denver,CO	54.7	/9		27.5
21	Forf Lauderdale,FL	54.5	80	fork,PA	27.4
22	Huntsville,AL	54.3	81	Forf Wayne,IN	26.7
23	VallejoFairfieldNapa,CA	54.1	82	Fayetteville,NC	26.5
24	SarasotaBradenton,FL	53.5	83	Grand RapidsMI	26.5
25	Orlando,FL	52.7	84	Mobile,AL	26.5
26	MonmouthOcean,NJ	52.7	85	ClevelandLorainElyria,OH	26.3
27	Reno,NV	52.6	86	BergenPassaic,NJ	26.0
28	HamiltonMiddletown,OH	52.5	87	Akron,OH	24.1
29	TampaSt. Petersburg,FL	52.1	88	GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Poin	it,NC 23.9
30	Dutchess County, NY	51.4	89	Little Rock,AR	23.2
31	Nashville,TN	49.1	90	Pittsburgh,PA	23.1
32	Modesto,CA	48.9	91	CantonMassillon,,OH	21.4
33	Trenton,NJ	48.7	92	AtlanticCape May,NJ	21.0
34	Tucson,AZ	48.3	93	DaytonSpringfield,OH	20.6
35	Salinas,CA	48.3	94	DavenportMolineRock Island,IAIL	20.4
36	MiddlesexSomersetHunterdon,,N	IJ 48.1	95	South Bend,IN	20.3
37	Madison,WI	47.6	96	ShreveportBossier City,LA	20.0
38	Springfield, MO	47.1	97	Toledo,OH	19.7
39	Kansas City,,MOKS	46.9	98	ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton,PA	18.9
40	Indianapolis,IN	45.7	99	Reading,PA	18.8
	SAMPLE AVERAGE	45.4	100	Erie,PA	18.6
41	Jacksonville, FL	44.5	101	LansingEast Lansing, MI	18.2
42	MilwaukeeWaukesha, WI	44.4	102	PeoriaPekin, IL	17.5
43	Bakersfield, CA	44.2	103	BuffaloNiagara Fall, NY	16.9
44	San Luis Obispo,CA	44.0	104	Rochester.NY	16.1
45	Newark,NJ	43.5	105	HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC	15.5
46	Lincoln,NE	43.5	106	AugustaAiken,GASC	13.7
47	Santa Barbara, CA	43.2	107	UticaRome.NY	13.3
48	MelbourneTitusvillePalm Bay.Fl	43.1	108	New Orleans, I A	13.0
49	Montgomery Al	43.0	109	KalamazooBattle Creek MI	12.9
50	Tallahassee El	42.7	110	GalvestonTexas City TX	12.2
51	StocktonLodi CA	42.7	111	Rockford II	12.2
52	CharlestonNorth Charleston SC	41 2	112	Binghamton NY	11 6
52	Ann Arbor MI	40.4	112	Corpus Christi IX	11.0
54	Levington KY	30.4	11/	Svracuse NV	11.0
55	Greenville Sportanburg Anderson	SC 303	115	Begument Port Arthur TY	10.1
56	Macon GA	300	112	Sacingw Bay City Midland M	0.1
57	Visalia Tularo Portonillo CA	37.0	117	Voungstown Warres OH	7.4
50	lackeen MS	26.4	110		3.1
J0 50		30.0	110	1 11111,7931	-11.0
J7	LUDDUCK, IA	30.3			

Source: Economy.com

# Table 7.Change in Per Capita Income 1993 to 2003

1         San Jose CA         65.0         60         Greenville-Sportnoburg-Anderson, 2C         45.7           3         San Diego, CA         62.4         62         Foytetwille, NC         45.5           3         San Diego, CA         62.4         62         Foytetwille, NC         45.5           5         Salt Lake City, UT         57.8         64         LakelandWinter Hoven, FL         45.4           4         Santia Obispo, CA         57.4         67         Fork worth, NA         45.3           5         San Ling Obispo, CA         57.4         67         Fork worth, NA         43.6           9         Birmingham, AL         57.1         68         Tracon, GA         44.6           10         Charleson-North Charleston, SC         55.6         70         Pensacola, FL         44.1           11         Jackson, MS         55.7         70         Pensacola, FL         44.0           12         Oakland, CA         53.3         74         Mobile, AL         43.9           13         Jackson, MS         53.7         70         Pensacola, FL         43.4           14         Lincolin, PA         53.3         74         Mobile, AL         43.9	Rank	Metropolitan Area	Percent Change	Rank	Metropolitan Area Percent 0	Change
2         Boulder-Longmont,CO         62.9         61         Melbourne-Thusville-Failm Bay,FL         45.5           3         San Diego,CA         62.4         62.4         62.4         Foretherlik, NC         45.5           4         Derwer,CO         60.4         63         Jerrey City, NJ         45.5           5         San Like City, UT         57.8         64         Lokeland-Winter Hover, FL         45.4           6         Sectifier-Sectifier, NJ         45.3         San Luis Obispo, CA         57.4         67         Fort Worth, TX         44.8           7         Colorado, Spring, CO         55.6         70         Pencicole, FL         44.4           10         Cherne, North Charleston, SC         55.6         70         Pencicole, FL         44.4           11         Lincoln, Marcos, TX         53.3         74         Mobile, AL         43.9           12         Lincoln, Marcos, TX         53.3         74         Solinas, CA         43.7           13         Mastin-San Marcos, TX         53.2         76         Solinas, CA         43.7           13         Nashville, TN         53.1         75         Allemon-BritishemEaston, PA         43.7           14         Indican,	1	San Jose,CA	65.0	60	GreenvilleSpartanburaAnderson,SC	45.8
3         San Diego, CA.         62.4         62.7         Foyetteville, NC.         45.5           4         Derwer, CO         60.4         63.2         Jarsay, City, NJ.         45.5           5         Salt Lake City, UT         57.8         64.         LakelandWinter Hoven, FL.         45.4           6         Sant Lits Obispo, CA.         57.4         67.         Fort Worth, TX.         44.8           8         Birmingham, AL.         57.7         67.         Fort Worth, TX.         44.8           10         CharlestonNorth Charleston, SC.         56.3         69.         Maccon, GA.         44.5           11         Jackson, WA.         55.6         71.0         Pentscolia, FL         44.4           12         Oakland, CA.         55.6         71.0         Pentson, Pents, L.         44.0           14         Lincoln, NS         53.3         74.         Mobile, AL         43.9           15         Austin-Son Marcos, TX         53.3         74.         Mobile, AL         43.7           15         Austin-Son Marcos, TX         53.3         74.         Mobile, AL         43.7           16         Nasthville, TN         52.2         78.         Solinase, CA         43.7 <td>2</td> <td>BoulderLonamont.CO</td> <td>62.9</td> <td>61</td> <td>MelbourneTitusvillePalm Bay.FL</td> <td>45.7</td>	2	BoulderLonamont.CO	62.9	61	MelbourneTitusvillePalm Bay.FL	45.7
4         Derver, CO         60.4         63         Jersey, Ciny, JU         45.5           5         Sat Lake City, UT         57.8         64         LakelandWinter Haven, FL         45.4           6         Sat Like City, UT         57.8         64         LakelandWinter Haven, FL         45.4           7         Colorado Springs, CO         57.5         65         KnownellWinter Haven, FL         45.0           8         San Luis Obispo, CA         57.4         67         Fort Worth, TX         44.8           0         CharlastonMorth Charleston, SC         56.3         69         Maccon, GA         44.5           1         Jackson, MS         55.7         70         Pensacols, FL         44.1           1         Lincoln, GA         53.7         70         Pensacols, FL         44.9           1         Lincoln, GA         54.7         72         PeoriaFakin, JL         44.1           1         Lincoln, GA         53.1         75         AllentownBerthlehemEaston, PA         43.7           1         Nakovichen, Marcos, TX         53.1         75         AllendownBerthlehemEaston, PA         43.7           1         Jockiaborn-Teosci, Sity, TX         52.2         78	3	San Diego.CA	62.4	62	Favetteville NC	45.5
5         Soft Lake City,UT         57.8         64         Liekeland-Winter Haven, FL         45.3           6         Sectific - Balkauer-Everativ,MA         57.7         65         RichmondPatersburg,VA         45.3           7         Calorado Springs,CO         57.5         66         Knooville,TN         45.3           8         San Luis Obispo,CA         57.4         67         Fort Worth,TX         44.8           9         CharlestonNorth Charleston,SC         56.3         69         Macon,GA         44.5           1         Jackson,MS         55.6         71         Buffalor-Niegmer Fall,NY         44.4           1         Oakland,CA         55.6         71         Buffalor-Niegmer Fall,NY         44.4           1         Jackson,MS         54.0         73         LansingRekin,L         43.0           14         Lincoln,NE         54.0         73         Lansing,MI         43.2           15         Austin-San Marcos,TX         53.3         77         Orlando,FL         43.2           16         Noshille,TN         52.2         78         Spokane,WA         32.2           16         Galveston-Texas Gity,TX         52.2         78         Spokane,WA         32.2 <td>4</td> <td>Denver CO</td> <td>60.4</td> <td>63</td> <td>lersev City NI</td> <td>45.5</td>	4	Denver CO	60.4	63	lersev City NI	45.5
Sectific-Ballerue-Everett,WA         57.7         63         Richmond-Pitersburg,VA         45.3           San Luis Obispo,CA         57.5         64         Knorville,TM         45.0           San Luis Obispo,CA         57.4         67         Fort Worth,TX         44.8           Birmingham,AL         57.1         68         Tucson,AZ         44.6           Charleston-North Charleston,SC         56.3         69         Macon,GA         44.5           Oakland,CA         55.6         71         Bufflox-Niagran Fail,NY         44.2           Oakland,CA         55.6         71         Bufflox-Niagran Fail,NY         44.2           Vadison,WI         54.7         72         Peoria-Fekin,L         44.4           Uackson,WI         54.0         73         Lansing-East Lansing,MI         43.9           Nashills,TN         53.1         75         Allentown-East Lansing,MI         43.7           New Orbens,LA         52.3         7         Orlinoo,FL         43.7           New Orbens,LA         51.2         80         Eugene-Springfield,OR         42.8           South Bend,IN         51.2         80         Eugene-Springfield,OR         42.8           South Bend,IN         51.2         80<	5	Salt Lake City UT	57.8	64	LakelandWinter Haven Fl	45.4
Colorado Springs, Colum, M.         57.5         66         Knowille, TN         45.0           Son Luis Obispo, CA         57.4         67         Fort Worth, TX         44.8           Derming, Markan         57.1         68         Tucson, AZ         44.5           O CharlestonNorth Charleston, SC         56.3         69         Macon, GA         44.5           D CharlestonNorth Charleston, SC         56.3         69         Macon, GA         44.5           Jackson, MM         54.7         7         Peniacole, FL         44.4           Madison, MI         54.7         7         Peniacole, FL         44.4           Madison, MI         54.7         7         Peniacole, FL         44.0           Madison, MI         54.7         7         Peniacole, Flexin, ML         43.9           Austin-San Marcos, TX         53.3         74         Mobine, AL         3.9           Austin-San Marcos, TX         53.3         77         Orlondo, FL         43.5           Galveston-Faxac City, TX         52.2         78         Spokane, WA         3.2           Sont Bend, IN         51.2         80         Eugene-Springfield, CR         42.8           Sonta Koso, CA         50.8         82	6	SeattleBellevueEverett WA	57.7	65	RichmondPetersburg VA	45.3
B         Son Luis Obispo, CA         57.4         67         Fort Work, TX         44.8           9         Birmingham, AL         57.1         68         Tucson, AZ         44.6           10         Charleston, North Charleston, SC         55.7         70         Pensocolo, FL         44.1           11         Jackson, MS         55.7         70         Pensocolo, FL         44.1           12         Oakland, CA         55.6         71         Bufflox-Niagrar Fall, NY         44.2           13         Madison, MI         54.7         72         PeoriaRein, L         44.4           14         Lincolo, NE         54.0         73         LonsingEast Lansing, MI         43.9           14         Lincolo, NE         53.1         75         Allentown-BethlehemEaston, PA         43.7           15         Austin-San Marcos, TX         52.3         7         Orinoo, FL         43.5           17         Oklahoma Chy, OK         52.9         76         Solinas, CA         43.7           18         South Bend, IN         51.2         80         EugeneSpringfield, OR         42.8           18         South Bend, IN         51.2         80         EugeneSpringfield, OR         42.	7	Colorado Springs CO	57.5	66	Knowille TN	45.0
5         51         68         Turkin, Turk	, 8	San Luis Obisno CA	57 /	67	Fort Worth TX	11 8
p         Intringtatil, AL         51.1         Ga         Introduction, Nath         51.1         Ga         Introduction, Nath         51.7         70         Pensacolo, FL         44.4           11         Jackson, MS         55.7         70         Pensacolo, FL         44.4           12         Ockland, CA         55.6         70         Pensacolo, FL         44.0           13         Madison, WI         54.7         72         Peoria - Rekin, L         44.0           14         Lincoln, NE         54.0         73         Lansing-East Lansing, MI         43.9           15         Austim-San Marcos, TX         53.1         74         Mobile, AL         43.7           15         New Orleams, LA         52.3         77         Orlando, FL         43.5           16         New Orleams, LA         51.2         80         Euglesh-Durham-Chapel Hill, NC         43.1           17         OutkneeMaudiesha, MI         51.2         81         FoyettevilleSpringdeleKogers, A         42.8           18         Montgomery, AL         51.1         82         Grand Rapids, MI         42.8           18         Montgomery, AL         51.1         82         Grand Rapids, MI         42.8	0	Birmingham Al	57 1	40	Tusson AZ	44.0
ID         Charlestation-Notin Charlestation, SC         Sb.3         OP         MatchingAn         44.3           ID         Jackson, MS         Sb.7         70         Pensociol, FL         44.4           ID         Cokland, CA         Sb.7         71         BuffeloNingero Fell, NY         44.2           Incols, NW         Sb.7         72         PeoriaRekin, L         44.0           Incols, NW         Sb.7         70         Pensociol, FL         43.7           Austin-Son Marcos, TX         Sb.3         77         Orlando, FL         43.7           New Orleans, IA         Sb.2         77         Orlando, FL         43.7           New Orleans, IA         Sb.2         77         Orlando, FL         43.7           New Orleans, IA         Sb.2         78         Spokane, WA         43.2           MiwaukeeWaukesha, WI         Sb.2         78         Spokane, WA         43.2           Montgomery, AL         Sb.1         82         Groom, Regens, AR         42.8           Montgomery, AL         Sb.1         82         Groom, Regens, AR         42.8           South Bend, IN         Sb.4         83         Cleveland-Lorain-Elyria, OH         42.8           South Bend, IN	7	Charlester North Charlester SC	54.0	40	Margan CA	44.0
1         Jockson,MS         3.1.         7.0         Period.Dight_L         44.4           13         Madison,MA         51.6         7.1         BufficialNiagrar Fail,NY         44.4           13         Madison,MI         51.7         7.2         PeoricaReikin,L         44.0           14         Lincoln,NE         54.0         7.2         Lansing-East Lansing,MI         43.9           15         AustinSan Marcos,TX         53.1         7.4         Mobile,AL         43.7           17         Oklahoma City,OK         52.9         7.6         Solinas,CA         43.7           18         New Orleans,LA         52.3         7.0         Orlando,FL         43.5           18         New Orleans,LA         51.2         8         Sokin Bend,IN         43.2           20         MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI         51.2         81         Ergenes-Springfield,OR         42.8           21         South Bend,IN         51.1         82         Grand Rapids,MI         42.8           22         Tacoma,WA         51.3         83         Cleveland-Lorain-Elyria,OH         42.8           23         Auston-Sch,TTX         50.4         85         Boise City,ID         42.0	10	Laskeen MS	50.5	70	Papagaola El	44.5
12         Ockkind, CA         53.0         71         Burdio-Nidger Grai, NI         44.2           14         Lincoln, NE         54.0         72         PeorioRein, L         44.0           14         Lincoln, NE         54.0         73         LansingEast Lansing, MI         43.9           14         Lincoln, NE         53.3         74         Mobile, AL         43.9           16         Nashville, TN         53.3         75         AllentownBethlehemEaston, PA         43.7           16         Nashville, TN         52.2         78         Spokone, WA         43.2           17         Oklohoma City, OK         52.9         76         Solinas, CA         43.7           18         New Orleans, LA         52.2         78         Spokone, WA         43.2           13         South Bend, IN         51.2         80         EugeneSpringfeld-Regers, AR         42.8           14         South Soo, CA         50.8         83         ClevelandLorain-Elyria, OH         42.3           24         Sonta Roso, CA         50.4         86         Boise City, ID         42.0           25         Firitsburgh, PA         50.4         86         Johnson City, TNVA         41.2	10		55.7	70	Perfete Niegene Fall NV	44.4
13       Madaison, Wi       34./       7.2       PeorlaPetkin,L       44.0         15       AustinSan Marcos,TX       53.3       74       Mobile,AL       43.9         15       AustinSan Marcos,TX       53.3       74       Mobile,AL       43.7         16       Nashville,TN       53.1       75       Allentown-BethlehemEaston,PA       43.7         17       Oldahoma City,OK       52.9       76       Solinas,CA       43.7         18       New Orleans,LA       52.3       77       Orlando,FL       43.2         20       MilwaukeeWauksho,MI       51.0       80       EugeneSpringfold-OR       42.8         21       South Bend,IN       51.2       81       FoyettewilleSpringdola-Regers,AR       42.8         23       Initle Rock,AR       50.8       83       Cleveland-Lorain-Elyria,OH       42.3         24       Sonth Roso,CA       50.8       84       Augusta-Aiken,GA-SC       42.2         24       Sinter Roso,CA       50.8       84       Augusta-Aiken,GA-SC       42.2         25       Little Rock,AR       50.4       85       Boise City,IN       41.2         24       Santa Abor,MI       49.9       89       Kola	12		22.0	/ 1	BuffaloInlagara Fall,Int	44.Z
14         Lincoin, NE         54.0         73         Lansing-rest Lansing, MI         43.9           16         Nashville, TN         53.3         74         Mobile, AL         43.9           16         Nashville, TN         53.3         75         Allentown-BethilehemEaston, PA         43.7           16         Nashville, TN         52.3         77         Orlando, FL         43.5           17         Oklohma City, OK         52.9         78         Spikane, WA         43.2           18         New Orleans, IA         52.2         78         Spokane, WA         43.2           18         South Bend, IN         51.2         80         Eugene-Springfolde-Rogers, AR         42.8           21         Taccomo, WA         51.2         80         Eugene-Springfolde-Rogers, AR         42.8           23         Montgomery, AL         51.1         82         Grand Roso, CA         50.8         83         Cleveland-Lorain-Elyria, OH         42.3           24         Santa Roso, CA         50.4         85         Boise City, IN-VA         41.3           25         Cropus Christi, TX         50.4         85         Boise City, IN-VA         41.2           26         Prinsburgh, PA <t< td=""><td>13</td><td>Madison, WI</td><td>54.7</td><td>/ 2</td><td></td><td>44.0</td></t<>	13	Madison, WI	54.7	/ 2		44.0
15         Austim-San Marcos, IX         53.3         74         Mobile, AL         43.7           15         Naskrille, TN         53.1         75         Allentown-Bethlehem-Easton, PA         43.7           17         Oklahoma City, OK         52.9         76         Salinas, CA         43.7           18         New Orleans, LA         52.3         77         Orlando, FL         43.5           18         Galveston-Texas City, TX         52.2         78         Spokane, WA         43.2           20         MilwaukeeWaukesha, WI         52.0         79         RaleighDurhamChapel Hill, NC         43.1           21         Tacoma, WA         51.2         81         FoyettevilleSpringfolel-ARgers, AR         42.8           22         Tacoma, WA         51.1         82         Grand Rapids, MI         42.8           23         Santa Roso, CA         50.8         83         ClevelandLorain-Elyring, OH         42.8           24         Santa Roso, CA         50.4         85         Boise City, ID         42.0           25         Iritis Rock, AR         50.4         85         Boise City, ID         41.0           26         Pitrisburgh, PA         50.4         85         Boise Cit	14		54.0	/3	LansingEast Lansing,MI	43.9
16       Nashville, IN       33.1       7.5       Allentown-Bethlehem-Laston, PA       43.7         17       Oklahoma City,OK       52.9       7.6       Salinas,CA       43.7         18       New Orleans,LA       52.3       7.7       Orlando,FL       43.5         18       New Orleans,LA       52.3       7.7       Orlando,FL       43.7         20       MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI       52.0       7.9       RaleighDurhamChapel Hill,NC       43.1         21       South Bend,IN       51.2       80       EugeneSpringfield,OR       42.8         23       Montgomery,AL       51.1       82       Grand Rapids,MI       42.8         24       Sonta Rosa,CA       50.8       84       Augustar-Aiken,GASC       42.2         24       Itile Rock,AR       50.4       85       Boise City,ID       42.0         25       Little Rock,AR       50.1       87       Dutchess County,IN       41.2         26       AppletonOshkoh-Neend,WI       49.8       89       Kalamozoo-Battle Creek,MI       41.1         26       AppletonOshkoh-Neend,NI       49.5       91       Toledo,OH       40.7         27       Middlesser-Somerester-Hunterdon,NJ       49.5	15	AustinSan Marcos, IX	53.3	/4	Mobile,AL	43.9
17       Oklohoma Gry,OK       52.9       76       Salinas,CA       43.7         18       New Orleans,IA       52.3       77       Orlando,FL       43.5         20       MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI       52.0       79       RoleighDurhamChapel Hill,NC       43.1         20       MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI       51.2       80       FayetevilleSpringfield,OR       42.8         21       Tarcoma,WA       51.2       81       FrayetevilleSpringfield,OR       42.8         22       Tarcoma,WA       51.1       82       Grand Rapids,MI       42.8         23       Montgomery,AL       51.1       82       Grand Rapids,MI       42.8         24       Sonta Roso,CA       50.8       83       ClevelandLorainElyria,OH       42.2         25       Little Rock,AR       50.4       85       Joinson City,TNVA       41.2         26       Pritsburgh,PA       50.4       86       Joinson City,TNVA       41.2         20       Tulsa,OK       49.8       89       Kalamazoo-Battle Creek,MI       41.1         20       Tulsa,OK       49.6       90       Syracuse,NY       40.7         21       Tulsa,OK       49.9       94       Fort Wayne,	16	Nashville, IN	53.1	/5	AllentownBethlehemEaston,PA	43.7
18       New Orleans, I.A       52.3       77       Orlando, FL       43.5         9       Galveston-Texas City, TX       52.2       78       Spokane, WA       43.2         20       MilwoukeeWaukesha, WI       52.0       79       RaleighDurhamChapel Hill, NC       43.1         21       South Bend, IN       51.2       80       EugeneSpringfield, OR       42.8         23       Montgomery, AL       51.1       82       Grand Rapids, MI       42.8         24       Sonta Rosa, CA       50.8       83       Cleveland-LorainElyria, OH       42.3         25       Little Rock, AR       50.4       85       Boise City, ID       42.0         26       Pitsburgh, PA       50.4       86       Johnson City, TNVA       41.3         28       Ann Arbor, MI       50.1       87       Dutchess County, NY       41.2         20       Appleton-Oshkosh-Neendh, WI       49.8       89       Kalamazoo-Battle Creek, MI       41.1         30       Tulso, OK       49.8       89       Kalamazoo-Battle Creek, MI       41.1         31       SarginawBay City- Midland, MI       39.9       39.9       SaginawBay City- Midland, MI       39.9         32       Dar	17	Oklahoma City,OK	52.9	/6	Salinas,CA	43./
19         Galveston-Texas City, IX         52.2         78         Spokane, WA         43.2           20         MilwavkeeWaukee-Naukee-Naukee-Naukee-Waukee Waukee-WaukeeWaukee-Waukee-WaukeeWaukee-Waukee-Waukee-Waukee-Waukeew	18	New Orleans,LA	52.3	77	Orlando,FL	43.5
20         Milwaukee-Waukesha,WI         52.0         79         RoleighDurham-Chapel Hill,NC         43.1           21         South Bend,IN         51.2         81         FayettevilleSpringfield,OR         42.8           23         Montgomery,AL         51.1         82         Grand Rapids,MI         42.8           24         Santa Rosa,CA         50.8         83         Cleveland-Lorain-Elyria,OH         42.3           25         Little Rock,AR         50.4         85         Boise City,ID         42.0           26         Pittsburgh,PA         50.4         85         Boise City,ID         42.0           27         Corpus Christi,TX         50.4         86         Johnson City,TN-VA         41.3           28         Ann Arbor,MI         50.1         87         Dutchess County,NY         41.2           29         AppletonOshkosh-Neenah,WI         49.5         91         Toledo,OH         41.2           30         Tulsa,OK         49.8         89         Kalamazoo-Battle Creek,MI         41.1           31         ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton,PA         49.5         91         Toledo,OH         40.6           33         Kansas City,MOKS         49.4         92         Maimi,	19	GalvestonTexas City,TX	52.2	78	Spokane,WA	43.2
21       South Bend,IN       51.2       80       EugeneSpringdialeRogers,AR       42.8         22       Tacoma,WA       51.2       81       FoyettevilleSpringdialeRogers,AR       42.8         23       Montgomery,AL       51.1       82       Grand Rapids,MI       42.8         24       Sonta Rosa, CA       50.8       83       Cleveland-LorainRlyria,OH       42.3         25       Little Rock,AR       50.4       85       Boise City,ID       42.0         26       Pittsburgh,PA       50.4       85       Boise City,ID       41.2         28       Ann Arbor,MI       50.1       87       Dutchess County,NY       41.2         29       AppletonOshkoshNeenah,WI       49.9       88       CantonMassilon,OH       41.2         30       Tulsa,OK       49.8       89       KalamazooBattle Creek,MI       41.1         31       ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton,PA       49.6       90       Syracuse,NY       40.7         20       Tulsa,OK       49.4       92       MiadlesexSomersetHunterdon,NJ       49.5       91       Toledo,OH       40.6         33       Kansas City,MOKS       49.0       95       Santa Barbara,CA       39.2       36 <td>20</td> <td>MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI</td> <td>52.0</td> <td>79</td> <td>RaleighDurhamChapel Hill,NC</td> <td>43.1</td>	20	MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI	52.0	79	RaleighDurhamChapel Hill,NC	43.1
22         Tacoma,WA         51.2         81         FoyettevilleSpringdoleRogers,AR         42.8           23         Montgomery,AL         51.1         82         Grand Rapids,MI         42.8           24         Santa Rosa,CA         50.8         83         ClevelandLorainElyria,OH         42.3           25         Little Rock,AR         50.8         84         AugustaAiken,GASC         42.0           26         Pittsburgh,PA         50.4         85         Boise City,ID         42.0           27         Corpus Christi,TX         50.4         86         Johnson Gity,TN-V-VA         41.3           28         Ann Arbor,MI         50.1         87         Dutchess County,NY         41.2           29         Appleton-OshkoshNeenah,WI         49.9         88         CantonMassillon,OH         41.1           30         Tulsa,OK         49.8         89         KalamazooBattle Creek,MI         41.1           31         Scrainaro-Wilkes-BarreHazleton,PA         49.5         91         Toledo,OH         40.6           33         Kansas City,MOKS         49.4         92         Miami,FL         40.7           34         Des Moines,IA         49.2         93         Santa Bab	21	South Bend,IN	51.2	80	EugeneSpringfield,OR	42.8
23       Montgomery,AL       51.1       82       Grand Rapids,MI       42.8         24       Santa Rosa,CA       50.8       83       Cleveland-LorainElyria,OH       42.8         25       Little Rock,AR       50.8       84       Augusta-Aiken,GASC       42.2         26       Pittsburgh,PA       50.4       85       Boise City,ID       41.0         28       Ann Arbor,MI       50.1       87       Dutchess County,NY       41.2         29       AppletonOsshkoshNeenah,WI       49.9       88       CatnonMassilon,OH       41.1         30       Tutsa,OK       49.8       89       KalomazooBattle Creek,MI       41.1         31       ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton,PA       49.6       90       Syracuse,NY       40.7         31       Kansos City,MOKS       49.4       92       Miami,FL       40.5         34       Des Moines,IA       49.2       93       Soginaw-Bay City-Midland,MI       39.9         35       Orange county,CA       49.0       94       Fort Wayne,IN       39.2         37       Reno,NV       48.7       97       Fort Pierce,FL       38.8         38       Newark,NU       48.7       97       Fort Pie	22	Tacoma,WA	51.2	81	FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR	42.8
24       Santa Rosa, CA       50.8       83       ClevelandLorgina,-Elyria,OH       42.3         25       Little Rock,AR       50.8       84       AugustaAiken,GA-SC       42.0         26       Pittsburgh,PA       50.4       85       Boise City,ID       42.0         27       Corpus Christi,TX       50.4       86       Johnson City,TN-VA       41.3         28       Ann Arbor,MI       50.1       87       Dutchess County,NY       41.2         29       AppletonOshkoshNeenah,WI       49.9       88       CantonMassillon,OH       41.2         30       Tulsa,OK       49.8       89       KalamazaoBattle Creek,MI       41.1         31       Scranton-Wilkes-BarreHunterdon,NJ       49.5       91       Toledo,OH       40.6         34       Des Moines,IA       49.2       93       Saginaw-Bay City-Midland,MI       39.3         35       Fort Myers,FL       49.0       95       Sonta Barbara,CA       39.2         35       Pane,NV       48.7       97       Fort Wayne,IN       38.8         39       Provo-Orem,UT       48.5       98       YoungstowWaren,OH       38.1         41       HamilitonMididletown,OH       48.2       <	23	Montgomery,AL	51.1	82	Grand Rapids,MI	42.8
25       Little Rock, AR       50.8       84       AugustaAiken, GASC       42.0         26       Pittsburgh, PA       50.4       85       Boise City, ID       42.0         27       Corpus Christi, TX       50.4       86       Johnson City, TNVA       41.3         28       Ann Arbor, MI       50.1       87       Dutchess County, NY       41.2         29       AppletonOshkoshNeenah, WI       49.9       88       CantonMassillon, OH       41.2         20       Tulsa, OK       49.8       97       KalamazooBattle Creek, MI       41.1         31       ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton, PA       49.6       90       Syracuse, NY       40.7         21       MiddlesexSomerset-Hunterdon, NJ       49.5       91       Toledo, OH       40.6         32       Kansas City, MOKS       49.0       94       Fort Wayne, IN       39.3         33       Fort Myers, FL       49.0       95       Santa Barbara, CA       39.2         34       Des Moines, IA       48.7       97       Fort Mayne, IN       38.8         39       ProvoOrem, UT       48.5       98       YoungstownWarren, OH       38.5         41       Hadinanpolis, IN	24	Santa Rosa,CA	50.8	83	ClevelandLorainElyria,OH	42.3
26       Pittsburgh,PA       50.4       85       Boise City,ID       42.0         27       Corpus Christi,TX       50.4       86       Johnson City,TN-VA       41.3         28       Ann Arbor,MI       50.1       87       Dutchess County,NY       41.2         29       AppletonOshkoshNeenah,WI       49.9       88       CantonMassillon,OH       41.2         30       Tulsa,OK       49.8       89       Kalamazoo-Battle Creek,MI       41.1         31       ScrantonWilkes-BorreHazleton,PA       49.6       90       Syrcuse,NY       40.7         32       MiddlesexSomersetHunterdon,NJ       49.5       91       Toledo,OH       40.6         33       Kanasa City,MOKS       49.4       92       Miami,FL       40.5         34       Des Moines,IA       49.2       93       SaginawBay City- Midland,MI       39.3         35       Orange county,CA       49.0       94       Fort Wayne,IN       38.9         38       Newark,NJ       48.7       97       Fort Pierce,FL       38.8         39       ProvoOrem,UT       48.5       98       YoungstownWarne,OH       38.1         41       HamiltonMiddletown,OH       48.2       1	25	Little Rock, AR	50.8	84	AugustaAiken,GASC	42.2
27       Corpus Christi, TX       50.4       86       Johnson City, TNVA       41.3         28       Ann Arbor, MI       50.1       87       Dutchess County, NY       41.2         29       Appleton OshkoshNeenah, WI       49.9       88       CantonMassillon, OH       41.2         30       Tulsa, OK       89       KalamazooBattle Creek, MI       41.1         31       ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton, PA       49.6       90       Syracuse, NY       40.7         20       MiddlesexSomersetHunterdon, NJ       49.5       91       Toledo, OH       40.6         34       Des Moines, IA       49.2       93       SaginawBay City- Midland, MI       39.3         35       Orange county, CA       49.0       94       Fort Wayne, IN       39.3         36       Fort Myers, FL       49.0       95       Santa Barbara, CA       38.9         38       Newark, NJ       48.7       97       Fort Pierce, FL       38.8         40       VallejoFarifieldNapa, CA       48.4       99       Rochester, NY       38.1         41       HamiltonMiddletown, OH       48.2       100       UricaRome, NY       37.3         43       Lexington, KY       47.	26	Pittsburgh, PA	50.4	85	Boise City,ID	42.0
28         Ann Arbor,MI         50.1         87         Dutchess County,NY         41.2           29         AppletonOshkoshNeenah,WI         49.9         88         CantonMassillon,OH         41.2           29         AppletonOshkoshNeenah,WI         49.8         89         KalamazooBattle Creek,MI         41.1           31         ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton,PA         49.6         90         Syracuse,NY         40.7           32         Middlesex-SomersetHunterdon,NJ         49.5         91         Toledo,OH         40.6           34         Des Moines,IA         49.2         93         SaginawBay City- Midland,MI         39.9           35         Orange county,CA         49.0         94         Fort Wayne,IN         39.3           36         Fort Myers,FL         49.0         95         Santo Barbara,CA         39.2           37         Reno,NV         48.7         97         Fort Pierce,FL         38.8           39         Provo-Orem,UT         48.5         98         Youngstown-Warren,OH         38.5           41         HamiltonMiddletown,OH         48.2         100         Utica-Rome,NY         37.7           31         Lexington,KY         47.7         102	27	Corpus Christi,TX	50.4	86	Johnson City,TNVA	41.3
29         AppletonOshkoshNeenah,WI         49.9         88         CantonMassillon,OH         41.2           30         Tulsa,OK         49.8         89         KalamazooBattle Creek,MI         41.1           31         ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton,PA         49.6         90         Syracuse,NY         40.7           31         ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton,PA         49.2         93         SaginawBay City- Midland,MI         39.9           30         Fort Myers,FL         49.0         95         Santo Barbara,CA         39.2         38.9           31         Reno,NV         48.7         97         Fort Pierce,FL         38.8         39.9           31         HamiltonMiddledown,OH         48.2         100         UbicaRome,NY         38.1           32         Lexington,KY         47.7         102         GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Point,NC         36.3	28	Ann Arbor.MI	50.1	87	Dutchess County,NY	41.2
30       Tulsa,OK       49.8       89       KalamazooBattle Creek,Ml       41.1         31       ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton,PA       49.6       90       Syracuse,NY       40.7         32       MiddlesexSomersetHunterdon,NJ       49.5       91       Toledo,OH       40.6         32       MiddlesexSomersetHunterdon,NJ       49.5       91       Toledo,OH       40.6         34       Des Moines,IA       49.2       93       SaginawBay City- Midland,MI       39.9         35       Orange county,CA       49.0       94       Fort Myers,FL       39.2         37       Reno,NV       48.9       96       Lubbock,TX       38.9         38       Newark,NJ       48.7       97       Fort Myers,FL       38.8         39       ProvoOrem,UT       48.5       98       YoungstownWarren,OH       38.1         41       HamiltonMiddletown,OH       48.2       100       UticaRome,NY       37.7         42       BeaumontPort Arthur,TX       47.8       101       West Palm Beach,FL       37.3         43       Lexington,KY       47.3       104       Lancaster,PA       36.3         44       Indianopolis,IN       47.6       103 <td>29</td> <td>AppletonOshkoshNeengh.WI</td> <td>49.9</td> <td>88</td> <td>CantonMassillon.OH</td> <td>41.2</td>	29	AppletonOshkoshNeengh.WI	49.9	88	CantonMassillon.OH	41.2
StrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton,PA       49.6       90       Syracuse,NY       40.7         Middlesex-SomersetHunterdon,NJ       49.5       91       Toledo,OH       40.6         Kansas City,MOKS       49.4       92       Miami,FL       40.5         Des Moines,JA       49.2       93       SaginawBay City- Midland,MI       39.9         Stronge county,CA       49.0       94       Fort Wayne,IN       39.3         Fort Myers,FL       49.0       95       Santa Barbara,CA       39.2         Reno,NV       48.9       96       Lubbock,TX       38.9         ProvoOrem,UT       48.5       98       YoungstownWarren,OH       38.5         VallejoFairfieldNapa,CA       48.4       99       Rochester,NY       37.7         BeaumontPort Arthur,TX       47.8       101       West Polin Beach,FL       37.3         Lexington,KY       47.7       102       GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Point,NC       36.3         44       Indianapolis,IN       47.6       103       Modesto,CA       35.4         45       Akron,OH       47.3       104       Lancaster,PA       36.3         45       Akron,OH       47.3       104       Lancaster,PA       35.3	30	Tulsa OK	49.8	89	KalamazooBattle Creek MI	41 1
And Alexandroven Analysis (Analysis)       49.5       91       Toledo,OH       40.6         33       Kansas City,MOKS       49.4       92       Miami,FL       40.5         34       Des Moines,IA       49.2       93       SaginawBay City- Midland,MI       39.3         36       Fort Myers,FL       49.0       95       Santa Barbara,CA       39.2         36       Fort Myers,FL       49.0       95       Santa Barbara,CA       39.2         37       Reno,NV       48.9       96       Lubbock,TX       38.9         38       Newark,NJ       48.7       97       Fort Pierce,FL       38.8         40       vallejoFairfieldNapa,CA       48.4       99       Rochester,NY       38.1         41       HamiltonMiddletown,OH       48.2       100       Utica-Rome,NY       37.3         42       Beaumont-Port Arthur,TX       47.8       101       West Palm Beach,FL       37.3         43       Lexington,KY       47.7       102       GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Point,NC       36.4         44       Indianapolis,IN       47.6       103       Modesto,CA       36.3         45       Akron,OH       47.1       106       VisaliaTularePor	31	ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazletor	PA 49.6	90	Svracuse NY	40.7
1       Maanas City,MOKS       49.4       92       Miami,FL       40.5         34       Des Moines,IA       49.2       93       SaginawBay City- Midland,MI       39.9         35       Orange county,CA       49.0       94       Fort Wayne,IN       39.3         36       Fort Myers,FL       49.0       95       Santa Barbara,CA       39.2         36       Fort Myers,FL       49.0       95       Santa Barbara,CA       39.2         37       Reno,NV       48.9       96       Lubbock,TX       38.9         9       ProvoOrem,UT       48.5       98       YougstownWarren,OH       38.5         40       VallejoFairfieldNapa,CA       48.4       99       Rochester,NY       38.1         41       HamiltonMiddletown,OH       48.2       100       UticaRome,NY       37.7         42       BeaumontPort Arthur,TX       47.8       101       West Palm Beach,FL       37.3         44       Indinapolis,IN       47.6       103       Modesto,CA       36.3         45       Akron,OH       47.3       104       Lancaster,PA       36.3         46       Daytona Beach,FL       47.1       106       Visaliari-C-Cape May,NJ	32	MiddlesexSomersetHunterdon	NI 49.5	91	Toledo OH	40.6
Dis Konnes, IA       47.4       7.2       Multin, L       40.5         A Des Moines, IA       49.2       93       SaginawBay City- Midland, MI       39.3         Grange county, CA       49.0       94       Fort Wayne, IN       39.3         Grange county, CA       49.0       95       Santa Barbara, CA       39.2         Reno, NV       48.9       96       Lubbock, TX       38.9         Newark, NJ       48.7       97       Fort Pierce, FL       38.8         9       ProvoOrem, UT       48.5       98       YoungstownWarren, OH       38.5         40       VallejoFairfieldNapa, CA       48.4       99       Rochester, NY       38.1         41       HamiltonMiddletown, OH       48.2       100       UticaRome, NY       37.7         2       BeaumontPort Arthur, TX       47.8       101       West Palm Beach, FL       37.3         41       Indianapolis, IN       47.6       103       Modesto, CA       36.3         45       Akron, OH       47.3       104       Lancaster, PA       36.3         45       Akron, OH       47.1       106       VisaliaTularePorterville, CA       35.4         47       MonmouthOcean, NJ </td <td>33</td> <td>Kansas City MOKS</td> <td>49.4</td> <td>92</td> <td>Miami Fl</td> <td>40.5</td>	33	Kansas City MOKS	49.4	92	Miami Fl	40.5
34       Des Monies, IA       47.2       73       Sugnation-buy City- Mudula, Mi       37.3         35       Orange county, CA       49.0       95       Santa Barbara, CA       39.3         36       Fort Myers, FL       49.0       95       Santa Barbara, CA       39.3         37       Reno, NV       48.9       96       Lubbock, TX       38.9         38       Newark, NJ       48.7       97       Fort Pierce, FL       38.8         9       ProvoOrem, UT       48.5       98       YoungstownWarren, OH       38.1         41       HamiltonMiddletown, OH       48.2       100       UticaRome, NY       37.7         28       BeaumontPort Arthur, TX       47.8       101       West Palm Beach, FL       37.3         41       Indianapolis, IN       47.6       103       Modesto, CA       36.3         45       Akron, OH       47.3       104       Lancaster, PA       36.3         45       Akron, OH       47.1       106       VisaliaTularePorterville, CA       35.4         46       Daytona Beach, FL       47.0       107       AtlanticCape May, NJ       35.3         47       MonmouthOcean, NJ       47.1       106	34	Des Meines IA	40.0	02	Sagingw Bay City Midland MI	20.0
33       Ordinge county, CA       47.0       74       Torr Worke, N       37.3         36       Ford Myers, FL       49.0       95       Santa Barbara, CA       39.2         37       Reno, NV       48.9       96       Lubbock, TX       38.9         38       Newark, NJ       48.7       97       Fort Pierce, FL       38.8         39       ProvoOrem, UT       48.5       98       YoungstownWarren, OH       38.5         40       VallejoFairfieldNapa, CA       48.4       99       Rochester, NY       38.1         41       HamiltonMiddletown, OH       48.2       100       UticaRome, NY       37.3         42       BeaumontPort Arthur, TX       47.8       101       West Palm Beach, FL       37.3         43       Lexington, KY       47.7       102       GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Point, NC       36.3         44       Indianapolis, IN       47.6       103       Modesto, CA       36.3         45       Akron, OH       47.1       106       VisaliaTularePorterville, CA       35.4         46       Daytona Beach, FL       47.1       106       VisaliaTularePorterville, CA       35.4         48       Jacksonville, FL       <	25	Orango county CA	47.2	01	Fort Wayno IN	20.2
30       1011 Myets, I.L.       47.0       73       30110 Jourd, CA       37.2         7       Reno, NV       48.9       96       Lubbock, TX       38.9         38       Newark, NJ       48.7       97       Fort Pierce, FL       38.8         39       ProvoOrem, UT       48.5       98       YoungstownWarren, OH       38.5         40       VallejoFoirfieldNapa, CA       48.4       99       Rochester, NY       38.1         41       HamiltonMiddletown, OH       48.2       100       UticaRome, NY       37.7         43       Lexington, KY       47.8       101       West Palm Beach, FL       37.3         44       Indianapolis, IN       47.6       103       Modesto, CA       36.3         45       Akron, OH       47.3       104       Lancoster, PA       36.3         46       Daytona Beach, FL       47.1       106       VisaliaTulare-Porterville, CA       35.4         48       Jacksonville, FL       47.0       107       AtlanticCape May, NJ       35.3         49       BergenPassici, NJ       46.7       108       Binghamton, NY       35.2         50       DavenportMolineRock Island, IAIL       46.6       1	36	Fort Myore El	49.0	74 05	Santa Barbara CA	20.0
37       Nework,NJ       46.7       70       L0DD0k,TA       36.7         38       Newark,NJ       48.7       97       Fort Pierce,FL       38.8         39       ProvoOrem,UT       48.5       98       YoungstownWarren,OH       38.5         40       VallejoFairfieldNapa,CA       48.4       99       Rochester,NY       37.7         2       BeaumontPort Arthur,TX       47.8       101       West Palm Beach,FL       37.3         41       HamiltonMiddletown,OH       48.2       100       UticaRome,NY       37.7         2       BeaumontPort Arthur,TX       47.8       101       West Palm Beach,FL       37.3         43       Lexington,KY       47.7       102       GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Point,NC       36.4         44       Indianapolis,IN       47.6       103       Modesto,CA       36.3         45       Akron,OH       47.3       104       Lancaster,PA       36.3         46       Daytona Beach,FL       47.1       106       VisaliaTularePorterville,CA       35.4         47       MonmouthOcean,NJ       47.1       106       VisaliaTulare-Aporterville,CA       35.1         48       Jacksonville,FL       46.7 <td>27</td> <td>Pono NIV</td> <td>49.0</td> <td>7J 04</td> <td>Jubback TV</td> <td>37.Z</td>	27	Pono NIV	49.0	7J 04	Jubback TV	37.Z
30       Newdrk,NJ       46.7       77       For Protec,FL       36.0         39       ProvoOrem,UT       48.5       98       YoungstownWarren,OH       38.5         40       VallejoFaiffieldNapa,CA       48.4       99       Rochester,NY       38.1         41       HamiltonMiddletown,OH       48.2       100       UticaRome,NY       37.7         42       BeaumontPort Arthur,TX       47.8       101       West Palm Beach,FL       37.3         43       Lexington,KY       47.7       102       GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Point,NC       36.3         44       Indianapolis,IN       47.6       103       Modesto,CA       36.3         45       Akron,OH       47.3       104       Lancaster,PA       36.3         46       Daytona Beach,FL       47.2       105       Fort Lauderdale,FL       35.8         47       MonmouthOcean,NJ       47.1       106       VisaliaTularePorterville,CA       35.4         48       Jacksonville,FL       47.0       107       AtlanticCape May,NJ       35.3         49       BergenPassaic,NJ       46.7       108       Binghamton,NY       35.2         50       DavenportMolineRock Island,IAIL	3/ 20	Neuroni NI	40.7	90 07	LUDDOCK, IA	30.7 20 0
39       ProvoOrem, U1       48.5       98       FoungstownWarren, OH       38.5         40       VallejoFairfieldNapa, CA       48.4       99       Rochester, NY       38.1         41       HamiltonMiddletown, OH       48.2       100       UticaRome, NY       37.7         42       BeaumontPort Arthur, TX       47.8       101       West Palm Beach, FL       37.3         43       Lexington, KY       47.7       102       GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Point, NC       36.4         44       Indianapolis, IN       47.6       103       Modesto, CA       36.3         45       Akron, OH       47.3       104       Lancaster, PA       36.3         46       Daytona Beach, FL       47.2       105       Fort Lauderdale, FL       35.4         47       MonmouthOcean, NJ       47.1       106       VisaliaTularePorterville, CA       35.3         48       Jacksonville, FL       47.0       107       AtlanticCape May, NJ       35.3         49       BergenPassaic, NJ       46.7       108       Binghamton, NY       35.2         50       DavenportMolineRock Island, IAIL       46.6       109       Flint, MI       35.1         51	38		48./	97		38.8
40       VallejorainfieldNapa,CA       48.4       99       Kochester,NY       38.1         41       HamiltonMiddletown,OH       48.2       100       UticaRome,NY       37.7         42       BeaumontPort Arthur,TX       47.8       101       West Palm Beach,FL       37.3         43       Lexington,KY       47.7       102       GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Point,NC       36.4         44       Indianapolis,IN       47.6       103       Modesto,CA       36.3         45       Akron,OH       47.3       104       Lancaster,PA       36.3         46       Daytona Beach,FL       47.2       105       Fort Lauderdale,FL       35.8         47       MonmouthOcean,NJ       47.1       106       VisaliaTularePorterville,CA       35.4         48       Jacksonville,FL       47.0       107       AtlanticCape May,NJ       35.3         49       Bergen-Passaic,NJ       46.7       108       Binghamton,NY       35.2         50       DavenportMolineRock Island,IAIL       46.6       109       Flint,MI       35.1         51       Dayton-Springfield,OH       46.5       111       Reading,PA       34.3         52       ShreveportBossier Ci	39	ProvoOrem,UI	48.5	98	YoungstownWarren,OH	38.5
41       HamiltonMiddletown,OH       48.2       100       UficaRome,NY       37.7         42       BeaumontPort Arthur,TX       47.8       101       West Palm Beach,FL       37.3         43       Lexington,KY       47.7       102       GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Point,NC       36.4         44       Indianapolis,IN       47.6       103       Modesto,CA       36.3         45       Akron,OH       47.3       104       Lancaster,PA       36.3         46       Daytona Beach,FL       47.2       105       Fort Lauderdale,FL       35.8         47       MonmouthOcean,NJ       47.1       106       VisaliaTularePorterville,CA       35.4         48       Jacksonville,FL       47.0       107       AtlanticCape May,NJ       35.3         49       BergenPassaic,NJ       46.7       108       Binghamton,NY       35.2         50       DavenportMolineRock Island,IAIL       46.6       109       Flint,MI       35.1         51       DaytonSpringfield,OH       46.5       111       Reading,PA       34.3         52       ShreveportBossier City,LA       46.5       112       HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC       33.8         53       Sp	40	VallejoFairfieldNapa,CA	48.4	99	Kochester, NY	38.1
42       BeaumontFort Arthur, IX       47.8       101       West Paim Beach, FL       37.3         43       Lexington, KY       47.7       102       GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Point, NC       36.4         44       Indianapolis, IN       47.6       103       Modesto, CA       36.3         45       Akron, OH       47.3       104       Lancaster, PA       36.3         46       Daytona Beach, FL       47.2       105       Fort Lauderdale, FL       35.4         47       MonmouthOcean, NJ       47.1       106       VisaliaTularePorterville, CA       35.4         48       Jacksonville, FL       47.0       107       AtlanticCape May, NJ       35.3         49       BergenPassaic, NJ       46.7       108       Binghamton, NY       35.2         50       DavenportMolineRock Island, IAIL       46.6       109       Flint, MI       35.1         51       DaytonSpringfield, OH       46.5       111       Reading, PA       34.3         52       ShreveportBossier City, LA       46.5       111       Reading, PA       34.3         53       Springfield, MO       46.5       112       HickoryMorgantonLenoir, NC       33.8         54	41	HamiltonMiddletown,OH	48.2	100	UficaKome,NY	37.7
43       Lexington,KY       47.7       102       GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Point,NC       36.4         44       Indianapolis,IN       47.6       103       Modesto,CA       36.3         45       Akron,OH       47.3       104       Lancaster,PA       36.3         46       Daytona Beach,FL       47.2       105       Fort Lauderdale,FL       35.4         47       MonmouthOcean,NJ       47.1       106       VisaliaTularePorterville,CA       35.4         48       Jacksonville,FL       47.0       107       AtlanticCape May,NJ       35.3         49       BergenRassaic,NJ       46.7       108       Binghamton,NY       35.2         50       DavenportMolineRock Island,IAIL       46.6       109       Flint,MI       35.1         51       DaytonSpringfield,OH       46.5       111       Reading,PA       34.3         53       Springfield,MO       46.5       112       HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC       33.8         54       Tallahassee,FL       46.2       113       Erie,PA       33.3         55       SarasotaBradenton,FL       46.2       114       StocktonLodi,CA       32.7         SAMPLE AVERAGE       45.9       11	42	BeaumontPort Arthur, IX	47.8	101	West Palm Beach,FL	37.3
44       Indianapolis,IN       47.6       103       Modesto,CA       36.3         45       Akron,OH       47.3       104       Lancaster,PA       36.3         46       Daytona Beach,FL       47.2       105       Fort Lauderdale,FL       35.8         47       MonmouthOcean,NJ       47.1       106       VisaliaTularePorterville,CA       35.4         48       Jacksonville,FL       47.0       107       AtlanticCape May,NJ       35.3         49       BergenPassaic,NJ       46.7       108       Binghamton,NY       35.2         50       DavenportMolineRock Island,IAIL       46.6       109       Flint,MI       35.1         51       DaytonSpringfield,OH       46.6       110       Fresno,CA       34.4         52       ShreveportBossier City,LA       46.5       111       Reading,PA       34.3         53       Springfield,MO       46.5       112       HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC       33.8         54       Tallahassee,FL       46.2       113       Erie,PA       33.3         54       Tallahassee,FL       46.2       114       StocktonLodi,CA       32.7         55       SarasotaBradenton,FL       46.2	43	Lexington,KY	4/./	102	GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Point,NC	36.4
45       Akron,OH       47.3       104       Lancaster,PA       36.3         46       Daytona Beach,FL       47.2       105       Fort Lauderdale,FL       35.8         47       MonmouthOcean,NJ       47.1       106       VisaliaTularePorterville,CA       35.4         48       Jacksonville,FL       47.0       107       AtlanticCape May,NJ       35.3         49       BergenPassaic,NJ       46.7       108       Binghamton,NY       35.2         50       DavenportMolineRock Island,IAIL       46.6       109       Flint,MI       35.1         51       DaytonSpringfield,OH       46.5       111       Reading,PA       34.3         52       ShreveportBossier City,LA       46.5       112       HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC       33.8         53       Springfield,MO       46.2       113       Erie,PA       33.3         54       Tallahassee,FL       46.2       114       StocktonLodi,CA       32.7         54       SarasotaBradenton,FL       46.2       114       StocktonLodi,CA       32.7         55       SarasotaBradenton,FL       45.9       115       Bakersfield,CA       32.6         56       Baton Rouge,LA       4	44	Indianapolis,IN	47.6	103	Modesto,CA	36.3
46       Daytona Beach,FL       47.2       105       Fort Lauderdale,FL       35.8         47       MonmouthOcean,NJ       47.1       106       VisaliaTularePorterville,CA       35.4         48       Jacksonville,FL       47.0       107       AtlanticCape May,NJ       35.3         49       BergenPassaic,NJ       46.7       108       Binghamton,NY       35.2         50       DavenportMolineRock Island,IAIL       46.6       109       Flint,MI       35.1         51       DaytonSpringfield,OH       46.5       110       Fresno,CA       34.4         52       ShreveportBossier City,LA       46.5       111       Reading,PA       34.3         53       Springfield,MO       46.5       112       HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC       33.8         54       Tallahassee,FL       46.2       113       Erie,PA       33.3         55       SarasotaBradenton,FL       46.2       114       StocktonLodi,CA       32.7         SAMPLE AVERAGE       45.9       115       Bakersfield,CA       32.6         56       Baton Rouge,LA       45.9       116       York,PA       32.0         57       Huntsville,AL       45.9       117	45	Akron,OH	47.3	104	Lancaster,PA	36.3
47       MonmouthOcean,NJ       47.1       106       VisaliaTularePorterville,CA       35.4         48       Jacksonville,FL       47.0       107       AtlanticCape May,NJ       35.3         49       BergenPassaic,NJ       46.7       108       Binghamton,NY       35.2         50       DavenportMolineRock Island,IAIL       46.6       109       Flint,MI       35.1         51       DaytonSpringfield,OH       46.5       110       Fresno,CA       34.4         52       ShreveportBossier City,LA       46.5       111       Reading,PA       34.3         53       Springfield,MO       46.5       112       HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC       33.8         54       Tallahassee,FL       46.2       113       Erie,PA       33.3         55       SarasotaBradenton,FL       46.2       114       StocktonLodi,CA       32.7         SAMPLE AVERAGE       45.9       115       Bakersfield,CA       32.6         56       Baton Rouge,LA       45.9       116       York,PA       32.0         57       Huntsville,AL       45.9       117       Rockford,IL       30.7         58       TampaSt. Petersburg,FL       45.9       Trenton,NJ <td>46</td> <td>Daytona Beach,FL</td> <td>47.2</td> <td>105</td> <td>Fort Lauderdale,FL</td> <td>35.8</td>	46	Daytona Beach,FL	47.2	105	Fort Lauderdale,FL	35.8
48       Jacksonville,FL       47.0       107       AtlanticCape May,NJ       35.3         49       BergenPassaic,NJ       46.7       108       Binghamton,NY       35.2         50       DavenportMolineRock Island,IAIL       46.6       109       Flint,MI       35.1         51       DaytonSpringfield,OH       46.6       110       Fresno,CA       34.4         52       ShreveportBossier City,LA       46.5       111       Reading,PA       34.3         53       Springfield,MO       46.5       112       HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC       33.8         54       Tallahassee,FL       46.2       113       Erie,PA       33.3         55       SarasotaBradenton,FL       46.2       114       StocktonLodi,CA       32.7         SAMPLE AVERAGE       45.9       115       Bakersfield,CA       32.6         56       Baton Rouge,LA       45.9       116       York,PA       32.0         57       Huntsville,AL       45.9       117       Rockford,IL       30.7         58       TampaSt. Petersburg,FL       45.9       117       Rockford,IL       30.7         58       TampaSt. Petersburg,FL       45.9       117       Rockford,	47	MonmouthOcean,NJ	47.1	106	VisaliaTularePorterville,CA	35.4
49       BergenPassaic,NJ       46.7       108       Binghamton,NY       35.2         50       DavenportMolineRock Island,IAIL       46.6       109       Flint,MI       35.1         51       DaytonSpringfield,OH       46.6       110       Fresno,CA       34.4         52       ShreveportBossier City,LA       46.5       111       Reading,PA       34.3         53       Springfield,MO       46.5       112       HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC       33.8         54       Tallahassee,FL       46.2       113       Erie,PA       33.3         55       SarasotaBradenton,FL       46.2       114       StocktonLodi,CA       32.7         SAMPLE AVERAGE       45.9       115       Bakersfield,CA       32.6         56       Baton Rouge,LA       45.9       116       York,PA       32.0         57       Huntsville,AL       45.9       117       Rockford,IL       30.7         58       TampaSt. Petersburg,FL       45.9       117       Rockford,IL       30.7         58       TampaSt. Petersburg,FL       45.9       17       Rockford,IL       30.7         58       TampaSt. Petersburg,FL       45.9       17       Trenton,NJ </td <td>48</td> <td>Jacksonville,FL</td> <td>47.0</td> <td>107</td> <td>AtlanticCape May,NJ</td> <td>35.3</td>	48	Jacksonville,FL	47.0	107	AtlanticCape May,NJ	35.3
50       DavenportMolineRock Island,IAIL       46.6       109       Flint,MI       35.1         51       DaytonSpringfield,OH       46.6       110       Fresno,CA       34.4         52       ShreveportBossier City,LA       46.5       111       Reading,PA       34.3         53       Springfield,MO       46.5       112       HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC       33.8         54       Tallahassee,FL       46.2       113       Erie,PA       33.3         55       SarasotaBradenton,FL       46.2       114       StocktonLodi,CA       32.7         SAMPLE AVERAGE       45.9       115       Bakersfield,CA       32.6         56       Baton Rouge,LA       45.9       116       York,PA       32.0         57       Huntsville,AL       45.9       117       Rockford,IL       30.7         58       TampaSt. Petersburg,FL       45.9       117       Rockford,IL       30.7         58       TampaSt. Petersburg,FL       45.9       117       Rockford,IL       30.7         59       Vanture, CA       45.9       117       Rockford,IL       30.7	49	BergenPassaic,NJ	46.7	108	Binghamton,NY	35.2
51       DaytonSpringfield,OH       46.6       110       Fresno,CA       34.4         52       ShreveportBossier City,LA       46.5       111       Reading,PA       34.3         53       Springfield,MO       46.5       112       HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC       33.8         54       Tallahassee,FL       46.2       113       Erie,PA       33.3         55       SarasotaBradenton,FL       46.2       114       StocktonLodi,CA       32.7         SAMPLE AVERAGE       45.9       115       Bakersfield,CA       32.6         56       Baton Rouge,LA       45.9       116       York,PA       32.0         57       Huntsville,AL       45.9       117       Rockford,IL       30.7         58       TampaSt. Petersburg,FL       45.9       Trenton,NJ       na	50	DavenportMolineRock Island,I	AIL 46.6	109	Flint,MI	35.1
52         ShreveportBossier City,LA         46.5         111         Reading,PA         34.3           53         Springfield,MO         46.5         112         HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC         33.8           54         Tallahassee,FL         46.2         113         Erie,PA         33.3           55         SarasotaBradenton,FL         46.2         114         StocktonLodi,CA         32.7           SAMPLE AVERAGE         45.9         115         Bakersfield,CA         32.6           56         Baton Rouge,LA         45.9         116         York,PA         32.0           57         Huntsville,AL         45.9         117         Rockford,IL         30.7           58         TampaSt. Petersburg,FL         45.9         177         Rockford,IL         30.7           58         TampaSt. Petersburg,FL         45.9         178         Rockford,IL         30.7	51	DaytonSpringfield,OH	46.6	110	Fresno,CA	34.4
53         Springfield,MO         46.5         112         HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC         33.8           54         Tallahassee,FL         46.2         113         Erie,PA         33.3           55         SarasotaBradenton,FL         46.2         114         StocktonLodi,CA         32.7           SAMPLE AVERAGE         45.9         115         Bakersfield,CA         32.6           56         Baton Rouge,LA         45.9         116         York,PA         32.0           57         Huntsville,AL         45.9         117         Rockford,IL         30.7           58         TampaSt. Petersburg,FL         45.9         17         Rockford,IL         30.7           58         TampaSt. Petersburg,FL         45.9         117         Rockford,IL         30.7	52	ShreveportBossier City,LA	46.5	111	Reading,PA	34.3
54       Tallahassee,FL       46.2       113       Erie,PA       33.3         55       SarasotaBradenton,FL       46.2       114       StocktonLodi,CA       32.7         SAMPLE AVERAGE       45.9       115       Bakersfield,CA       32.6         56       Baton Rouge,LA       45.9       116       York,PA       32.0         57       Huntsville,AL       45.9       117       Rockford,IL       30.7         58       TampaSt. Petersburg,FL       45.9       Trenton,NJ       na	53	Springfield,MO	46.5	112	HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC	33.8
55         SarasotaBradenton,FL         46.2         114         StocktonLodi,CA         32.7           SAMPLE AVERAGE         45.9         115         Bakersfield,CA         32.6           56         Baton Rouge,LA         45.9         116         York,PA         32.0           57         Huntsville,AL         45.9         117         Rockford,IL         30.7           58         TampaSt. Petersburg,FL         45.9         Trenton,NJ         na	54	Tallahassee,FL	46.2	113	Erie,PA	33.3
SAMPLE AVERAGE         45.9         115         Bakersfield,CA         32.6           56         Baton Rouge,LA         45.9         116         York,PA         32.0           57         Huntsville,AL         45.9         117         Rockford,IL         30.7           58         TampaSt. Petersburg,FL         45.9         Trenton,NJ         na	55	SarasotaBradenton.FL	46.2	114	StocktonLodi,CA	32.7
56         Baton Rouge,LA         45.9         116         York,PA         32.0           57         Huntsville,AL         45.9         117         Rockford,IL         30.7           58         TampaSt. Petersburg,FL         45.9         Trenton,NJ         na		SAMPLE AVERAGE	45.9	115	Bakersfield,CA	32.6
57Huntsville,AL45.9117Rockford,IL30.758TampaSt. Petersburg,FL45.9Trenton,NJna59Varture CA45.9	56	Baton Rouge.LA	45.9	116	York.PA	32.0
58 TampaSt. Petersburg,FL 45.9 Trenton,NJ na	57	Huntsville Al	45.9	117	Rockford II	30.7
	58	TampaSt Petersburg Fl	45.9		Trenton NI	na
27 venuera. $42.8$	59	Ventura CA	45.8			110

Source: BEA

# Table 8. Change in Productivity (Output per Worker) 1994 to 2004

Rank	Metropolitan Area P	ercent Change	Rank	Metropolitan Area Percer	nt Change
1	San Jose,CA	123.4	60	BuffaloNiagara Fall,NY	16.6
2	Boise City,ID	80.2	61	Akron,OH	16.5
3	BoulderLongmont,CO	74.6	62	GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Point,NC	16.4
4	AustinSan Marcos,TX	72.0	63	Reno,NV	16.2
5	Jersey City,NJ	62.9	64	Modesto,CA	16.1
6	Colorado Springs,CO	40.3	65	Lincoln,NE	16.0
7	SeattleBellevueEverett,WA	38.2	66	Bakersfield,CA	15.6
8	RaleighDurhamChapel Hil,NC	37.6	67	Lubbock,TX	15.6
9	MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI	34.7	68	ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton,PA	15.3
10	Salt Lake City,UI	32.8	69	EugeneSpringfield,OR	15.2
11	Santa Rosa, CA	32.3	/0	Iulsa,OK	15.1
12	San Diego,CA	31.0	/ 1	IampaSt. Petersburg,FL	15.0
13	GreenvilleSpandhburgAnderson	1,3C 30.4	/ Z 70		13.0
14	California CA	30.0	73	Line,FA	14.9
15	Denver CO	29.0	74 75	Pitteburgh PA	14.7
17	Fort Worth TX	27.4	76	Reading PA	14.7
18	Newark NI	28.6	77	AppletonOshkoshNeenah WI	14.2
19	Huntsville Al	20.0	78	Binghamton NY	14.2
20	Trenton NJ	26.8	79	Jacksonville, Fl	14.0
21	MiddlesexSomersetHunterdon.N	11 26.5	80	DavenportMolineRock Island IAII	13.1
22	FavettevilleSprinadaleRogers,A	26.1	81	Pensacola,FL	13.0
23	Ventura,CA	25.9	82	LansingEast Lansing,MI	12.9
24	Indianapolis,IN	25.3	83	SaginawBay City- Midland,MI	12.8
25	Orange county,CA	25.3	84	Fayetteville,NC	12.2
26	Salinas,CA	24.7	85	Grand Rapids,MI	12.0
27	Springfield,MO	24.5	86	Mobile,AL	11.8
28	Montgomery,AL	24.0	87	Spokane,WA	11.6
29	Nashville,TN	23.8	88	Knoxville,TN	11.4
30	HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC	23.7	89	Rockford,IL	11.2
31	Johnson City,TNVA	23.6	90	PeoriaPekin,IL	11.0
32	Santa Barbara,CA	22.7	91	Des MoinesIA	11.0
33	West Palm Beach,FL	22.6	92	Fresno,CA	10.8
34	Birmingham,AL	22.6	93	LakelandWinter Haven,FL	10.8
35	ClevelandLorainElyria,OH	22.6	94	ShreveportBossier City,LA	10.6
36	lucson,AZ	22.6	95	VallejoFairfieldNapa,CA	10.6
3/	MonmouthOcean,NJ	21.9	96		10.1
38	MelbourneHitusvillePalm Bay,FL	21.9	97	KalamazooBame Creek,Mi	10.0
39	Dutchess county, in t	21.5	98 00	Fort Flerce, FL Stackton Ladi CA	9.7
40	Macon GA	21.4	77 100	Orlando El	7.J 0.5
41	SAMPLE AVERAGE	21.3	100		7.J 8.9
42	Fort Wayne IN	20.0	107	UticaRome NY	8.7
43	Toledo OH	20.0	103	RichmondPetersburg VA	8.4
44	Ann Arbor.MI	20.6	104	Baton RougeLA	8.2
45	ProvoOrem.UT	20.1	105	New OrleansLA	7.4
46	York,PA	19.7	106	YoungstownWarren,OH	6.8
47	Lexington,KY	19.0	107	San Luis ObispoCA	6.6
48	Jackson,MS	18.9	108	Oklahoma CityOK	6.4
49	Fort Lauderdale,FL	18.6	109	BeaumontPort ArthurTX	6.3
50	Fort Myers,FL	18.1	110	AtlanticCape MayNJ	6.1
51	Lancaster,PA	18.1	111	Syracuse,NY	5.8
52	CantonMassillon,OH	18.1	112	AugustaAiken,GASC	5.1
53	Madison,WI	18.0	113	CharlestonNorth CharlestonSC	4.8
54	VisaliaTularePorterville,CA	17.7	114	Daytona Beach,FL	4.7
55	BergenPassaic,NJ	17.2	115	GalvestonTexas CityTX	3.6
56	AllentownBethlehemEaston,PA	17.2	116	SarasotaBradenton,FL	2.8
57	South Bend,IN	16.8	117	Flint,MI	0.6
58	HamiltonMiddletown,OH	16.7	118	Corpus Christi,TX	-3.0
59	Iallahassee,FL	16.7			

### IV. Contributions of the Factors to Regional Growth

We applied another statistical procedure to determine the degree to which the eight factors are correlated with the four measures of regional economic growth. Although the four measures of growth are statistically related to various degrees, they are all used because each captures a different aspect of growth. The results are displayed in table 9. Since the factors have a mean close to zero and a standard deviation close to one, the values of the coefficients indicate the relative contributions of each of the factors to the respective output measures. Notice that many of the factors are statistically significant at the 95 percent confidence level.

The coefficients can be interpreted as the percentage change in a growth measure that is associated with a change in the factor score of one standard deviation. For instance, a one standard deviation change in the factor score related to a skilled workforce results in a 0.019 percentage point change in employment growth during the decade. The eight factors together explain almost two-thirds of the variation in employment, output, and productivity growth among the 118 metro areas and over 45 percent of the change in per capita income, as indicated by the adjusted R-squared shown in the table.

Factors	Employment	Output	Per Capita Income	Productivity
1. Skilled workforce	0.019	0.119	0.039	0.081
2. Urban assimilation	0.019	0.083		0.056
3. Racial inclusion	0.033	0.081		0.034
4. Legacy of place	-0.065	-0.077	-0.017	
5. Income equality	0.025	0.049	0.013	
6. Locational amenities			0.011	
7. Business dynamics	0.054	0.041		-0.022
8. Urban/metro structure		0.041	0.015	
Adjusted R-squared	0.66	0.64	0.46	0.62

#### **Table 9. Contribution of Factors to Growth Measures**

Note: The growth measures are expressed as percentage changes between 1994 and 2004, except for per capita income, which spans the time period 1993–2003. All coefficients are statistically significant at the 95 percent level.

The magnitude (in absolute terms) indicates the size of the effect of the factors on the growth measures. For instance, legacy of place has the greatest effect on employment growth, whereas skilled workforce has the greatest effect on output, per capita income, and productivity growth.

The factors affect the four measures of growth differently in many instances. Some factors do not have a statistically significant relationship at a 95 percent level with the growth measures, and these are excluded from the table. All factors affect the four growth measures in the same direction, with one exception—legacy of place. Metro areas with high legacy of place costs tend to have a declining industrial base, fewer business formations, and a lack of housing growth. The business dynamics factor has a positive effect on employment and output change but a negative effect on productivity growth. This suggests that employment may be growing in the less productive services sectors, as the highly productive manufacturing sector is shedding workers. Therefore, with positive signs on most of the coefficients, with a few exceptions, metropolitan areas that are higher on the lists (that is, have a higher score for the factors) have higher growth rates in employment, output, per capita income, and productivity.

### V. Rankings of Metropolitan Areas According to Factor Scores

The NEO metropolitan areas can be ranked against the other 118 areas included in the analysis according to how they score to each of the eight factors. The scores for each factor are based upon weights associated with the variables include in each factor and the actual values of the respective variables for each metropolitan area. The score does not have any intrinsic meaning, but it does provide a cardinal ranking (that is, one can tell the distance between metropolitan areas in the value of the factor). Using these factors, it is instructive to observe the metropolitan areas immediately around each of the four metropolitan areas in the NEO region.

#### **Skilled Workforce**

The ranking of the metropolitan areas according to the skilled workforce factor is displayed in table 10. Those metropolitan areas that rank the highest include Boulder-Longmont, Colorado; San Jose, California; Ann Arbor, Michigan; Madison, Wisconsin, and Austin, Texas, among others. The Cleveland-Lorain-Elyria PMSA is immediately below the cutoff between the top third and middle third of the metro areas. The Akron MSA is in the top half, while both the Canton-Massillon MSA and the Youngstown-Warren MSA are toward the bottom of the list. It is useful to see which areas are close to the four metro areas in rank. Cleveland is below Pittsburgh, Indianapolis, and Milwaukee with respect to a skilled workforce, but higher than Buffalo, Fort Worth, and Oklahoma City, to name a few of the larger areas. Youngstown-Warren is below Fort Wayne and slightly above Scranton, Pennsylvania, and Akron is comparable to Buffalo and Scranton. The significance of this ranking will become more apparent when we discuss the importance of a skilled workforce in explaining regional growth. For now, suffice it to say that those metropolitan areas with a more skilled workforce (and the attributes associated with this factor) have experienced greater growth rates, particularly with respect to per capita income.

#### Lessons from selected research: Skilled Workforce/ Business Dynamics

According to JunFu Zhang, the greatest asset in Silicon Valley is its ability to accommodate rapid structural changes by having a dynamic labor force. In a study, High Tech Start-ups and Industry Dynamics in Silicon Valley,<sup>8</sup> Zhang examines the rates of firm formation, growth, and mortality in Silicon Valley, compared to rates for other high-tech centers.

New firms are a dynamic force in the Valley and successfully coexist with the region's larger firms. According to Zhang's study, new firms established after 1990 created all the job growth between 1990 and 2001. These firms appear to attract a large amount of venture capital as well. Having the ability to attract venture capital five months faster than the national average (11.6 months), according to this study, gives the region an advantage over competing areas in the country. Established firms tend to spin off more startups in the Valley compared to other parts of the country. As firms mature, their major concern becomes sustainability, and the Valley's high operating costs force many to move out of the region. In fact, more establishments tend to move out of the Valley than move in. Still, those that move out remain close to the area. Having a "high velocity labor market" through which workers move frequently from one job to another helps the region to adapt to structural changes. Immigrants provide a large reserve of high quality engineers and scientists, which satisfies sudden surges in demand from particular industries.

#### Zhang offers the following recommendations:

- **1. Promote Technological Innovation and Entrepreneurship**. Since university research is a major source of innovation, strong support for research and development is needed. State government should continue its support, and federal funds should be secured through legislative delegation in Washington, D.C.
- **2. Encourage Firm Founding**. Instead of being preoccupied with retaining businesses, policymakers should focus on promoting start-ups. Offering favorable tax breaks, opening industrial parks, building high-tech incubators, and providing seed capital for commercialization of research are widely used policy approaches. Improving the quality of life is also crucial.
- **3. Look Beyond Silicon Valley.** The Valley is not an isolated region and is embedded in the state's economy. State policies should take into account connections between the Valley and the rest of the state economy.
- **4. Maintain a Dynamic Labor Pool.** The Valley's ability to quickly upgrade its labor force and skills relies on local universities and community colleges to help retool the labor force continuously. Employers need to recruit talent not only through local universities but also by hiring qualified immigrants. The immigrant pool can prove to be a major source of engineers and scientists to satisfy surges in demand in certain industries as well as source of innovation and entrepreneurship. In short, regions should keep the academic and business doors open to international talent.

<sup>8.</sup> Junfu Zhang, High-tech start-ups and industry dynamics in Silicon Valley, Public Policy Institute of California, 2003.

# Table 10. Rank of Sample Metropolitan Areas According to Skilled Workforce Score

Rank	Metro Areas	Score	Rank	Metro Areas	Score
1	BoulderLongmont,CO	4.092	60	Jacksonville,FL	-0.153
2	Madison,WI	2.671	61	Knoxville,TN	-0.179
3	MiddlesexSomersetHunterdon,NJ	2.326	62	Baton Rouge,LA	-0.186
4	RaleighDurhamChapel HillNC	2.297	63	AugustaAiken,GASC	-0.187
5	San Jose,CA	2.267	64	San Luis Obispo,CA	-0.205
6	Tallahassee,FL	2.115	65	Pensacola,FL	-0.209
7	Ann ArborMI	2.110	66	Salt Lake CityUT	-0.210
8	AustinSan MarcosTX	1.675	67	KalamazooBattle CreekMI	-0.216
9	SeattleBellevueEverett,WA	1.561	68	SaginawBay City- MidlandMl	-0.242
10	Trenton,NJ	1.490	69	Orlando,FL	-0.248
11	Oakland,CA	1.378	70	Fort LauderdaleFL	-0.251
12	Huntsville,AL	1.352	71	Springfield,MO	-0.266
13	Newark,NJ	1.287	72	Mobile,AL	-0.329
14	BergenPassaic,NJ	1.234	73	FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR	-0.366
15	Denver,CO	0.902	74	GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Point,NC	-0.367
16	Lincoln,NE	0.833	75	Tulsa,OK	-0.379
17	ProvoOrem,UT	0.821	76	Macon,GA	-0.379
18	Lubbock,TX	0.808	77	TampaSt. PetersburgFL	-0.387
19	RichmondPetersburg,VA	0.755	78	Reno,NV	-0.410
20	Jackson,MS	0.725	79	Toledo,OH	-0.412
21	Colorado SpringsCO	0.699	80	Grand RapidsMI	-0.422
22	MonmouthOcean,NJ	0.586	81	MelbourneTitusvillePalm BayFL	-0.423
23	CharlestonNorth CharlestonSC	0.558	82	DavenportMolineRock IslandIAIL	-0.522
24	Santa RosaCA	0.524	83	PeoriaPekin,IL	-0.550
25	Orange countyCA	0.508	84	Flint,MI	-0.581
26	San DiegoCA	0.506	85	South BendIN	-0.609
27	Birmingham,AL	0.501	86	Reading,PA	-0.630
28	Lexington, KY	0.485	87	SarasotaBradenton,FL	-0.633
29	Nashville,TN	0.482	88	Tacoma,WA	-0.635
30	Kansas CityMOKS	0.424	89	Lancaster, PA	-0.670
31	Montgomery,AL	0.38/	90	VallejoFairfieldNapa,CA	-0.690
32	Rochester,NY	0.345	91	Rocktord,IL	-0.697
33	Dutchess countyNY	0.342	92	Fort WaynelN	-0./39
34	LansingEast LansingMI	0.312	93	ShreveportBossier CityLA	-0./43
35	Binghamton,NY	0.310	94	UficaRome,NY	-0./55
36	Indianapolis,IN	0.299	95	Forf MyersFL	-0.//9
37	Boise CityID	0.285	96	GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson,SC	-0./82
38	Piffsburgh,PA	0.280	97	Salinas,CA	-0.803
39		0.256	98	tork,PA	-0.814
40		0.237	99	AtlanticCape MayNJ	-0.821
41		0.221	100		-0.8/3
42		0.213	101	AppletonOsnkosnNeenan, WI	-0.893
43		0.211	102	Midmi,FL	-0.947
44	Nontura CA	0.211	103	Frie PA	-0.937
45	Veriford,CA	0.170	104	Bagument Port ArthurTV	1 002
40	Santa BarbaraCA	0.100	105		1 0 4 2
47	Oklahoma CityOK	0.150	100	Scrapton Willion Parro Hazleton PA	1 0 4 5
40		0.100	107	France CA	1 002
47 50	Galvesten, Texas CityTY	0.081	100	Johnson CityTNL VA	1 1 / 0
51	Eart WorthTY	0.073	107	Equation Clighter-VA	1 1 7 2
52		0.001	110	Staditon Ladi CA	1 10
52 52	Little RockAR	0.037	112	CantonMassillon OH	-1.17
54		0.033	112	Eart PiorceEl	1 264
55	Akron OH	-0.017	11/	Hickony-Morganton-Lenoir NC	-1.204
56	Tucson A7	-0.019	115	Modesto CA	_1 800
57	West Palm BeachEl	-0.057	116	Bakersfield CA	-1 868
58	Svracuse NY	-0.037	117	LakelandWinter HavenFl	-1.000
59	AllentownBethlehemFaston PA	-0.102	118	Visalia-Tulare-Portenville CA	_1 888
57	AllemownDemichennLusion, A	-0.145	110	visund-foldre-fonerville,CA	-1.000

#### **Urban Assimilation**

Those metro areas with high scores on this factor are associated with higher employment and output growth but low per capita growth. These metro areas are typically home to recent immigrants who have started small businesses. While their numbers increase the population, their presence reduces the overall per capita income growth of the metro area. Table 11 shows the ranking of the metropolitan areas according to this factor. These variables loaded negatively, so we reversed the ranking so that a high rank indicates metro areas with a high percentage of Hispanics and Asians and low homeownership, to mention a few of the key variables associated with this factor. Miami, Jersey City, and San Jose are metro areas at the top of the list for this factor, while Tallahassee, Florida; Binghamton, New York; and Springfield, Missouri are at the bottom (table 11). All four of the NEO metro areas are in the lower half of the rankings. Cleveland is in the middle third of the distribution of scores, while the other three metro area are in the lower third.

#### **Lessons from Selected Research: Urban Assimilation**

Research has shown that, in most cases, immigrants have greatly benefited our nation and economy. For example:

- They generally have a high labor force participation rate,
- They have a high propensity to start new businesses and be self employed,
- They use relatively small amounts of public services and transfers, and
- They do not generally cause unemployment among native citizens.
- Recent history has shown that we must compete effectively with other developed countries for skilled labor. One implication is that we must take steps to assure the smooth assimilation of immigrants financially and culturally, while we simultaneously address complex security issues.

Based on research<sup>9</sup> completed by Chicago Fed economist Maude Toussaint-Comeau, immigrants are important contributors to the revitalization and economic development of many urban communities and neighborhoods. They account for much of the growth of minority small businesses. Policy initiatives should address business development needs of immigrant groups by promoting educational and entrepreneurial training, providing assistance with business development plans, language training, financial literacy, and providing affordable housing near the concentration of ethnic businesses.

<sup>9.</sup> Maude Toussaint-Comeau, Self-employed Immigrants: An Analysis of Recent Data, Chicago Fed Letter April 2005.

### Table 11. Rank of Sample Metropolitan Areas According to Urban Assimilation Score

11         Micrai,FL         4.442         60         South BendIN         -0.312           2         Jersey CityNU         4.280         61         Fort BreceFL         -0.319           3         San JoseCA         2.855         62         Rolleight-Durhom-Chapel HillNC         -0.322           5         Solinas, CA         2.171         64         Lencaster,PA         -0.338           6         Oxidiand,CA         2.093         65         Tolesdo,OH         -0.348           7         Vollejo-Foirfield-Napo,CA         1.894         66         Augusta-Jien,GA-SC         -0.319           8         Bergen-Passaic,NU         1.643         67         Clevelendia-Lorain-Elyrio,OH         -0.432           9         Sockhon-Lodi,CA         1.399         70         Sarcasta-Brodenton,FL         -0.433           11         Fort LauderdoleFL         1.391         71         Boiten KougeLA         -0.441           13         Koolen,CA         1.291         73         Boiten KougeLA         -0.441           14         Sarcia BrobarcA         0.628         77         Flort,ML         -0.441           15         Sarcia BrobarcA         0.628         77         Flort,ML         -0.442	Rank	Metro Areas	Score	Rank	Metro Areas	<b>Sc</b> ore
2         Jersey CityNJ         4.280         61         Fort PierceFL         -0.310           3         San JoseCA         2.855         62         Roleigin-Durhom-Chopel HillNC         -0.320           4         Orange CountyCA         2.234         63         Fort MyereFL         -0.338           6         Oakland,CA         2.093         65         Toledo,OH         -0.348           7         Oleveland-Lorain-Elyria,OH         -0.414         -0.348           8         Bergen-Resaic,NA         1.439         64         August-Allen,GA         -0.422           10         Venturo,CA         1.439         64         York,PA         -0.423           11         Fort LouderdolFL         1.339         70         Sarcasota-Bradenko,HM         -0.431           13         Vasion-Tulerae-Portervile,CA         1.271         72         Botare Kupla         -0.442           14         Modelso,CA         1.133         74         Buffelo-Miser -Noline-Rock Island,IA-IL         -0.441           15         Foreno,A         1.133         74         Buffelo-Miser -Noline-Rock Island,IA-IL         -0.441           16         Newark,Nu         1.133         74         Buffelo-Ning,FA         -0.474	1	Miami,FL	4.642	60	South BendIN	-0.312
3         San Jose CA         2.855         62         RoleighDurham-Chapel HillNC         0.322           5         Solinas, CA         2.171         64         Loncaster, PA         0.332           6         Oakland, CA         2.093         65         Toledo, OH         -0.338           7         VallejoFairifield-Napa, CA         1.894         66         AugustoAiken, GASC         -0.381           8         BergenPassaic,NJ         1.643         67         Ockendin-Lorain-Elynia,OH         -0.442           9         Ventura, CA         1.439         69         AppletonOshkoshNeench,WI         -0.443           10         Ventura, CA         1.439         71         DavenportMolineRock Island,IAIL         -0.441           11         ValiezeRoterville,CA         1.191         73         Bolisc ch/D         -0.450           12         Modesto, CA         1.191         73         Bolisc ch/D         -0.454           14         San Diego-CA         1.133         74         Bedria, Nagara FallshY         -0.464           14         Santa Borbaro CA         0.628         78         Fint,MI         -0.472           14         Santa Borbaro CA         0.628         78	2	Jersey CityNJ	4.280	61	Fort PierceFL	-0.319
4         Orange CountyCA         2.234         63         Fort MyersFL         0.338           5         Salins,GA         2.171         64         Lancster,PA         0.338           6         Oakland,CA         2.093         65         Toledo,OH         0.348           7         Malleon-Fairfield-Napa,CA         1.894         66         Auguton-Alken,GA-SC         0.381           8         Bergen-Passaic,NJ         1.643         67         Cleveland-Lacain-Elyria,OH         0.412           10         Variture,CA         1.439         69         Appleton-Orthosin-Neanch,WI         -0.433           11         Fort LauderdoleFL         1.339         70         Sarasota-Bradenton,FL         -0.434           12         Modesta,CA         1.191         73         Bote Grup         -0.442           13         Yasila-Nicker-Namersel-Hunterdon,NU         1.037         76         Lubbock,TX         -0.472           14         Terrano,N         0.843         77         Readong,PA         -0.474           15         Sarat BarbaroZA         0.628         78         Flint,MI         -0.474           15         Sarat BarbaroZA         0.628         78         FlointA         -0.491	3	San JoseCA	2.855	62	RaleiahDurhamChapel HillNC	-0.320
5         Solinas CA         2.171         64         Lancaster,PA         0.0348           7         Valleja-Fairfield-Napa,CA         1.894         66         Augusta-Aiken, GA-SC         0.338           7         Valleja-Fairfield-Napa,CA         1.849         67         Cleveland-Lorain-Elyrio,OH         0.414           9         Staction-Lodi,CA         1.439         68         Appleton-OshkoshNeenah,WI         0.433           10         Vertura,CA         1.293         71         Davenport-Moline-Rock Island,IAIL         0.443           11         Visalia-Tulare-Porterville,CA         1.291         72         Bota Kogusta         0.4457           12         San DiegoCA         1.191         73         Boise Crybin-Niogara FallshY         0.4461           14         San DiegoCA         1.191         73         Boise Crybin-Niogara FallshY         0.4461           15         Fresno,CA         1.124         75         Lincoln,NE         0.4462           16         Newark,NJ         0.428         79         Peoria-Pakin,IL         0.472           16         Ternton,NI         0.6428         79         Peoria-Pakin,IL         0.493           17         Cradando,FL         0.557         80 <td>4</td> <td>Orange CountyCA</td> <td>2.234</td> <td>63</td> <td>Fort MyersFL</td> <td>-0.322</td>	4	Orange CountyCA	2.234	63	Fort MyersFL	-0.322
6         Oakland,CA         2.093         65         Toledo,OH         0.381           8         Bergen-Passaic,NJ         1.643         67         Cleveland-Lorain-Elyria,OH         0.414           9         Stockton-Lodi,CA         1.549         68         York,PA         0.422           10         Ventra,CA         1.439         69         Appleton-Oshkosh-Neenah,WI         -0.433           11         Fort LauderdoleFL         1.339         70         Sarasola-Brademion,FL         -0.436           12         Ventra,CA         1.293         71         Davenport-Moline-Acki kland,IAIL         -0.446           13         Visalia-Tulare-Porterville,CA         1.293         71         Bota RougeLA         -0.451           14         Visalia-Tulare-Porterville,CA         1.133         74         Buffolo-Niagara FallsNY         -0.466           15         Fresno,CA         0.648         78         Flint,M         -0.474           15         Santo BarbaraCA         0.628         78         Flint,M         -0.474           16         Navari,N         0.543         81         Hurtsville,AL         -0.433           12         Carpus ChristTX         0.568         80         Melbourne-Tiusvill	5	Salinas,CA	2.171	64	Lancaster,PA	-0.338
7         VallejoFariheld-Napa,CA         1.894         66         AugustoAiken GA-SC         -0.381           8         BergenPassaic,NJ         1.643         67         Clereland-Lorain-Elyria,OH         -0.414           9         StocktonLodi,CA         1.439         69         AppletonOshkoshNeenah,WI         -0.432           10         Ventura,CA         1.439         69         AppletonOshkoshNeenah,WI         -0.432           11         VisaliaTulare-Porterville,CA         1.221         72         Boton RougeLA         -0.434           12         Modesto,CA         1.191         73         Boise cityID         -0.464           14         San DiegoCA         1.191         73         Boise cityID         -0.464           16         Newark,NJ         1.124         75         Lincoln,NE         -0.472           16         Middlese-Someraet-Hunterdon,NJ         0.848         77         Reading,PA         -0.472           17         Santa BorbaroCA         0.628         79         PeoriaPekin,IL         -0.472           18         Firstin,MI         0.543         84         Hutsville,AL         -0.502           12         Corpus ChristiTX         0.564         81	6	Oakland,CA	2.093	65	Toledo,OH	-0.348
8         Bergen-Passici,NJ         1.643         67         Cleveland-Lorain-Elyria,OH         0.414           9         Stockton-Lodi,CA         1.549         68         York,PA         0.423           10         Fort LauderdaleFL         1.339         70         Sarasota-Bradenton,FL         0.433           11         Fort LauderdaleFL         1.339         70         Sarasota-Bradenton,FL         0.436           13         Visalia-Tulare-Porterville,CA         1.231         72         Baton RougeLA         0.437           14         Visalia-Tulare-Porterville,CA         1.231         74         Botfolo-Ningara FallsNY         -0.466           15         Fresno,CA         1.133         74         Buffolo-Ningara FallsNY         -0.466           16         Newark,NJ         1.037         76         Lubbock,TX         -0.472           16         Narino-Sin MarcoaTX         0.628         78         Finin,MI         -0.471           11         Orlando,FL         0.598         80         Melbourne-Titusville,-Ralm BayFL         -0.493           2         Corpus ChristTX         0.567         82         Oktorbon         -0.512           2         Galveston-TexasTX         0.551         83	7	VallejoFairfieldNapa,CA	1.894	66	AugustaAiken,GASC	-0.381
9         Stockton-Lodi, CA         1.549         68         York, PA         0.422           10         Venturo, CA         1.439         69         Appleton-Ochicosh-Neench, WI         0.433           11         Fort LauderdoleFL         1.339         70         Sarasota-Bradenton, FL         0.4436           12         Modesto, CA         1.293         71         Davenport-Moline-Neench, WI         0.443           13         San DiegoCA         1.191         73         Boise ch/ID         -0.456           14         Santo EngoCA         1.133         74         Bifdon-Niagara FollsNY         -0.466           15         Fresno, CA         1.124         75         Lincoln, NE         -0.472           16         Madinex-Son MarcoA         0.628         79         Reading, PA         -0.473           17         Orlando, FL         0.598         80         Melbourne-Titus/IIIPalm BayFL         -0.493           22         Corpus ChristITX         0.567         82         Oklahoma ChyOK         -0.502           23         Galvaston-TexasTX         0.567         82         Oklahoma ChyOK         -0.512           24         Derver,CO         0.551         83         An ArborMI         <	8	BergenPassaic,NJ	1.643	67	ClevelandLorainElyria,OH	-0.414
10         Venturo, CA         1.439         69         AppletonOshkobnNeench, WI         -0.433           11         Fort LauderdaleFL         1.339         70         Saraston-Brademon, FL         -0.441           12         Modeslo, CA         1.293         71         DavenportMolineRock Island, IAIL         -0.441           13         Visaliac-TularePorterville, CA         1.211         72         Baton RougeLA         -0.457           14         San DiegoCA         1.133         74         BuffaloNiagara FollsNY         -0.466           15         Fresno, CA         1.133         74         BuffaloNiagara FollsNY         -0.466           16         Newark, NJ         1.037         76         Lubbock, TX         -0.472           16         Tenton, NJ         0.843         78         Roling, PA         -0.474           10         Orlando, FL         0.598         80         MelbourneFitusvillePalm BayFL         -0.493           12         Carpus ChristITX         0.566         81         Huntsville, AL         -0.502           12         GelvestonTexcesTX         0.543         88         Rockester, NY         -0.512           12         Sarathe RosaCA         0.292         <	9	StocktonLodi,CA	1.549	68	York,PA	-0.422
11         Fort LauderdaleFL         1.39         70         Sarasota-Bradenon,FL         0.436           11         Visalia-TularePorterville,CA         1.291         71         DavesportMolineRock Island,IAIL         0.441           13         Visalia-TularePorterville,CA         1.251         72         Baton RougeLA         0.457           14         San DiegoCA         1.191         73         Boile cit/D         0.460           15         Fresno,CA         1.133         The Incoln,NE         0.466           16         Newark,NJ         1.124         75         Lincoln,NE         0.474           17         Santo BarbaracA         0.628         77         Reading,PA         0.474           18         Ternton,NJ         0.843         77         Reading,PA         0.474           10         Ando,FL         0.586         80         Melbourne-Titusville-Ralm BayFL         0.493           20         Carpus ChristiTX         0.567         82         Okladoma CityOK         0.502           21         Galveston-TexcaTX         0.543         84         Rachester,NY         0.512           25         Setthe-Bellevue-Everett,WA         0.342         Stronton-Wilkes-Barre-Hazleton,PA         0.	10	Ventura,CA	1.439	69	AppletonOshkoshNeenah,WI	-0.433
12         Modesto, CA         1.293         71         Doverport-MolineRock Island, IA-IL         0.441           13         Visaliar-Tularer-Porterville, CA         1.251         72         Baton RougeLA         0.4461           14         San DiegoCA         1.191         73         Boise ciryID         0.4460           15         Fresno, CA         1.133         74         BuffaloNiagara FallsNY         0.4461           16         Newark, NJ         1.124         75         Linclon, NI         0.4472           17         Fonton, NJ         0.843         77         Reding, PA         0.4474           17         Austin-San Marcos IX         0.628         78         Finit, MI         -0.474           12         Austin-San Marcos IX         0.567         82         Oklahoma ChyOK         -0.502           23         Corpus ChristiTX         0.568         81         Huntsville, AL         -0.502           24         Derver, CO         0.551         83         Ann ArborMI         -0.513           25         Fort WorhTX         0.543         82         Scranton-Wilkes-Barre-Hazleton, PA         -0.545           26         Bators Ried, CA         0.292         89         Akran, OH	11	Fort LauderdaleFL	1.339	70	SarasotaBradenton,FL	-0.436
13         Visalia-Tulare-Porterville,CA         1,251         72         Baton RougeLA         0.457           14         San DiegoCA         1,191         73         Boise city/D         -0.460           16         Newark,NJ         1,124         75         Lincoln,NE         -0.466           16         Newark,NJ         1,133         74         BuffaloNiagara FallsNY         -0.464           16         Newark,NJ         1,037         76         Lubbock,TX         -0.472           17         Frenton,NJ         0.843         77         Reading,PA         -0.474           18         Trenton,NJ         0.843         77         Reading,PA         -0.472           18         Trenton,NJ         0.843         77         Reading,PA         -0.473           20         Corpus ChristTX         0.568         80         Melbourne-Titusville-Palm BayFL         -0.493           21         Orlendo,FL         0.5567         82         Oklahoma CityOK         -0.502           23         Galveston-TexasTX         0.567         82         Oklahoma CityOK         -0.532           24         Botens Eallewe,CO         0.551         83         Ann ArborMI         -0.532	12	Modesto,CA	1.293	71	DavenportMolineRock Island, IAIL	-0.441
14       Son DiegoCA       1.191       73       Boise cit/D       0.460         15       Fresno,CA       1.133       74       BuffaloNiagare FallsNY       -0.466         16       Newark,NJ       1.124       75       Lincoln,NE       -0.466         17       MiddlesexSomerset-Hunterdon,NJ       0.843       77       Reading,PA       -0.474         19       Santa BarbarocA       0.628       78       Flint,MI       -0.477         10       Austin-San MarcosTX       0.628       78       Flint,MI       -0.474         20       Galvestn-istinX       0.586       81       Huntsville,AL       -0.493         21       Orlando,FL       0.598       80       Melbourne-Titusville-Alum BayFL       -0.493         22       Galvestn-istinX       0.561       83       Ann ArborML       -0.502         23       Galvestn-istinX       0.541       85       Birminghom,AL       -0.537         24       Benerskiel,CA       0.479       86       Des MoinesIA       -0.537         25       Santa RosaCA       0.228       90       Homithon-Middletown,OH       -0.624         25       Misouke-Waukesha,WI       0.312       93       Pritsburgh,PA <td>13</td> <td>VisaliaTularePorterville,CA</td> <td>1.251</td> <td>72</td> <td>Baton RougeLA</td> <td>-0.457</td>	13	VisaliaTularePorterville,CA	1.251	72	Baton RougeLA	-0.457
15         Fresso, ČA         1,133         74         Buffalo-Niagara FallsNY         -0.466           16         Newark,NJ         1,124         75         Lincoln,NE         -0.472           17         Frenton,NJ         0,843         77         Reading,PA         -0.472           18         Trenton,NJ         0,843         77         Reading,PA         -0.474           18         Trenton,NJ         0,843         77         Reading,PA         -0.474           10         Orlando,FL         0.598         80         Melbourne-Titusville-Palkin,IL         -0.493           20         Carjus ChristiTX         0.566         81         Huntsville,AL         -0.509           21         Galveston-TexasTX         0.567         82         Oklahoma CityOK         -0.518           22         Settile-Bellevue-Everett,WA         0.543         84         Rochester,NY         -0.512           25         Fort WorthTX         0.543         88         Lexington,KY         -0.532           26         Settile-Everett,WA         0.543         88         Lexington,KY         -0.533           30         Sonta RosaCA         0.292         91         Arcon,OH         -0.647	14	San DiegoCA	1.191	73	Boise cityID	-0.460
16       Nework,NJ       1.124       75       Lincoln,NE       0.443         17       Middlesex-Somerset-Hunterdon,NJ       1.037       76       Lubbock,TX       0.474         18       Trenton,NJ       0.643       77       Reading,PA       0.474         19       Santa BarbaraCA       0.628       78       Flint,MI       0.474         10       Orlando,FL       0.588       80       Melbourne-Titusville-Ralm BayFL       0.491         21       Orlando,FL       0.557       82       Oklahoma CityOK       0.508         22       Galveston-TexasTX       0.567       82       Oklahoma CityOK       0.508         23       Galveston-TexasTX       0.567       82       Oklahoma CityOK       0.508         24       Denver,CO       0.551       83       Ann ArborMI       0.502         25       Fort WorhTX       0.541       85       Birmingham,AL       0.537         26       Seattle-Bellewue-Everett,WA       0.541       85       Birmingham,AL       0.537         27       Bakersfield,CA       0.479       86       Des MoinesIA       0.537         28       Foyetteville,NC       0.342       87       Scranton-Wilkes-BarreHazleton,PA </td <td>15</td> <td>Fresno,CA</td> <td>1.133</td> <td>74</td> <td>BuffaloNiagara FallsNY</td> <td>-0.466</td>	15	Fresno,CA	1.133	74	BuffaloNiagara FallsNY	-0.466
17       Middleser-Somerset-Hunterdon,NJ       1.037       7.6       Lubbock,TX       -0.472         18       Trenton,NJ       0.843       77       Reading,PA       -0.474         19       Sonta BarbaraCA       0.628       78       Flint,MI       -0.477         10       Austin-San MarcosTX       0.628       79       Peoria-Pskin,IL       -0.493         20       Corpus ChristIX       0.586       81       Hutsville,AL       -0.502         21       Galveston-TexasTX       0.567       82       Oklohoma CityOK       -0.508         22       Garuston-TexasTX       0.543       84       Rochester,NY       -0.512         25       Fort WorthTX       0.543       84       Rochester,NY       -0.512         26       Sattle-Bellevue-Everett,WA       0.541       85       Birmingham,AL       -0.532         26       Sattle-Bellevue-Everett,WA       0.342       87       Saraton-Wilkes-BarreHazleton,PA       -0.545         27       Bakersfield,CA       0.479       86       Des MoinesIA       -0.533         28       Foryetteville,NC       0.318       81       Lexington,KY       -0.553         29       Tanon,AVA       0.202       91	16	Newark,NJ	1.124	75	Lincoln,NE	-0.466
18         Trenton,NJ         0.843         77         Reading,PA         0.477           19         Santa BarbaraCA         0.628         78         Flint,MI         -0.477           10         Orlando,FL         0.598         80         MelbourneThusvillePalm BayFL         -0.491           21         Orlando,FL         0.598         80         MelbourneThusvillePalm BayFL         -0.492           22         Corpus ChristiTX         0.567         82         Oklohoma CityOK         -0.502           23         GalvestonTexasTX         0.541         85         Birmingham,AL         -0.532           24         Denver,CO         0.551         83         Ann ArborMI         -0.532           25         Fort WorthTX         0.543         84         Rochester,NY         -0.543           25         Bakersfield,CA         0.479         86         Des MoinesIA         -0.533           26         Santa RosaCA         0.292         89         Akron,OH         -0.643           21         West PalmFL         0.238         90         HomitonMiddletown,OH         -0.612           21         Taccom,AZ         0.194         92         Larassing-AE         -0.643	17	MiddlesexSomersetHunterdon,NJ	1.037	76	Lubbock.TX	-0.472
19       Santa BarbaraCA       0.428       78       Flint,M <sup>T</sup> -0.477         20       Austin-San MarcosTX       0.628       79       PeoriaRein,IL       -0.491         21       Orlando,FL       0.598       80       MelbourneTitusvillePalm BayFL       -0.493         22       Corpus ChristITX       0.567       82       Oklahoma CityOK       -0.502         23       GalvestonTexasTX       0.567       82       Oklahoma CityOK       -0.502         24       Denver,CO       0.551       83       Ann ArborMI       -0.502         25       Fort WorthTX       0.541       85       Birmingham,AL       -0.512         26       SeattleBellevueEverett,WA       0.541       85       Birmingham,AL       -0.533         27       Bakersfield,CA       0.479       86       Des MoinesIA       -0.545         27       Bakersfield,CA       0.318       88       Lexington,YY       -0.553         20       Santa RosaCA       0.292       91       ProvaOrem,UT       -0.624         21       West PalmFL       0.132       93       PitsburghPA       -0.635         21       West PalmFL       0.131       94       Knooville,TN	18	Trenton.NJ	0.843	77	Readina,PA	-0.474
20         AustinSan MarcosTX         0.428         79         PeoriaPekin,IL         -0.491           21         Orlando,FL         0.598         80         MelbourneTitsville-Palm BayFL         -0.493           23         GalvestonTexasTX         0.567         82         Oklahoma CityOK         -0.508           24         Denver, CO         0.551         83         Ann ArborMI         -0.509           26         Fort WorthTX         0.543         84         Rochester,NY         -0.512           26         SeattleBellevueEverett,WA         0.541         85         Birmingham,AL         -0.532           27         Bakersfield,CA         0.479         86         Des MoinesIA         -0.533           28         Fayetteville,NC         0.342         87         ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton,PA         -0.545           29         Reno,NV         0.318         88         Lexington,KY         -0.513           30         Santa RosaCA         0.292         89         Akron,OH         -0.627           31         Taccona,WA         0.202         91         Provo-Orem,UT         -0.635           31         Taccona,VA         0.202         91         Provo-Orem,UT         -0.6	19	Santa BarbaraCA	0.628	78	Flint,MI	-0.477
21         Orlando,FL         0.598         80         MelbourneTitusvillePalm BayFL         -0.493           22         Corpus ChrisiTX         0.567         82         Oklahoma CityOK         -0.502           32         GalvestonTexasTX         0.567         82         Oklahoma CityOK         -0.503           32         Fort WorthTX         0.541         83         Ann ArborMI         -0.512           32         Fort WorthTX         0.541         85         Birmingham,AL         -0.537           32         FortHer-BellevueEverett,WA         0.541         85         Birmingham,AL         -0.532           33         Santa RoseCA         0.342         87         ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton,PA         -0.545           34         Ropetserifield,CA         0.342         87         Scranton-Wilkes-Barre-Hazleton,PA         -0.545           35         Rogetserifield,CA         0.292         89         Akron,OH         -0.552           30         Santa RoseCA         0.292         91         ProvoOrem,UT         -0.624           31         Touson,AZ         0.194         92         Lansing-East LansingMI         -0.635           31         Touson,AZ         0.194         92         <	20	AustinSan MarcosTX	0.628	79	PeoriaPekin.IL	-0.491
22         Corpus ChristiTX         0.586         81         Huntsville,AL         -0.502           23         GalvestonTexastX         0.567         82         Oklahoma CityOK         -0.508           24         Denver,CO         0.551         83         Ann ArborMI         -0.502           26         SeattleBellevueEverett,WA         0.541         85         Birmingham,AL         -0.532           27         Bakersfield,CA         0.479         86         Des MoinesIA         -0.533           28         Fayetteville,NC         0.342         87         ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton,PA         -0.543           29         Reno,NV         0.318         88         Lexington,KY         -0.533           30         Santa RosaCA         0.292         89         Akron,OH         -0.644           31         Tucson,AZ         0.194         92         Lansing-East LansingMI         -0.627           33         Tucson,AZ         0.194         92         Lansing-Fast LansingMI         -0.627           34         Tampa-Sti. PetersburgFL         0.132         93         Pittsburgh,PA         -0.647           35         MikaoukeeWaukesha,WI         0.131         94         Knoxville,TN	21	Orlando,FL	0.598	80	MelbourneTitusvillePalm BayFL	-0.493
23         GalvestonTexasTX         0.567         82         Oklahoma CityOK         -0.508           24         Derver,CO         0.551         83         Ann ArborMI         -0.509           25         Fort WorthTX         0.543         84         Rochester,NY         -0.512           26         SeattleBellevueEverett,WA         0.541         85         Birmingham,AL         -0.532           27         Bokersfield,CA         0.479         86         Des MoineslA         -0.533           27         Foyetteville,NC         0.342         87         ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton,PA         -0.533           28         Reno,NV         0.318         88         Lexington,XY         -0.545           29         Reno,NV         0.318         88         Lexington,XH         -0.553           30         Santa RosaCA         0.292         89         Akron,OH         -0.619           21         Tacoson,AZ         0.194         92         Lansing-East LansingMI         -0.627           31         Tucson,AZ         0.194         92         Lansing-Fast LansingMI         -0.635           35         MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI         0.131         94         Knoxville,TN         -0.648	22	Corpus ChristiTX	0.586	81	Huntsville.AL	-0.502
24         Deriver, CO         0.551         83         Ann ArborMI         -0.509           25         Fort WorthTX         0.543         84         Rochester, NY         -0.512           26         SacttheBellevueEverett, WA         0.541         85         Birmingham, AL         -0.532           27         Bakersfield, CA         0.479         86         Des MoineslA         -0.533           28         Fayetteville, NC         0.342         87         ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton, PA         -0.545           28         Reno, NV         0.318         B8         Lexington, KY         -0.553           30         Santa RosaCA         0.292         89         Akron, OH         -0.642           31         West PalmFL         0.258         90         HamiltonMiddletown, OH         -0.624           31         Tucson, AZ         0.194         92         Lansing-East LansingMI         -0.627           34         Tampa-St. PetersburgFL         0.132         93         Pittsburgh, PA         -0.635           35         MoinwouthOcean, NU         -0.036         96         Montgomery, AL         -0.647           34         Jacksonville, FL         -0.111         98         Erie, PA <td>23</td> <td>GalvestonTexasTX</td> <td>0.567</td> <td>82</td> <td>Oklahoma CitvOK</td> <td>-0.508</td>	23	GalvestonTexasTX	0.567	82	Oklahoma CitvOK	-0.508
25         Fort WorthTX         0.543         84         Rochester,NY         -0.512           26         SeattleBellevueEverett,WA         0.541         85         Birmingham,AL         -0.532           27         Bokersfield,CA         0.479         86         Des MoinesIA         -0.532           28         Fayetteville,NC         0.342         87         ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton,PA         -0.545           28         Reno,NV         0.318         88         Lexington,KY         -0.532           30         Santa RosaCA         0.292         89         Akron,OH         -0.619           31         Tacson,AZ         0.194         92         Lansing-East LansingMI         -0.627           34         Targon,AZ         0.194         92         Lansing-Fast LansingMI         -0.627           34         Targon,AZ         0.194         92         Lansing-Fast LansingMI         -0.627           35         MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI         0.131         94         Knoxville,TN         -0.647           31         Dacksonville,FL         0.0136         96         Montgomery,AL         -0.687           36         keelandWinter HavenFL         -0.111         98         Erie,PA	24	Denver.CO	0.551	83	Ann ArborMI	-0.509
26         SeattleBellevueEverett,WA         0.541         85         Birmingham,AL         -0.532           27         Bokersfield,CA         0.479         86         Des MoinesIA         -0.537           27         Broyetteville,NC         0.342         87         ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton,PA         -0.545           29         Reno,NV         0.318         88         Lexington,KY         -0.553           30         Santa RosaCA         0.292         89         Akron,OH         -0.619           31         Taccoma,WA         0.202         91         ProvoOrem,UT         -0.624           31         Tucson,AZ         0.194         92         Lansing-East Lansing/MI         -0.627           34         Tampo-St. PetersburgFL         0.132         93         Pittsburgh,PA         -0.647           35         MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI         0.131         94         Knoxville,TN         -0.647           36         Dutchess CountyNY         0.046         95         Spokane,WA         -0.667           37         MonmouthOcean,NJ         -0.038         97         Johnson Cit/TNVA         -0.696           39         LakelandWinter HavenFL         -0.111         98         Erie,PA<	25	Fort WorthTX	0.543	84	Rochester.NY	-0.512
27         Bakersfield, CA         0.479         86         Des Moines/A         -0.537           28         Fayetteville, NC         0.342         87         Scranton-Wilkes-BarreHazleton, PA         -0.545           29         Reno, NV         0.318         88         Lexington, KY         -0.553           20         Santa RosaCA         0.292         89         Akron, OH         -0.562           21         West PalmFL         0.258         90         HamiltonMiddletown, OH         -0.624           31         Tucson, AZ         0.194         92         LansingEast Lansing/MI         -0.627           34         TampaSt. PetersburgFL         0.132         93         Pittsburgh, PA         -0.635           35         MilwaukeeWaukesha, WI         0.131         94         Knoxville, TN         -0.647           36         Dutchess CountyNY         0.046         95         Spokane, WA         -0.667           36         MonmouthOcean, NJ         -0.038         97         Johnson CiryTNVA         -0.698           37         MonstonWinter HavenFL         -0.111         98         Erie, PA         -0.698           40         Rockford, JL         -0.126         100         Sagian	26	SeattleBellevueEverett.WA	0.541	85	Birmingham.AL	-0.532
28         Fayetteville,NC         0.342         87         ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton,PA         -0.545           29         Reno,NV         0.318         88         Lexington,NY         -0.553           30         Santa RosaCA         0.292         89         Akron,OH         -0.542           30         Santa RosaCA         0.292         89         HamiltonMiddletown,OH         -0.619           31         West PalmFL         0.258         90         HamiltonMiddletown,OH         -0.613           32         Tacoma,WA         0.202         91         ProvoOrem,UT         -0.624           33         Tucson,AZ         0.194         92         LansingEast LansingMI         -0.635           34         TacmpaSt. PetersburgFL         0.132         93         Pittsburgh,PA         -0.647           35         MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI         0.131         94         Knoxville,TN         -0.645           36         Dutchess CountyNY         0.046         95         Spokane,WA         -0.665           37         Monngomery,AL         -0.647         -0.648         -0.648         -0.731           31         Beckford,IL         -0.123         90         CharlestonNorth charlestonSC <td>27</td> <td>Bakersfield CA</td> <td>0 479</td> <td>86</td> <td>Des MoineslA</td> <td>-0.537</td>	27	Bakersfield CA	0 479	86	Des MoineslA	-0.537
29       Reno,NV       0.318       88       Lexington,KY       -0.553         30       Santa RosaCA       0.292       89       Akron,OH       -0.662         31       West PalmFL       0.258       90       HamiltonMiddletown,OH       -0.612         31       Taccoma,WA       0.202       91       ProvoOrem,UT       -0.624         31       Tucson,AZ       0.194       92       LansingEast LansingMI       -0.627         34       TampaSt. PetersburgFL       0.131       94       Knoxville,TN       -0.637         35       MilwarkeeWaukesha,WI       0.131       94       Knoxville,TN       -0.647         35       MilwarkeeWaukesha,WI       0.036       96       Montporty,AL       -0.645         36       Jacksonville,FL       -0.088       97       Johnson CityTNVA       -0.698         31       Jacksonville,FL       -0.111       98       Erie,PA       -0.698         40       Rockford,IL       -0.123       99       CharlestonNorth charlestonSC       -0.703         41       GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Pt,NC-0126       100       SaginawBay City MidlandMI       -0.752         42       FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR       -0.167	28	Favetteville.NC	0.342	87	ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton PA	-0.545
Santa RosaCA         0.292         89         Akron,OH         -0.562           11         West PalmFL         0.258         90         HamiltonMiddletown,OH         -0.619           21         Tacoma,WA         0.202         91         ProvoOrem,UT         -0.624           31         Ucson,AZ         0.194         92         LansingEast Lansing/MI         -0.627           34         TampaSt. PetersburgFL         0.132         93         Pittsburgh,PA         -0.635           35         MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI         0.131         94         Knoxville,TN         -0.647           36         Dutchess CountyNY         0.046         95         Spokane,WA         -0.647           36         MonmouthOcean,NJ         -0.036         96         Montgomer,AL         -0.687           38         Jacksonville,FL         -0.111         98         Erie,PA         -0.698           31         GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh PI,NC-0.126         100         SaginawBay City MidlandMI         -0.726           42         FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR         -0.155         101         Macon,GA         -0.731           43         BeaumontPort ArthurTX         -0.164         102         EugeneSpringfield,OR	29	Reno.NV	0.318	88	Lexington KY	-0.553
31         West PalmFL         0.258         90         HamiltonMiddletown,OH         -0.619           32         Tacoma,WA         0.202         91         ProvoOrem,UT         -0.624           33         Tucson,AZ         0.194         92         Lansing-East LansingMI         -0.627           34         TamparSt. PetersburgFL         0.132         93         Pittsburgh,PA         -0.635           35         MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI         0.131         94         Knoxville,TN         -0.647           36         Dutchess CountyNY         0.046         95         Spokane,WA         -0.6687           38         Jacksonville,FL         -0.088         97         Johnson CityTNVA         -0.6687           39         LakelandWinter HavenFL         -0.111         98         Erie,PA         -0.698           40         Rockford,IL         -0.123         99         Charleston-North charlestonSC         -0.703           41         GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Pt,NC-0.126         100         SaginawBay City MidlandMI         -0.726           42         FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR         -0.155         101         Macon,GA         -0.757           43         BeaumontPort ArthurTX         -0.164	30	Santa RosaCA	0.292	89	Akron,OH	-0.562
32         Tacoma,WA         0.202         91         ProvoOrem,UT         -0.624           33         Tucson,AZ         0.194         92         Lansing-East LansingMI         -0.627           34         TampaSt. PetersburgFL         0.132         93         Pittsburgh,PA         -0.635           34         TampaSt. PetersburgFL         0.131         94         Knoxville,TN         -0.647           36         Dutchess CountyNY         0.046         95         Spokane,WA         -0.6657           37         MonmouthOcean,NJ         -0.036         96         Montgomery,AL         -0.6687           38         Jacksonville,FL         -0.0181         97         Johnson CityTNVA         -0.698           40         Rockford,IL         -0.123         99         CharlestonNorth charlestonSC         -0.703           41         Greensboro-Winston-SalemHigh Pt,NC-0.126         100         Saginow-Bay City MidlandMI         -0.726           42         FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR         -0.155         101         Macon,GA         -0.751           43         BeaumontPort ArthurTX         -0.167         103         BoulderLongmont,CO         -0.752           44         New OrleansLA         -0.167	31	West PalmFL	0.258	90	HamiltonMiddletown,OH	-0.619
33         Tucson,AZ         0.194         92         LansingEast LansingMI         0.627           34         TampaSt. PetersburgFL         0.132         93         Pittsburgh,PA         -0.635           35         MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI         0.131         94         Knoxville,TN         -0.647           36         Dutchess CountyNY         0.046         95         Spokane,WA         -0.665           37         MonmouthOcean,NJ         -0.036         96         Montgomery,AL         -0.687           38         Jacksonville,FL         -0.0111         98         Erie,PA         -0.698           40         Rockford,IL         -0.123         99         CharlestonNorth charlestonSC         -0.703           41         GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Pt,NC-0.126         100         SaginawBay City MidlandMI         -0.722           42         FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR         -0.167         103         BoulderLongmont,CO         -0.752           43         BeaumontPort ArthurTX         -0.164         102         EugeneSpringfield,OR         -0.752           44         New OrleansLA         -0.167         104         YoungstownWarren,OH         -0.766           45         HickoryMorgantonLenoir,	32	Tacoma.WA	0.202	91	ProvoOrem.UT	-0.624
34         TampaSt. PetersburgFL         0.132         93         Pittsburgh,PA         -0.635           35         MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI         0.131         94         Knoxville,TN         -0.647           36         Dutchess CountyNY         0.046         95         Spokane,WA         -0.665           37         MonmouthOcean,NJ         -0.036         96         Montgomery,AL         -0.687           38         Jacksonville,FL         -0.0123         97         Johnson CityTNVA         -0.698           40         Rockford,IL         -0.111         98         Erie,PA         -0.698           41         GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Pt,NC-0.126         100         SaginawBay City MidlandMI         -0.723           41         GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Pt,NC-0.126         100         SaginawBay City MidlandMI         -0.726           42         FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR         -0.164         102         EugeneSpringfield,OR         -0.751           43         BeaumontPort ArthurTX         -0.167         103         BoulderLongmont,CO         -0.757           44         New OrleansLA         -0.167         103         SoulderLongmont,CO         -0.776           45         HickoryMorgantonLe	33	Tucson.AZ	0.194	92	LansinaEast LansinaMI	-0.627
Milwaukee-Waukesha,WI         0.131         94         Knoxville,TN         -0.647           36         Dutchess CountyNY         0.046         95         Spokane,WA         -0.665           37         MonmouthOcean,NJ         -0.036         96         Montgomery,AL         -0.687           38         Jacksonville,FL         -0.088         97         Johnson CityTNVA         -0.698           40         Rockford,IL         -0.123         99         CharlestonNorth charlestonSC         -0.703           41         GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Pt,NC-0.126         100         SaginawBay City MidlandMI         -0.726           42         FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR         -0.155         101         Macon,GA         -0.731           43         BeaumontPort ArthurTX         -0.167         103         BoulderLongmont,CO         -0.757           45         HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC         -0.179         104         YoungstownWarren,OH         -0.766           46         Grand RapidsMI         -0.235         106         KalamazooBattle CreekMI         -0.776           47         Colorado SpringCO         -0.225         106         KalamazooBattle CreekMI         -0.776           48         Indianapolis,IN <td>34</td> <td>TampaSt. PetersburaFL</td> <td>0.132</td> <td>93</td> <td>Pittsburgh.PA</td> <td>-0.635</td>	34	TampaSt. PetersburaFL	0.132	93	Pittsburgh.PA	-0.635
36       Dutchess CountyNY       0.046       95       Spokane,WA       -0.665         37       MonmouthOcean,NJ       -0.036       96       Montgomery,AL       -0.687         38       Jacksonville,FL       -0.088       97       Johnson CityTNVA       -0.698         39       LakelandWinter HavenFL       -0.111       98       Erie,PA       -0.698         40       Rockford,IL       -0.123       99       CharlestonNorth charlestonSC       -0.703         41       GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Pt,NC-0.126       100       SaginawBay City MidlandMI       -0.726         42       FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR       -0.155       101       Macon,GA       -0.731         43       BeaumontPort ArthurTX       -0.164       102       EugeneSpringfield,OR       -0.757         44       New OrleansLA       -0.177       104       YoungstownWarren,OH       -0.766         45       Indianapolis,IN       -0.235       106       KalamazooBattle CreekMI       -0.776         46       Grand RapidsMI       -0.235       107       CantonMassillon,OH       -0.798         47       Colorado SpringCO       -0.237       109       Mobile,AL       -0.806         51 </td <td>35</td> <td>MilwaukeeWaukesha.WI</td> <td>0.131</td> <td>94</td> <td>Knoxville.TN</td> <td>-0.647</td>	35	MilwaukeeWaukesha.WI	0.131	94	Knoxville.TN	-0.647
37       MonmouthOcean,NJ       -0.036       96       Montgomery,AL       -0.687         38       Jacksonville,FL       -0.088       97       Johnson CityTNVA       -0.696         39       LakelandWinter HavenFL       -0.111       98       Erie,PA       -0.698         40       Rockford,IL       -0.123       99       CharlestonNorth charlestonSC       -0.703         41       GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Pt,NC-0.126       100       SaginawBay City MidlandMI       -0.726         42       FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR       -0.155       101       Macon,GA       -0.731         43       BeaumontPort ArthurTX       -0.164       102       EugeneSpringfield,OR       -0.752         44       New OrleansLA       -0.167       103       BoulderLongmont,CO       -0.757         45       HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC       -0.179       104       YoungstownWarren,OH       -0.766         46       Grand RapidsMI       -0.233       105       Syracuse,NY       -0.776         47       Colorado SpringCO       -0.225       106       KalamazooBattle CreekMI       -0.776         48       Indianapolis,IN       -0.237       109       Mobile,AL       -0.806       -0.806 </td <td>36</td> <td>Dutchess CountyNY</td> <td>0.046</td> <td>95</td> <td>Spokane.WA</td> <td>-0.665</td>	36	Dutchess CountyNY	0.046	95	Spokane.WA	-0.665
38       Jacksonville,FL       -0.088       97       Johnson CityTNVA       -0.696         39       LakelandWinter HavenFL       -0.111       98       Erie,PA       -0.698         40       Rockford,IL       -0.123       99       CharlestonNorth charlestonSC       -0.703         41       GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Pt,NC-0.126       100       SaginawBay City MidlandMI       -0.726         42       FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR       -0.155       101       Macon,GA       -0.731         43       BeaumontPort ArthurTX       -0.164       102       EugeneSpringfield,OR       -0.752         44       New OrleansLA       -0.167       103       BoulderLongmont,CO       -0.756         45       HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC       -0.179       104       YoungstownWarren,OH       -0.766         46       Grand RapidsMI       -0.213       105       Syracuse,NY       -0.776         47       Colorado SpringCO       -0.225       106       KalamazooBattle CreekMI       -0.776         48       Indianapolis,IN       -0.237       109       Mobile,AL       -0.806       -0.799         50       AllentownBethlehemEaston,PA       -0.237       109       Mobile,AL <t< td=""><td>37</td><td>, MonmouthOcean.NJ</td><td>-0.036</td><td>96</td><td>Montgomery.AL</td><td>-0.687</td></t<>	37	, MonmouthOcean.NJ	-0.036	96	Montgomery.AL	-0.687
39       LakelandWinter HavenFL       -0.111       98       Erie, PA       -0.698         40       Rockford, IL       -0.123       99       CharlestonNorth charlestonSC       -0.703         41       GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Pt, NC-0.126       100       SaginawBay City MidlandMI       -0.726         42       FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers, AR       -0.155       101       Macon, GA       -0.731         43       BeaumontPort ArthurTX       -0.164       102       EugeneSpringfield, OR       -0.752         44       New OrleansLA       -0.167       103       BoulderLongmont, CO       -0.757         54       HickoryMorgantonLenoir, NC       -0.179       104       YoungstownWarren, OH       -0.766         45       Grand RapidsMI       -0.213       105       Syracuse, NY       -0.776         47       Colorado SpringCO       -0.225       106       KalamazooBattle CreekMI       -0.776         48       Indianapolis, IN       -0.235       108       Little RockAR       -0.799         50       AllentownBethlehemEaston, PA       -0.237       109       Mobile, AL       -0.806         51       AtlanticCape MayNJ       -0.267       111       Madison, WI       -0.8	38	Jacksonville.FL	-0.088	97	Johnson CityTNVA	-0.696
40       Rockford,IL       -0.123       99       CharlestonNorth charlestonSC       -0.703         41       GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Pt,NC-0.126       100       SaginawBay City MidlandMI       -0.726         42       FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR       -0.155       101       Macon,GA       -0.731         43       BeaumontPort ArthurTX       -0.164       102       EugeneSpringfield,OR       -0.752         44       New OrleansLA       -0.167       103       BoulderLongmont,CO       -0.757         45       HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC       -0.179       104       YoungstownWarren,OH       -0.766         46       Grand RapidsMI       -0.213       105       Syracuse,NY       -0.776         47       Colorado SpringCO       -0.225       106       KalamazooBattle CreekMI       -0.778         49       Fort WaynelN       -0.235       108       Little RockAR       -0.799         50       AllentownBethlehemEaston,PA       -0.237       109       Mobile,AL       -0.814         51       AtlanticCape MayNJ       -0.267       112       ShreveportBossier CityLA       -0.815         53       Salt Lake CityUT       -0.267       112       ShreveportBossier CityLA	39	LakelandWinter HavenFL	-0.111	98	, Erie,PA	-0.698
41       GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Pt,NC-0.126       100       SaginawBay City MidlandMI       -0.726         42       FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR       -0.155       101       Macon,GA       -0.731         43       BeaumontPort ArthurTX       -0.164       102       EugeneSpringfield,OR       -0.752         44       New OrleansLA       -0.167       103       BoulderLongmont,CO       -0.757         45       HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC       -0.179       104       YoungstownWarren,OH       -0.766         46       Grand RapidsMI       -0.213       105       Syracuse,NY       -0.776         47       Colorado SpringCO       -0.225       106       KalamazooBattle CreekMI       -0.776         48       Indianapolis,IN       -0.234       107       CantonMassillon,OH       -0.798         49       Fort WayneIN       -0.235       108       Little RockAR       -0.799         50       AllentownBethlehemEaston,PA       -0.237       109       Mobile,AL       -0.806         51       AtlanticCape MayNJ       -0.267       112       ShreveportBossier CityLA       -0.814         52       RichmondPetersburg,VA       -0.267       112       ShreveportBossier CityLA	40	Rockford,IL	-0.123	99	CharlestonNorth charlestonSC	-0.703
42       FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers, AR       -0.155       101       Macon, GA       -0.731         43       BeaumontPort ArthurTX       -0.164       102       EugeneSpringfield, OR       -0.752         44       New OrleansLA       -0.167       103       BoulderLongmont, CO       -0.757         45       HickoryMorgantonLenoir, NC       -0.179       104       YoungstownWarren, OH       -0.766         46       Grand RapidsMI       -0.213       105       Syracuse, NY       -0.776         47       Colorado SpringCO       -0.225       106       KalamazooBattle CreekMI       -0.776         48       Indianapolis, IN       -0.235       108       Little RockAR       -0.799         50       AllentownBethlehemEaston, PA       -0.237       109       Mobile, AL       -0.806         51       AtlanticCape MayNJ       -0.252       110       Daytona BeachFL       -0.814         52       RichmondPetersburg,VA       -0.260       111       Madison,WI       -0.818         53       Salt Lake CityUT       -0.275       114       UticaRome,NY       -0.845         54       GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson,SC       -0.275       114       UticaRome,NY       -0.944 </td <td>41</td> <td>GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Pt.N</td> <td>C-0.126</td> <td>100</td> <td>SaainawBay City MidlandMI</td> <td>-0.726</td>	41	GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Pt.N	C-0.126	100	SaainawBay City MidlandMI	-0.726
43       BeaumontPort ArthurTX       -0.164       102       EugeneSpringfield,OR       -0.752         44       New OrleansLA       -0.167       103       BoulderLongmont,CO       -0.757         45       HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC       -0.179       104       YoungstownWarren,OH       -0.766         46       Grand RapidsMI       -0.213       105       Syracuse,NY       -0.776         47       Colorado SpringCO       -0.225       106       KalamazooBattle CreekMI       -0.776         48       Indianapolis,IN       -0.235       108       Little RockAR       -0.799         50       AllentownBethlehemEaston,PA       -0.237       109       Mobile,AL       -0.806         51       AtlanticCape MayNJ       -0.252       110       Daytona BeachFL       -0.814         52       RichmondPetersburg,VA       -0.2667       111       Madison,WI       -0.818         53       Salt Lake CityUT       -0.275       114       UticaRome,NY       -0.845         54       GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson,SC       -0.275       114       UticaRome,NY       -0.944         55       Tulsa,OK       -0.278       115       Springfield,MO       -0.991         <	42	FavettevilleSprinadaleRogers,AR	-0.155	101	Macon.GA	-0.731
44       New OrleansLA       -0.167       103       BoulderLongmont,CO       -0.757         45       HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC       -0.179       104       YoungstownWarren,OH       -0.766         46       Grand RapidsMI       -0.213       105       Syracuse,NY       -0.776         47       Colorado SpringCO       -0.225       106       KalamazooBattle CreekMI       -0.776         48       Indianapolis,IN       -0.235       108       Little RockAR       -0.799         50       AllentownBethlehemEaston,PA       -0.237       109       Mobile,AL       -0.806         51       AtlanticCape MayNJ       -0.252       110       Daytona BeachFL       -0.814         52       RichmondPetersburg,VA       -0.260       111       Madison,WI       -0.818         53       Salt Lake CityUT       -0.267       112       ShreveportBossier CityLA       -0.850         54       GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson,SC       -0.275       114       UticaRome,NY       -0.944         56       San Luis ObispoCA       -0.278       115       Springfield,MO       -0.991         57       DaytonSpringfield,OH       -0.278       116       Pensacola,FL       -1.018 <tr< td=""><td>43</td><td>BeaumontPort ArthurTX</td><td>-0.164</td><td>102</td><td>EugeneSpringfield,OR</td><td>-0.752</td></tr<>	43	BeaumontPort ArthurTX	-0.164	102	EugeneSpringfield,OR	-0.752
45       HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC       -0.179       104       YoungstownWarren,OH       -0.766         46       Grand RapidsMI       -0.213       105       Syracuse,NY       -0.776         47       Colorado SpringCO       -0.225       106       KalamazooBattle CreekMI       -0.776         48       Indianapolis,IN       -0.234       107       CantonMassillon,OH       -0.798         49       Fort WaynelN       -0.235       108       Little RockAR       -0.799         50       AllentownBethlehemEaston,PA       -0.237       109       Mobile,AL       -0.806         51       AtlanticCape MayNJ       -0.252       110       Daytona BeachFL       -0.814         52       RichmondPetersburg,VA       -0.2667       112       ShreveportBossier CityLA       -0.850         53       Salt Lake CityUT       -0.267       112       ShreveportBossier CityLA       -0.845         54       GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson,SC       -0.275       114       UticaRome,NY       -0.944         56       San Luis ObispoCA       -0.278       115       Springfield,MO       -0.991         57       DaytonSpringfield,OH       -0.278       116       Pensacola,FL       -1.018	44	New OrleansLA	-0.167	103	BoulderLongmont,CO	-0.757
46       Grand RapidsMI       -0.213       105       Syracuse,NY       -0.776         47       Colorado SpringCO       -0.225       106       KalamazooBattle CreekMI       -0.776         48       Indianapolis,IN       -0.234       107       CantonMassillon,OH       -0.798         49       Fort WaynelN       -0.235       108       Little RockAR       -0.799         50       AllentownBethlehemEaston,PA       -0.237       109       Mobile,AL       -0.806         51       AtlanticCape MayNJ       -0.252       110       Daytona BeachFL       -0.814         52       RichmondPetersburg,VA       -0.2667       112       ShreveportBossier CityLA       -0.850         53       Salt Lake CityUT       -0.275       114       UticaRome,NY       -0.944         54       GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson,SC       -0.275       114       UticaRome,NY       -0.944         55       Tulsa,OK       -0.278       115       Springfield,MO       -0.991         57       DaytonSpringfield,OH       -0.278       116       Pensacola,FL       -1.018         58       Nashville,TN       -0.280       117       Binghamton,NY       -1.075         59	45	HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC	-0.179	104	YoungstownWarren,OH	-0.766
47       Colorado SpringCO       -0.225       106       KalamazooBattle CreekMI       -0.776         48       Indianapolis,IN       -0.234       107       CantonMassillon,OH       -0.798         49       Fort WaynelN       -0.235       108       Little RockAR       -0.799         50       AllentownBethlehemEaston,PA       -0.237       109       Mobile,AL       -0.806         51       AtlanticCape MayNJ       -0.252       110       Daytona BeachFL       -0.814         52       RichmondPetersburg,VA       -0.267       112       ShreveportBossier CityLA       -0.850         53       Salt Lake CityUT       -0.267       112       ShreveportBossier CityLA       -0.818         54       GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson,SC       -0.272       113       Jackson,MS       -0.845         55       Tulsa,OK       -0.275       114       UticaRome,NY       -0.944         56       San Luis ObispoCA       -0.278       115       Springfield,MO       -0.991         57       DaytonSpringfield,OH       -0.278       116       Pensacola,FL       -1.018         58       Nashville,TN       -0.280       117       Binghamton,NY       -1.075         59 <td>46</td> <td>Grand RapidsMI</td> <td>-0.213</td> <td>105</td> <td>Syracuse,NY</td> <td>-0.776</td>	46	Grand RapidsMI	-0.213	105	Syracuse,NY	-0.776
48       Indianapolis,IN       -0.234       107       CantonMassillon,OH       -0.798         49       Fort WaynelN       -0.235       108       Little RockAR       -0.799         50       AllentownBethlehemEaston,PA       -0.237       109       Mobile,AL       -0.806         51       AtlanticCape MayNJ       -0.252       110       Daytona BeachFL       -0.814         52       RichmondPetersburg,VA       -0.260       111       Madison,WI       -0.818         53       Salt Lake CityUT       -0.267       112       ShreveportBossier CityLA       -0.850         54       GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson,SC       -0.272       113       Jackson,MS       -0.885         55       Tulsa,OK       -0.278       114       UticaRome,NY       -0.944         56       San Luis ObispoCA       -0.278       115       Springfield,MO       -0.991         57       DaytonSpringfield,OH       -0.278       116       Pensacola,FL       -1.018         58       Nashville,TN       -0.280       117       Binghamton,NY       -1.075         59       Kansas CityMOKS       -0.282       118       Tallahassee,FL       -1.124	47	Colorado SprinaCO	-0.225	106	KalamazooBattle CreekMI	-0.776
49       Fort WaynelN       -0.235       108       Little RockAR       -0.799         50       AllentownBethlehemEaston,PA       -0.237       109       Mobile,AL       -0.806         51       AtlanticCape MayNJ       -0.252       110       Daytona BeachFL       -0.814         52       RichmondPetersburg,VA       -0.260       111       Madison,WI       -0.818         53       Salt Lake CityUT       -0.267       112       ShreveportBossier CityLA       -0.850         54       GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson,SC       -0.272       113       Jackson,MS       -0.885         55       Tulsa,OK       -0.275       114       UticaRome,NY       -0.944         56       San Luis ObispoCA       -0.278       115       Springfield,MO       -0.991         57       DaytonSpringfield,OH       -0.278       116       Pensacola,FL       -1.018         58       Nashville,TN       -0.280       117       Binghamton,NY       -1.075         59       Kansas CityMOKS       -0.282       118       Tallahassee,FL       -1.124	48	Indianapolis,IN	-0.234	107	CantonMassillon,OH	-0.798
50       AllentownBethlehemEaston,PA       -0.237       109       Mobile,AL       -0.806         51       AtlanticCape MayNJ       -0.252       110       Daytona BeachFL       -0.814         52       RichmondPetersburg,VA       -0.260       111       Madison,WI       -0.818         53       Salt Lake CityUT       -0.267       112       ShreveportBossier CityLA       -0.850         54       GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson,SC       -0.272       113       Jackson,MS       -0.885         55       Tulsa,OK       -0.275       114       UticaRome,NY       -0.944         56       San Luis ObispoCA       -0.278       115       Springfield,MO       -0.991         57       DaytonSpringfield,OH       -0.278       116       Pensacola,FL       -1.018         58       Nashville,TN       -0.280       117       Binghamton,NY       -1.075         59       Kansas CityMOKS       -0.282       118       Tallahassee,FL       -1.124	49	Fort WaynelN	-0.235	108	Little RockAR	-0.799
51       AtlanticCape MayNJ       -0.252       110       Daytona BeachFL       -0.814         52       RichmondPetersburg,VA       -0.260       111       Madison,WI       -0.818         53       Salt Lake CityUT       -0.267       112       ShreveportBossier CityLA       -0.850         54       GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson,SC       -0.272       113       Jackson,MS       -0.885         55       Tulsa,OK       -0.275       114       UticaRome,NY       -0.944         56       San Luis ObispoCA       -0.278       115       Springfield,MO       -0.991         57       DaytonSpringfield,OH       -0.278       116       Pensacola,FL       -1.018         58       Nashville,TN       -0.280       117       Binghamton,NY       -1.075         59       Kansas CityMOKS       -0.282       118       Tallahassee,FL       -1.124	50	AllentownBethlehemEaston,PA	-0.237	109	Mobile,AL	-0.806
52       RichmondPetersburg,VA       -0.260       111       Madison,WI       -0.818         53       Salt Lake CityUT       -0.267       112       ShreveportBossier CityLA       -0.850         54       GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson,SC       -0.272       113       Jackson,MS       -0.885         55       Tulsa,OK       -0.275       114       UticaRome,NY       -0.944         56       San Luis ObispoCA       -0.278       115       Springfield,MO       -0.991         57       DaytonSpringfield,OH       -0.278       116       Pensacola,FL       -1.018         58       Nashville,TN       -0.280       117       Binghamton,NY       -1.075         59       Kansas CityMOKS       -0.282       118       Tallahassee,FL       -1.124	51	AtlanticCape MayNJ	-0.252	110	Daytona BeachFL	-0.814
53       Salt Lake CityUT       -0.267       112       ShreveportBossier CityLA       -0.850         54       GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson,SC       -0.272       113       Jackson,MS       -0.885         55       Tulsa,OK       -0.275       114       UticaRome,NY       -0.944         56       San Luis ObispoCA       -0.278       115       Springfield,MO       -0.991         57       DaytonSpringfield,OH       -0.278       116       Pensacola,FL       -1.018         58       Nashville,TN       -0.280       117       Binghamton,NY       -1.075         59       Kansas CityMOKS       -0.282       118       Tallahassee,FL       -1.124	52	RichmondPetersburg,VA	-0.260	111	Madison,WI	-0.818
54       GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson,SC       -0.272       113       Jackson,MS       -0.885         55       Tulsa,OK       -0.275       114       UticaRome,NY       -0.944         56       San Luis ObispoCA       -0.278       115       Springfield,MO       -0.991         57       DaytonSpringfield,OH       -0.278       116       Pensacola,FL       -1.018         58       Nashville,TN       -0.280       117       Binghamton,NY       -1.075         59       Kansas CityMOKS       -0.282       118       Tallahassee,FL       -1.124	53	Salt Lake CityUT	-0.267	112	ShreveportBossier CityLA	-0.850
55       Tulsa,OK       -0.275       114       UticaRome,NY       -0.944         56       San Luis ObispoCA       -0.278       115       Springfield,MO       -0.991         57       DaytonSpringfield,OH       -0.278       116       Pensacola,FL       -1.018         58       Nashville,TN       -0.280       117       Binghamton,NY       -1.075         59       Kansas CityMOKS       -0.282       118       Tallahassee,FL       -1.124	54	GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson.SC	-0.272	113	Jackson,MS	-0.885
56         San Luis ObispoCA         -0.278         115         Springfield,MO         -0.991           57         DaytonSpringfield,OH         -0.278         116         Pensacola,FL         -1.018           58         Nashville,TN         -0.280         117         Binghamton,NY         -1.075           59         Kansas CityMOKS         -0.282         118         Tallahassee,FL         -1.124	55	Tulsa,OK	-0.275	114	UticaRome,NY	-0.944
57         DaytonSpringfield,OH         -0.278         116         Pensacola,FL         -1.018           58         Nashville,TN         -0.280         117         Binghamton,NY         -1.075           59         Kansas CityMOKS         -0.282         118         Tallahassee,FL         -1.124	56	San Luis ObispoCA	-0.278	115	Springfield,MO	-0.991
58         Nashville,TN         -0.280         117         Binghamton,NY         -1.075           59         Kansas CityMOKS         -0.282         118         Tallahassee,FL         -1.124	57	DaytonSpringfield,OH	-0.278	116	Pensacola,FL	-1.018
59 Kansas CityMOKS -0.282 118 Tallahassee,FL -1.124	58	Nashville,TN	-0.280	117	Binghamton,NY	-1.075
	59	Kansas CityMOKS	-0.282	118	Tallahassee,FL	-1.124

### **Racial Inclusion**

Those metro areas that have high scores related to racial inclusion experience positive growth rates in employment and population. The Cleveland metro area is near the bottom of the list of 118 metro areas (table 12). Only Milwaukee, and Flint, Michigan have a lower score for racial inclusion. Of the four NEO metro areas, Canton has the highest score for racial inclusion, but it still falls within the middle third of the distribution of scores. Akron and Youngstown are in the upper end of the lowest third of the scores.

1         Eugene-Springfield,OR         1,985         60         York,PA         -0.010           Boise CityID         1,871         61         South BendliN         -0.0176           Spokene,WA         1,800         62         Augusten-Aiken,GA-SC         -0.079           Sublack CityUT         1,576         63         Oklohom cityOK         -0.0125           Tucson,AZ         1,549         64         Rochester,NY         -0.175           Modesto,CA         1,475         66         Derver,CO         -0.185           VisalioLongmont,CO         1,399         69         VallejoFinified-Napo,CA         -0.312           Johnson CityTN-VA         1,317         71         Mockon,GA         -0.332           Johnson CityTN-VA         1,317         72         Ann ArborMI         -0.344           Orange CountyCA         1,259         73         Daytone BeachFL         -0.444           Ferano,CA         1,120         76         Syracure,NY         -0.444           Ferano,CA         1,120         76         Syracure,NY         -0.444           Ferano,CA         1,104         78         Eventried,L         -0.455           SyringHiel,MO         1,120         76         Sy	Rank	Metro Areas	Score	Rank	Metro Areas	Score
2         Boise CityID         1.871         61         South BendIN         -0.076           4         Spinkene WA         1.800         62         Augustra-Milen,GA-SC.         -0.079           5         Tuscan,AZ         1.549         63         Poktona cityOK         -0.0170           6         Rano,NV         1.526         65         Fort WorthTX         -0.175           7         Modesto,CA         1.475         66         Derwey,CO         -0.185           7         Modesto,CA         1.471         67         Orlando,FL         -0.235           7         Modesto,CA         1.371         70         Oakland, CA         -0.321           1         Sante BarbardCA         1.317         71         Macon,GA         -0.324           1         Sante BarbardCA         1.317         71         Macon,GA         -0.324           10         Darson Electricul         -0.140         -0.141         -0.141         -0.141           10         Darson Electricul         -0.141         -0.141         -0.141         -0.141           11         BarbarbardCA         1.223         74         Nashville,TN         -0.141           12         Jahneson-Electron-Elect	1	EugeneSpringfield,OR	1.985	60	York,PA	-0.010
3         Spokne, WA         1.800         62         Augusta-Ailen, GASC         0.072           5         Satl Lake CityUT         1.576         63         Oklohom cityOK         0.0922           5         Tusson, AZ         1.549         64         Rochester, NY         0.175           7         Modesto, CA         1.475         66         Derwer, CO         0.185           7         Modesto, CA         1.415         66         Derwer, CO         0.0285           9         Frow-Orterm, UT         1.415         68         Greensboro-Ainston-SolemHigh Point, NC         0.289           10         Boulder-Longmont, CO         1.399         69         VollejoFaritfeld-Napo, CA         0.313           11         Sarta BorbaroCA         1.317         71         Macon, GA         0.333           12         Johnson CiryTN-VA         1.317         71         Macon, GA         0.344           13         Brage CountyCA         1.297         73         Daylona BeachFL         0.410           14         Forson, CA         1.107         77         Rokford, IL         0.442           14         Forson, CA         1.107         77         Rokford, IL         0.442 <tr< td=""><td>2</td><td>Boise CityID</td><td>1.871</td><td>61</td><td>South BendIN</td><td>-0.076</td></tr<>	2	Boise CityID	1.871	61	South BendIN	-0.076
4         Salt Lake CityUT         1.579         63         Oklahoma cityOK         -0.020           1         Tuson,AZ         1.549         64         Rochester,NY         -0.170           6         Rano,NY         1.526         65         Fort WorthTX         -0.175           7         Modesto,CA         1.475         66         Derver,CO         -0.185           7         Noral Charlows         -0.023         -0.023         -0.023           10         Boulder-Longmont,CO         1.397         71         Macon,CA         -0.312           11         Santa BorbaraCA         1.311         70         Oklahon CA         -0.333           12         Johnson CityTN-VA         1.317         71         Macon,CA         -0.346           13         Binghamton,NY         1.327         74         AnabarM         -0.348           14         Orange CountyCA         1.297         73         Daytona BaachFL         -0.345           15         Batersfield,CA         1.293         74         Nashville,TN         -0.044           16         Fresno,CA         1.107         77         RacKord,IL         -0.044           17         Springfield,MO         1.017	3	Spokane, WA	1.800	62	AugustaAiken,GASC	-0.079
5         Tucson, AZ         1.549         64         Rechester, NY         0.175           7         Modesto, CA         1.475         65         Fort WorthTX         0.175           7         Modesto, CA         1.471         64         Derwer, CO         0.0185           9         ProxoOrem, UT         1.415         68         Greensboro-Winston-Solem-High Point, NC         0.235           9         Boulgen-Longmont, CO         1.359         97         Valiejo-Fortifield-Nopo, CA         0.312           10         Boulgen-Longmont, CO         1.351         70         Oakland, CA         0.332           11         Sonta Barbarozo, CA         1.3317         71         Macon, GA         0.3430           12         Johnson Cirjt/N-VA         1.317         71         Macon, GA         0.3434           13         Batersfield, CA         1.223         74         Nashville, TN         -0.414           14         Batersfield, CA         1.207         76         Sprozingfield, MO         0.442           14         Frasno, CA         1.104         78         Hurtsville, AL         -0.442           15         Springfield, MO         1.026         80         Sarozaota-Bradenton, FL	4	Salt Lake CityUT	1.576	63	Oklahoma cityOK	-0.092
6         Reno, N         1.526         65         Fort WorthTX         0.175           Modesto, CA         1.475         66         Derwc, CO         0.185           Visalia-Tulara-Portexville, CA         1.471         67         Orlando, FL         0.235           Provo:-Orem, UT         1.415         68         Greenaboro-Winston-SolemHigh Point/KC         0.323           Johnson ChyTNVA         1.351         70         Oakland, CA         0.3323           Johnson ChyTNVA         1.317         71         Macon, GA         0.343           Binghamton, NY         1.307         72         Ann ArbortMI         -0.344           Orange CountyCA         1.229         73         Daytona BeachFL         -0.343           Lincoln, NE         1.194         75         Tompa-St. PetersburgFL         -0.415           Springfield, MO         1.107         77         RacKord JL         -0.444           Presno, CA         1.044         78         Huntsville, AL         -0.468           Scranson-Wilkes-BareHazleton, PA         1.047         79         Histburgh, PA         -0.517           AppletonOshtosch-Neenal, WI         1.026         80         Sarasota-Bradenton, FL         -0.664 <td< td=""><td>5</td><td>Tucson,AZ</td><td>1.549</td><td>64</td><td>Rochester,NY</td><td>-0.170</td></td<>	5	Tucson,AZ	1.549	64	Rochester,NY	-0.170
7         Modesto, CA         1.475         66         Derver, CO         0.0185           7         Viscila-Tudrer-Porteville, CA         1.471         67         Orlando, FL         0.235           9         ProvoOrem, UT         1.415         68         GreensboroWinston-SolemHigh Point, NC         0.232           10         Boulder-Longmont, CO         1.329         9         VollejoFarifield-Napo, CA         0.312           11         Santa Barbaraco, A         1.331         70         Oakland, CA         0.332           12         Johnson ChyTN-VA         1.317         71         Macon, GA         0.334           13         Batsafield, CA         1.223         74         Nashville, TN         -0.410           14         Edstarifield, CA         1.223         74         Nashville, TN         -0.414           14         Fresno, CA         1.107         77         Rockford, IL         -0.444           18         Allentown-Bathlehem-Easton, PA         1.104         79         Hittsburgh, PA         -0.517           14         Fresno, CA         1.026         So scraston-Bradenton, FL         -0.555           2         Santa RoseCA         1.092         Sata RosecA         0.610	6	Reno,NV	1.526	65	Fort WorthTX	-0.175
8         Visalia-Tulore-Porterville,CA         1.415         67         Orlando,FL         0.235           9         Provo-Orem,UT         1.399         69         Vallejo-Fairfield-Napa,CA         0.312           11         Santa BarbaraCA         1.351         70         Oakland,CA         0.333           12         Jahnson CityTh-VA         1.317         71         Macon,GA         0.330           13         Binghamton,NY         1.307         72         Ann ArborMM         -0.344           14         Orange CountyCA         1.299         73         Daytone BeachFL         -0.415           15         Bakersfield,CA         1.253         74         Nashville,TN         -0.414           15         Bakersfield,CA         1.102         76         Syracuse,NY         -0.442           16         Linccin,NE         1.104         78         Huntsville,AL         -0.442           17         Freeno,CA         1.004         78         Syracuse,NY         -0.517           12         Appleton-Oshkosh-Neenoh,WI         1.026         80         Sarators/Brademon,FL         -0.555           12         Santa RosaCA         0.882         84         Jerasy cityNI         -0.666	7	Modesto,CA	1.475	66	Denver,CO	-0.185
9         ProvoOrem,UT         1.415         68         CreensboroWinston-Solam-High Point,NC 0.290           11         Sonta BarbaroCA         1.351         70         Ockland,CA         0.312           11         Sonta BarbaroCA         1.351         70         Ockland,CA         0.333           12         Johnson CityTN-VA         1.317         71         Macon,GA         0.334           14         Orange CountyCA         1.299         73         Daytona BeachFL         0.344           15         Bokersfield,CA         1.253         TampoSt. PetersburgFL         0.415           16         Lincoln,NE         1.104         75         TampoSt. PetersburgFL         0.414           17         Springfield,MO         1.104         78         Huntsville,AL         0.444           18         Itencon-Wilkes-Barre-Hcaten,PA         1.074         79         Pittsburgh,PA         0.0517           11         Appleton-Oshkosh-Neend,WI         1.026         80         Sarstota-Bradenton,FL         0.0552           20         Sarta KoseCA         0.882         84         Jersey CityNJ         0.666           21         takon-Macoda SpringsCO         0.875         Son Lios ObspocCA         0.822 <t< td=""><td>8</td><td>VisaliaTularePorterville,CA</td><td>1.471</td><td>67</td><td>Orlando,FL</td><td>-0.235</td></t<>	8	VisaliaTularePorterville,CA	1.471	67	Orlando,FL	-0.235
10         Boulder-Longmont,CO         1.399         69         VallejoTarifield-Napa,CA         .0.312           11         Santa BorbaraCA         1.351         70         Oakland,CA         .0.333           12         Johnson CirjTN-VA         1.317         71         Macon,GA         .0.330           13         Binghamton,NY         1.307         72         Ann ArborMI         .0.346           14         Orange CountyCA         1.299         73         Daytona BeachFL         .0.341           15         Bakersfield,CA         1.253         74         Nashville,TN         .0.411           16         Lincclin,NE         1.194         75         Tampo-St. PetersburgFL         .0.412           17         Springfield,MO         1.102         76         Syracuse,NY         .0.442           17         reson,CA         1.004         78         Hutsburgh,PA         .0.517           12         AppletonOshkoshNeendh,WI         1.026         80         Sarasota-Bradenton,FL         .0.555           20         Scarato Roac CA         1.009         81         Little RockAR         .0.616           21         Laco,OK         0.986         83         Rickora,M         .0.655	9	ProvoOrem,UT	1.415	68	GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Point,NC	-0.290
11         Sonte BarbaraCA         1.351         70         Oakland,CA         0.323           11         Johnson CityTN-VA         1.317         71         Macron,GA         0.340           13         Binghamton,NY         1.307         72         Ann ArborMI         0.346           14         Orange CountyCA         1.299         73         Daytona BeachFL         0.346           16         Lincoin,NE         1.120         77         Roshville,TN         0.415           17         Springfield,MC         1.120         77         Rockford,IL         0.444           18         Fresno,CA         1.104         78         Hunsville,FL         0.444           19         Fresno,CA         1.074         79         Pittsburgh,PA         0.0517           20         AppletonOshkosh-Meend,WI         1.026         80         Sorstota-Bradenton,FL         0.555           20         Sonto RosaCA         1.009         81         Little RockAR         0.666           21         Tacoma,WA         0.968         83         RichmondFetersburg,VA         0.665           25         Son Lise ObspringsCO         0.867         85         Weet Palm BeachFL         0.779	10	BoulderLongmont,CO	1.399	69	VallejoFairfieldNapa,CA	-0.312
12       Johnson CityTNVA       1.317       71       Macon,GA       -0.340         13       Binghomon,NY       1.307       72       Ann ArbortMI       -0.346         14       Orange CountyCA       1.299       73       Daytona BeachFL       -0.346         15       Backersfield,CA       1.233       74       Nashville,TN       -0.410         16       Lincoln,NE       1.104       75       TampaSt. FebersburgFL       -0.414         17       Springfield,MO       1.104       78       Huntsville,AL       -0.444         19       Fresno,CA       1.104       78       Huntsville,AL       -0.444         19       Fresno,CA       1.004       78       Huntsville,AL       -0.454         20       Scranton-Wilkes-BarreHazleton,PL       1.074       79       Pitisburgh,PA       -0.555         21       Santa RosoCA       1.008       81       Little RockAR       -0.664         22       Santa RosoCA       0.987       82       Tulsa,OK       -0.610         24       Taccom,WA       0.968       83       Richmond-Petersburg/VA       -0.626         25       San DiseCA       0.852       864       Jersey cit/VJ       -0.666 </td <td>11</td> <td>Santa BarbaraCA</td> <td>1.351</td> <td>70</td> <td>Oakland,CA</td> <td>-0.323</td>	11	Santa BarbaraCA	1.351	70	Oakland,CA	-0.323
13         Binghamton,NY         1.307         72         Ann ArborMI         -0.344           14         Orange CountyCA         1.297         73         Darytona BeachFL         -0.341           15         Bakersfield,CA         1.253         74         Nashville,TN         -0.410           16         Lincoln,NE         1.120         76         Syracuse,NY         -0.442           17         Springfield,MO         1.100         76         Syracuse,NY         -0.444           18         Allentown-Bethelhetem-Easton,PA         1.104         79         Pittsburgh,PA         -0.442           17         Appleton-OshkoshNeenah,WI         1.026         80         Sarcuston-Bradenton,FL         -0.555           22         Santa RosaCA         1.009         81         Little RockAR         -0.610           23         HickoryMorganton-Lenoir,NC         0.987         82         Tulso,OK         -0.655           25         San Luis ObispoCA         0.882         84         Jersey cityNJ         -0.645           24         Madison,WI         0.882         86         Fort MyersFL         -0.764           25         San Luis ObispoCA         0.881         88         Jacksonville,FL         <	12	Johnson CityTNVA	1.317	71	Macon,GA	-0.340
14         Orange CountyCA         1.299         73         Daytona BeachFL         -0.354           15         Bakersfield,CA         1.253         74         Noshwile,TN         -0.410           16         Lincoln,NE         1.194         75         Tampa-St. PetersburgFL         -0.412           17         Springfield,MO         1.107         77         Rackford,IL         -0.444           18         Allentown-Bethlehem-Easton,PA         1.014         78         Huntsville,AL         -0.463           05         Scranton-Wilkes.Barre-Hazleton,PA         1.074         79         Pittsburgh,PA         -0.517           20         Scrantor-Marganton-Lenoir,NC         0.987         82         Tules,OK         -0.604           21         Taccoma,WA         0.968         83         Richmond-Fetersburg/VA         -0.656           25         Son JoseCA         0.887         85         West Palm BeachFL         -0.764           27         Son Lis ObispoCA         0.882         86         Fort MyersfL         -0.781           28         Madison,WI         0.882         87         Shreveport-Bossier cityLA         -0.782           29         Reading,PA         0.818         B3         Jackson/IIIL	13	Binghamton, NY	1.307	72	Ann ArborMl	-0.346
15         Bakersfrield,CA         1,23         74         Nashville,TN         -0.410           16         Lincoln,NE         1,194         75         TarmpaSt: PetersburgFL         -0.415           17         Springfield,MO         1,107         76         Syracuse,NY         -0.442           18         Allentown-Bethlehem-Easton,PA         1,107         77         Rockford,IL         -0.444           18         Scranton-Wilkes-Barre-Hazleton,PA         1,074         79         Pittsburgh,PA         -0.415           17         Appleton-Oshkosh-Neenah,WI         1,026         80         Sarcuston-Bradenton,FL         -0.555           20         Sonta RosoCA         0.987         82         Tulsa,OK         -0.610           14         Tocoma/WA         0.988         83         Richmond-Petersburg,VA         -0.655           25         Son JoseCA         0.882         86         Fort MyersFL         -0.764           27         San Luis ObispoCA         0.882         86         Fort MyersFL         -0.778           28         Roding,PA         0.782         90         Galveston-Texas CityTX         -0.824           29         Roding,PA         0.784         91         Bergen-Petsscic,N1<	14	Orange CountyCA	1.299	73	Daytona BeachFL	-0.354
16       Lincoln,NE       1.194       75       Tompa-St. PetersburgFL       -0.415         17       Springfield,MO       1.100       76       Syracuse,NY       -0.444         18       Allentown-Bethlehem-Easton,PA       1.104       78       Huntsville,AL       -0.444         19       Fresna,CA       1.014       78       Huntsville,AL       -0.444         19       Fresna,CA       1.004       78       Huntsville,AL       -0.442         20       Scranton-Wilkes-BarreHazleton,PA       1.024       80       Sarasota-Bradenton,FL       -0.517         21       AppletonOshkoshNeenoh,WI       1.026       80       Sarasota-Bradenton,FL       -0.604         23       HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC       0.987       82       Tulsa,OK       -0.610         24       Tacoma,WA       0.682       84       Jersey cityNJ       -0.666         25       Sand IsogCA       0.882       84       Jersey cityNJ       -0.769         27       Reading,PA       0.828       87       ShreupersH       -0.789         28       Madison,WI       0.828       87       ShreupersH       -0.781         31       San DiegoCA       0.818       88	15	Bakersfield,CA	1.253	74	Nashville,TN	-0.410
17       Springfield,MO       1.120       76       Syracuse,NY       -0.442         18       Allentown-Bethlehem-Easton,PA       1.107       77       Rockford,IL       -0.444         17       Freson,CA       1.104       78       Huntsville,AL       -0.468         20       Scranton-Wilkes-Barre-Hazleton,PA       1.024       79       Pittsburgh,PA       -0.515         21       Appleton-Oshkosh-Neenah,WI       1.026       80       Sarasota-Bradenton,FL       -0.555         22       Santa RosoCA       0.987       82       Tulsa,OK       -0.610         23       HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC       0.987       82       Tulsa,OK       -0.610         24       Taccoma,WA       0.968       83       RichmondPetersburg,VA       -0.655         25       San JoseCA       0.882       84       Jersey cityNJ       -0.644         27       San Luis ObispoCA       0.828       86       Fort MyersFL       -0.764         28       Madison,WI       0.828       87       Shreveport-Bassier cityLA       -0.817         28       Sacthon-Lodi,CA       0.782       91       Bergen-Passoic,NJ       -0.814         29       Reading,PA       0.784       9	16	Lincoln,NE	1.194	75	TampaSt. PetersburgFL	-0.415
18         AllentöwnBethlehemEaston,PA         1.107         77         Röckford,IL         -0.444           19         Fresno,CA         1.104         78         Huntsville,AL         -0.468           20         ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton,PA         1.074         79         Pitisburgh,PA         -0.517           21         AppletonOshkosh-Neenoh,WI         1.026         80         Sarasota-Bradenton,FL         -0.552           25         Santa RosaCA         1.009         81         Little RockAR         -0.604           24         Tacoma,WA         0.968         83         RichmodPetersburg/VA         -0.655           26         Sant laseCA         0.887         85         West Palm BeachFL         -0.764           27         Roading,PA         0.888         87         Shreveport-Bossier cityLA         -0.789           28         Reading,PA         0.785         90         Galveston-Texas CityTX         -0.843           31         San DiegoCA         0.782         92         Fort HytersDityL         -0.845           32         Lexington,KY         0.782         92         Fort HaversDityL         -0.845           33         Lexington,KY         0.786         94         Pe	17	Springfield,MO	1.120	76	Syracuse,NY	-0.442
19         Freeno,CA         1.104         78         Huntsville,AL         -0.468           20         ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton,PA         1.074         79         Pittsburgh,PA         -0.517           21         AppletonOshkoshNeenah,WI         1.026         80         Sarasota-Bradenton,FL         -0.555           22         Santa RoseCA         1.009         81         Little RockAR         -0.604           24         Tacoma,WA         0.968         83         RichmondPetersburg,VA         -0.655           25         San JoseCA         0.882         84         Jersey cityNJ         -0.666           Colorado SpringsCO         0.867         85         West Palm BeachFL         -0.769           29         Reading,PA         0.818         88         Jacksonville,FL         -0.797           30         StocktonLodi,CA         0.781         89         Aktron,OH         -0.811           31         San DiegoCA         0.782         91         BergenRosaic,NJ         -0.845           31         Lexington,KY         0.782         92         Fort FireceFL         -0.847           34         FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR         0.778         93         AtlanticCape MayNJ	18	AllentownBethlehemEaston,PA	1.107	77	Rockford,IL	-0.444
20         ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton,PA         1.074         79         Pitsburgh,PA         -0.517           21         AppletonOshkoshNeenah,WI         1.026         80         Sarasota-Bradenton,FL         -0.555           25         Santa RosaCA         1.009         81         Little RockAR         -0.604           24         Tacoma,WA         0.968         83         Ricknon-Aretersburg,VA         -0.666           25         San JoseCA         0.882         84         Jersey cityNJ         -0.666           26         Colorado SpringsCO         0.867         85         West Palm BeachFL         -0.764           27         San Luis ObispoCA         0.828         87         Shreveport-Bossier cityLA         -0.782           28         Madison,WI         0.828         87         Shreveport-Bossier cityLA         -0.782           29         Reading,PA         0.811         89         Akron,OH         -0.811           31         San DiegoCA         0.782         91         BergenResaic,NJ         -0.845           32         Lexington,KY         0.782         93         AtlanticCape MayNJ         -0.846           33         Lexington,KY         0.736         94         Peo	19	Fresno,CA	1.104	78	Huntsville,AL	-0.468
21         AppletonOshkoshNeenah,Wi         1.026         80         Sarasofa-Bradenton,FL         -0.555           22         Sarata RosaCA         1.009         81         Little RockAR         -0.604           41         HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC         0.987         82         Tulss,OK         -0.610           24         Tacoma,WA         0.968         83         RichmondPetersburg,VA         -0.655           25         San JoseCA         0.882         84         Jersey cityNJ         -0.666           26         Colorado SpringsCO         0.867         85         West Palm BeachFL         -0.769           28         Madison,WI         0.828         87         Shreveport-Bossier cityLA         -0.782           29         Reading,PA         0.818         88         Jacksonville,FL         -0.797           30         StocktonLeoti,CA         0.782         91         BergenPassaic,NJ         -0.843           31         Lexington,KY         0.782         92         Fort PierceFL         -0.843           33         Lexington,KY         0.778         93         AtlanticCape MayNJ         -0.888           35         Corpus ChristTX         0.776         94         PeoriaPe	20	ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton,PA	1.074	79	Pittsburgh,PA	-0.517
22         Santa RosaCA         1.009         81         Little RockAR         -0.604           23         HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC         0.987         82         Tulsa,OK         -0.610           24         Taccoma,WA         0.968         83         RichmondPetersburg,VA         -0.655           25         San JoseCA         0.882         84         Jersey cityNJ         -0.666           26         Colorado SpringsCO         0.867         85         West Palm BeachFL         -0.764           28         Audison,WI         0.828         87         Shreveport-Bossier cityLA         -0.789           29         Reading,PA         0.818         88         Jacksonville,FL         -0.797           30         StocktonLodi,CA         0.811         89         Akron,OH         -0.811           31         San DiegoCA         0.782         91         BergenRossaic,NJ         -0.845           33         Lexington,KY         0.782         92         Fort NayNU         -0.848           34         FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR         0.778         93         AtlanticCape MayNU         -0.848           35         Corpus ChristitX         0.756         94         PorinPekin,IL	21	AppletonOshkoshNeenah,WI	1.026	80	SarasotaBradenton,FL	-0.555
23         HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC         0.987         82         Tulsa,OK         -0.610           24         Tacoma,WA         0.968         83         RichmondPetersburg,VA         -0.656           25         San JoseCA         0.882         84         Jersey cityNJ         -0.666           26         Colorado SpringsCO         0.867         85         West Palm BeachFL         -0.764           27         San Luis ObispoCA         0.828         87         ShreveportBossier cityLA         -0.782           29         Reading,PA         0.818         88         Jacksonville,FL         -0.773           30         StocktonLodi,CA         0.811         89         Akron,OH         -0.824           21         seattleBellevueEverett,WA         0.782         91         BergenRassaic,NJ         -0.847           31         Lexington,KY         0.782         92         Fort PierceFL         -0.848           35         Corpus ChristITX         0.756         94         PeoriaPekin,IL         -0.922           38         Ventura,CA         0.722         95         MontomothOcean,NJ         -0.930           36         Ventura,CA         0.553         99         Youngstown-Warren	22	Santa RosaCA	1.009	81	Little RockAR	-0.604
24         Tacoma,WA         0.968         83         RichmondPetersburg,VA         -0.655           25         San JoseCA         0.882         84         Jersey cityIV         -0.664           26         Colorado SpringsCO         0.867         85         West Palm BeachFL         -0.764           27         San Luis ObispoCA         0.852         86         Fort MyersFL         -0.769           28         Madison,WI         0.828         87         Shreveport-Bossier cityLA         -0.781           29         Reading,PA         0.818         84         Jacksonville,FL         -0.797           30         StocktonLodi,CA         0.811         89         Akron,OH         -0.811           31         San DiegoCA         0.782         91         BergenRassaic,NJ         -0.845           32         Lexington,KY         0.782         92         Fort PierceFL         -0.847           34         FayetHevilleSpiratoburgAnderson,SC         0.679         96         Fort LouderdolFL         -0.928           35         Corpus ChristTX         0.567         98         Montgomery,AL         -0.946           40         MeidesexSomersetHunterdon,NJ         0.540         100         Trenton	23	HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC	0.987	82	Tulsa,OK	-0.610
25         San JoseCA         0.882         84         Jersey cityNJ         -0.666           26         Colorado SpringsCO         0.867         85         West Palm BeachFL         -0.769           28         Madison,WI         0.828         87         ShreveportBossier cityLA         -0.789           29         Reading,PA         0.818         88         Jacksonville,FL         -0.797           20         StocktonLodi,CA         0.811         89         Akron,OH         -0.811           31         San DiegoCA         0.785         90         GalvestonTexos CityTX         -0.847           21         SeattleBellevueEverett,WA         0.782         91         Bergen-Passic,NJ         -0.847           34         FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR         0.778         93         AtlanticCape MayNJ         -0.888           35         Corpus ChristITX         0.756         94         PeoriaPekin,IL         -0.920           37         GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson,SC         0.677         96         Fort LauderdalFL         -0.922           38         Lancaster,PA         0.638         97         Grand RapidsMI         -0.946           40         Pensacolo,FL         0.557	24	Tacoma.WA	0.968	83	RichmondPetersburg.VA	-0.655
26         Colorado SpringsCO         0.867         85         West Palm BeachFL         -0.764           27         San Luis ObispoCA         0.852         86         Fort MyersFL         -0.782           29         Reading,PA         0.818         88         Jacksonville,FL         -0.797           30         Stockton-Lodi,CA         0.811         89         Akron,OH         -0.811           31         San DiegoCA         0.785         90         Galveston-Texas CityTX         -0.843           32         Seattle-BellevueEverett,WA         0.782         91         BergenPassaic,NJ         -0.844           33         Lexington,KY         0.782         92         Fort PierceFL         -0.847           34         FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR         0.778         93         AtlanticCape MayNJ         -0.848           35         Corpus ChristiTX         0.756         94         PeoriaPekin,IL         -0.940           39         AustinSan MarcosTX         0.567         95         Montrogmery,AL         -0.940           40         Pensacola,FL         0.553         97         Youngstown-Warren,OH         -0.954           41         MiddlesexSomerset-Hunterdon,NJ         0.540 <t< td=""><td>25</td><td>San JoseCA</td><td>0.882</td><td>84</td><td>Jersev citvNJ</td><td>-0.666</td></t<>	25	San JoseCA	0.882	84	Jersev citvNJ	-0.666
27         San Luis ObispoCA         0.852         86         Fort MyersFL         -0.769           28         Madison,WI         0.828         87         Shreveport-Bossier cityLA         -0.782           29         Reading,PA         0.818         88         Jacksonville,FL         -0.797           30         StocktonLodi,CA         0.811         89         Akron,OH         -0.821           31         San DiegoCA         0.782         91         BergenFassaic,NJ         -0.845           32         Seattle-Bellevue-Everett,WA         0.782         91         BergenTexos CityTX         -0.845           34         FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR         0.778         93         AtlanticCape MayNJ         -0.888           35         Corpus ChristiTX         0.756         94         PeoriaFekin,IL         -0.922           38         Vantura,CA         0.722         95         MonmouthCcean,NJ         -0.940           40         Pensacola,FL         0.557         96         Fort LauderdalFL         -0.922           39         Austin-San MarcosTX         0.567         98         Montgomery,AL         -0.946           40         Pensacola,FL         0.553         99         You	26	Colorado SprinasCO	0.867	85	West Palm BeachFL	-0.764
28         Madison,WI         0.828         87         Shreveport-Bossier cityLA         -0.782           29         Reading,PA         0.818         88         Jacksonville,FL         -0.797           30         StocktonLodi,CA         0.811         89         Akron,OH         -0.824           21         San DiegoCA         0.785         90         GalvestonTexas CityTX         -0.824           22         SeattleBellevueEverett,WA         0.782         91         BergenRossaic,NJ         -0.845           31         Lexington,KY         0.782         92         Fort PierceFL         -0.847           34         FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR         0.778         93         AtlanticCape MayNJ         -0.888           35         Corpus ChristTX         0.756         94         PeoriaRekin,IL         -0.928           38         Lancaster,PA         0.638         97         Grand RapidsMI         -0.930           39         AustinSan MarcosTX         0.567         98         Montgomery,AL         -0.944           41         MidelsexSomersetHunterdon,NJ         0.540         100         Trenton,NJ         -1.153           41         KansingEast LansingMI         0.415 <t< td=""><td>27</td><td>San Luis ObispoCA</td><td>0.852</td><td>86</td><td>Fort MversFL</td><td>-0.769</td></t<>	27	San Luis ObispoCA	0.852	86	Fort MversFL	-0.769
Product         Reading,PA         0.818         B8         Jacksonville,FL         0.7797           30         StocktonLodi,CA         0.811         89         Akron,OH         0.811           31         San DiegoCA         0.785         90         GalvestonTexas CityTX         0.824           32         SeattleBellevueEverett,WA         0.782         91         BergenPassaic,NJ         -0.845           33         Lexington,KY         0.782         92         Fort PierceFL         -0.847           34         FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR         0.778         93         AtlanticCape MayNJ         -0.888           36         Ventura,CA         0.722         95         MonmouthOcean,NJ         -0.922           38         Lancaster,PA         0.638         97         Grand RapidsMi         -0.924           41         MiddlesexSomersetHunterdon,NJ         0.567         98         Montgomery,AL         -0.946           42         Lubbock,TX         0.439         100         Trenton,NJ         -1.030           41         MiddlesexSomersetHunterdon,NJ         0.540         100         Trenton,NJ         -1.153           44         Fayetteville,NC         0.407         103 <td>28</td> <td>Madison.WI</td> <td>0.828</td> <td>87</td> <td>ShreveportBossier cityLA</td> <td>-0.782</td>	28	Madison.WI	0.828	87	ShreveportBossier cityLA	-0.782
30         StocktonLodi,CA         0.811         89         Akron,OH         0.811           31         San DiegoCA         0.785         90         GalvestonTexas CityTX         -0.824           32         SeattleBellevueEverett,WA         0.782         91         BergenPassaic,NJ         -0.847           34         FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR         0.778         93         AttanticCape MayNJ         -0.888           35         Corpus ChristiTX         0.756         94         PeoriaPekin,IL         -0.888           36         Ventura,CA         0.722         95         MonmouthOcean,NJ         -0.900           37         GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson,SC         0.679         96         Fort LauderdalFL         -0.922           38         Lancaster,PA         0.638         97         Grand RapidsMI         -0.936           40         Pensacola,FL         0.557         98         Montgomery,AL         -0.946           41         MiddlesexSomersetHunterdon,NJ         0.540         100         Trenton,NJ         -1.030           42         Lubbock,TX         0.439         101         Fort WaynelN         -1.141           43         LansingEast LansingMI         0.415	29	Readina.PA	0.818	88	Jacksonville.FL	-0.797
31         San DiegoCA         0.785         90         GalvestonTexas CityTX         -0.824           32         SeattleBellevueEverett,WA         0.782         91         BergenPassoic,NJ         -0.847           33         Lexington,KY         0.782         92         Fort PierceFL         -0.847           34         FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR         0.778         93         AtlanticCape MayNJ         -0.888           35         Corpus ChristiTX         0.756         94         PeoriaPekin,IL         -0.888           36         Ventura,CA         0.722         95         MonmouthOcean,NJ         -0.900           39         AustinSan MarcosTX         0.567         98         Montgometry,AL         -0.944           40         Pensacola,FL         0.553         99         Youngstown-Warren,OH         -0.954           41         MiddlesexSomersetHunterdon,NJ         0.540         100         Trenton,NJ         -1.130           42         Lubbock,TX         0.439         101         Fort WaynelN         -1.141           43         Lancaster,PA         0.307         104         Indianapolis,IN         -1.153           44         Fayetteville,NC         0.407         103	30	StocktonLodi,CA	0.811	89	Akron.OH	-0.811
32         SeattleBellevueEverett,WA         0.782         91         BergenPassaic,NJ         -0.845           33         Lexington,KY         0.782         92         Fort PierceFL         -0.847           34         FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR         0.778         93         AtlanticCape MayNJ         -0.888           36         Corpus ChristTX         0.756         94         PeoriaPekin,IL         -0.888           36         Ventura,CA         0.722         95         MonmouthOcean,NJ         -0.900           37         GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson,SC         0.679         96         Fort LauderdalFL         -0.922           38         Lancaster,PA         0.638         97         Grand RapidsMI         -0.930           39         AustinSan MarcosTX         0.540         100         Trenton,NJ         -0.946           40         Pensacola,FL         0.540         100         Trenton,NJ         -1.030           41         Middlesex-Somerset-Hunterdon,NJ         0.540         100         Trenton,NJ         -1.041           43         LansingEast LansingMI         0.415         102         Toeledo,OH         -1.153           44         Fayetteville,NC         0.407	31	San DiegoCA	0.785	90	GalvestonTexas CityTX	-0.824
33         Lexington,KY         0.782         92         Fort PierceFL         -0.847           34         FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR         0.778         93         AtlanticCape MayNJ         -0.888           35         Corpus ChristiTX         0.756         94         PeoriaPekin,IL         -0.888           36         Ventura,CA         0.722         95         MonmouthOcean,NJ         -0.900           39         AustinSan MarcosTX         0.567         96         Fort LauderdalFL         -0.922           38         Lancaster,PA         0.638         97         Grand RapidsMI         -0.930           39         AustinSan MarcosTX         0.567         98         Montgomery,AL         -0.946           40         Pensacola,FL         0.553         99         YoungstownWarren,OH         -0.954           41         Middlesex-SomersetHunterdon,NJ         0.415         100         Trenton,NJ         -1.141           42         Lubbock,TX         0.439         101         Fort WaynelN         -1.174           43         Eraerkeile,NC         0.407         103         DaytonSpringfiel,OH         -1.173           44         Fayetteville,NC         0.397         104	32	SeattleBellevueEverett,WA	0.782	91	BergenPassaic,NJ	-0.845
34         FayettevileSpringdaleRogers,AR         0.778         93         AtlanticCape MayNJ         -0.888           35         Corpus ChristiTX         0.756         94         PeoriaPekin,IL         -0.888           36         Ventura,CA         0.722         95         MonmouthOcean,NJ         -0.900           37         GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson,SC         0.679         96         Fort LauderdalFL         -0.923           38         Lancaster,PA         0.638         97         Grand RapidsMI         -0.946           40         Pensacola,FL         0.553         99         YoungstownWarren,OH         -0.954           41         MiddlesexSomerset-Hunterdon,NJ         0.540         100         Trenton,NJ         -1.030           21         Lubbock,TX         0.439         101         Fort WaynelN         -1.141           43         LansingEast LansingMI         0.415         102         Toledo,OH         -1.174           45         UticaRome,NY         0.397         104         Indianapolis,IN         -1.174           45         UticaRome,NY         0.330         105         BuffaloNiagara FallsNY         -1.204           46         DownportMolineRock IslandIAIL	33	Lexington,KY	0.782	92	Fort PierceFL	-0.847
35         Corpus ChristitX         0.756         94         PeoriaPekin,IL         -0.888           36         Ventura,CA         0.722         95         MonmouthOcean,NJ         -0.900           37         GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson,SC         0.679         96         Fort LauderdalFL         -0.920           38         Lancaster,PA         0.638         97         Grand RapidsMI         -0.930           39         AustinSan MarcosTX         0.567         98         Montgomery,AL         -0.946           40         Pensacola,FL         0.553         99         YoungstownWarren,OH         -0.954           41         MiddlesexSomersetHunterdon,NJ         0.540         100         Trenton,NJ         -1.030           42         Lubbock,TX         0.439         101         Fort WaynelN         -1.141           43         LansingEast LansingMI         0.415         102         Toledo,OH         -1.174           45         UticaRome,NY         0.397         104         Indianapolis,IN         -1.173           46         DavenportMolineRock IslandIAIL         0.330         105         BuffaloNiagara FallsNY         -1.204           47         CantonMassillon,OH         0.222 <td>34</td> <td>FavettevilleSprinadaleRoaers,AR</td> <td>0.778</td> <td>93</td> <td>AtlanticCape MayNJ</td> <td>-0.888</td>	34	FavettevilleSprinadaleRoaers,AR	0.778	93	AtlanticCape MayNJ	-0.888
36         Ventura, CA         0.722         95         MonmouthOcean, NJ         -0.900           37         GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson, SC         0.679         96         Fort LauderdalFL         -0.922           38         Lancaster, PA         0.638         97         Grand RapidsMI         -0.930           39         AustinSan MarcosTX         0.567         98         Montgomery, AL         -0.946           40         Pensacola, FL         0.553         97         YoungstownWarren, OH         -0.954           41         MiddlesexSomersetHunterdon, NJ         0.540         100         Trenton, NJ         -1.030           42         Lubbock, TX         0.439         101         Fort WaynelN         -1.141           43         LansingEast LansingMI         0.415         102         Toledo, OH         -1.173           44         Fayetteville, NC         0.407         103         DaytonSpringfield, OH         -1.174           45         UticaRome, NY         0.397         104         Indianapolis, IN         -1.204           47         CantonMassillon, OH         0.292         106         Baton RougeLA         -1.221           48         KalamazooBattle CreekMI         0.233 <td>35</td> <td>Corpus ChristiTX</td> <td>0.756</td> <td>94</td> <td>PeoriaPekin,IL</td> <td>-0.888</td>	35	Corpus ChristiTX	0.756	94	PeoriaPekin,IL	-0.888
37       GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson,SC       0.679       96       Fort LauderdalFL       -0.922         38       Lancaster,PA       0.638       97       Grand RapidsMI       -0.930         39       AustinSan MarcosTX       0.567       98       Montgomery,AL       -0.946         40       Pensacola,FL       0.553       99       YoungstownWarren,OH       -0.954         41       Middlesex-SomersetHunterdon,NJ       0.540       100       Trenton,NJ       -1.030         41       Labsock,TX       0.439       101       Fort WayneIN       -1.141         43       LansingEast LansingMI       0.415       102       Toledo,OH       -1.174         45       UticaRome,NY       0.397       104       Indianapolis,IN       -1.193         46       DavenportMolineRock IslandIAIL       0.330       105       BuffaloNiagara FallsNY       -1.214         47       CantonMassillon,OH       0.292       106       Baton RougeLA       -1.213         48       KalamazooBattle CreekMI       0.253       107       Mobile,AL       -1.223         49       MelbourneTitusvillePalm BayFL       0.233       108       BeaumontPort ArthurTX       -1.226	36	Ventura,CA	0.722	95	MonmouthOcean,NJ	-0.900
38         Lancaster,PA         0.638         97         Grand RapidsMI         -0.930           39         AustinSan MarcosTX         0.567         98         Montgomery,AL         -0.946           40         Pensacola,FL         0.553         99         YoungstownWarren,OH         -0.954           41         MiddlesexSomersetHunterdon,NJ         0.540         100         Trenton,NJ         -1.030           42         Lubbock,TX         0.439         101         Fort WaynelN         -1.153           43         LansingEast LansingMI         0.415         102         Toledo,OH         -1.174           43         LansingEast LansingMI         0.415         102         Toledo,OH         -1.174           45         UticaRome,NY         0.397         104         Indianapolis,IN         -1.174           45         DavenportMolineRock IslandIAIL         0.330         105         BuffaloNiagara FallsNY         -1.204           47         CantonMassillon,OH         0.292         106         Baton RougeLA         -1.211           48         KalamazooBattle CreekMI         0.253         107         Mobile,AL         -1.223           49         MelbourneTitusvillePalm BayFL         0.233	37	GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson,SC	0.679	96	Fort LauderdalFL	-0.922
39       AustinSan MarcosTX       0.567       98       Montgomery,AL       -0.946         40       Pensacola,FL       0.553       99       YoungstownWarren,OH       -0.954         41       MiddlesexSomersetHunterdon,NJ       0.540       100       Trenton,NJ       -1.030         42       Lubbock,TX       0.439       101       Fort WaynelN       -1.141         43       LansingEast LansingMI       0.415       102       Toledo,OH       -1.173         44       Fayetteville,NC       0.407       103       DaytonSpringfield,OH       -1.174         45       UticaRome,NY       0.397       104       Indianapolis,IN       -1.204         47       CantonMassillon,OH       0.292       106       Baton RougeLA       -1.211         48       KalamazooBattle CreekMI       0.253       107       Mobile,AL       -1.223         49       MelbourneTitusvillePalm BayFL       0.233       108       BeaumontPort ArthurTX       -1.226         50       Erie,PA       0.198       109       Kansas CityMOKS       -1.328       -1.328         51       Salinas,CA       0.198       110       New OrleansLA       -1.326         53       Hamilt	38	Lancaster,PA	0.638	97	Grand RapidsMI	-0.930
40       Pensacola,FL       0.553       99       YoungstownWarren,OH       -0.954         41       MiddlesexSomersetHunterdon,NJ       0.540       100       Trenton,NJ       -1.030         42       Lubbock,TX       0.439       101       Fort WaynelN       -1.141         43       LansingEast LansingMI       0.415       102       Toledo,OH       -1.153         44       Fayetteville,NC       0.407       103       DaytonSpringfield,OH       -1.174         45       UticaRome,NY       0.397       104       Indianapolis,IN       -1.204         46       DavenportMolineRock IslandIAIL       0.330       105       BuffaloNiagara FallsNY       -1.204         47       CantonMassillon,OH       0.292       106       Baton RougeLA       -1.211         48       KalamazooBattle CreekMI       0.253       107       Mobile,AL       -1.223         49       MelbourneTitusvillePalm BayFL       0.233       108       BeaumontPort ArthurTX       -1.227         50       Erie,PA       0.198       110       New OrleansLA       -1.328         51       Salinas,CA       0.198       110       New OrleansLA       -1.328         52       Tall	39	AustinSan MarcosTX	0.567	98	Montaomery.AL	-0.946
41       MiddlesexSomersetHunterdon,NJ       0.540       100       Trenton,NJ       -1.030         42       Lubbock,TX       0.439       101       Fort WaynelN       -1.141         43       LansingEast LansingMI       0.415       102       Toledo,OH       -1.153         44       Fayetteville,NC       0.407       103       DaytonSpringfield,OH       -1.174         45       UticaRome,NY       0.397       104       Indianapolis,IN       -1.193         46       DavenportMolineRock IslandIAIL       0.330       105       BuffaloNiagara FallsNY       -1.204         47       CantonMassillon,OH       0.292       106       Baton RougeLA       -1.211         48       KalamazooBattle CreekMI       0.253       107       Mobile,AL       -1.227         50       Erie,PA       0.198       109       Kansas CityMOKS       -1.236         51       Salinas,CA       0.198       110       New OrleansLA       -1.328         52       Tallahassee,FL       0.114       111       Miami,FL       -1.356         53       HamiltonMiddletown,OH       0.088       112       Jackson,MS       -1.385         54       Dutchess CountyNY	40	Pensacola,FL	0.553	99	YoungstownWarren,OH	-0.954
42       Lubbock,TX       0.439       101       Fort WaynelN       -1.141         43       LansingEast LansingMI       0.415       102       Toledo,OH       -1.153         44       Fayetteville,NC       0.407       103       DaytonSpringfield,OH       -1.174         45       UticaRome,NY       0.397       104       Indianapolis,IN       -1.193         46       DavenportMolineRock IslandIAIL       0.330       105       BuffaloNiagara FallsNY       -1.204         47       CantonMassillon,OH       0.292       106       Baton RougeLA       -1.211         48       KalamazooBattle CreekMI       0.253       107       Mobile,AL       -1.223         49       MelbourneTitusvillePalm BayFL       0.233       108       BeaumontPort ArthurTX       -1.227         50       Erie,PA       0.198       109       Kansas CityMOKS       -1.326         51       Salinas,CA       0.198       110       New OrleansLA       -1.328         52       Tallahassee,FL       0.114       111       Miami,FL       -1.356         53       HamiltonMiddletown,OH       0.088       112       Jackson,MS       -1.378         54       Dutchess CountyNY <td>41</td> <td>MiddlesexSomersetHunterdon,NJ</td> <td>0.540</td> <td>100</td> <td>Trenton,NJ</td> <td>-1.030</td>	41	MiddlesexSomersetHunterdon,NJ	0.540	100	Trenton,NJ	-1.030
43       LansingEast LansingMI       0.415       102       Toledo,OH       -1.153         44       Fayetteville,NC       0.407       103       DaytonSpringfield,OH       -1.174         45       UticaRome,NY       0.397       104       Indianapolis,IN       -1.193         46       DavenportMolineRock IslandIAIL       0.330       105       BuffaloNiagara FallsNY       -1.204         47       CantonMassillon,OH       0.292       106       Baton RougeLA       -1.211         48       KalamazooBattle CreekMI       0.253       107       Mobile,AL       -1.223         49       MelbourneTitusvillePalm BayFL       0.233       108       BeaumontPort ArthurTX       -1.227         50       Erie,PA       0.198       109       Kanasa CityMOKS       -1.326         51       Salinas,CA       0.198       110       New OrleansLA       -1.326         52       Tallahassee,FL       0.114       111       Miami,FL       -1.356         53       HamiltonMiddletown,OH       0.088       112       Jackson,MS       -1.385         54       Dutchess CountyNY       0.086       113       SaginawBay City MidlandMI       -1.371         55 <t< td=""><td>42</td><td>Lubbock,TX</td><td>0.439</td><td>101</td><td>Fort WaynelN</td><td>-1.141</td></t<>	42	Lubbock,TX	0.439	101	Fort WaynelN	-1.141
44       Fayetteville,NC       0.407       103       DaytonSpringfield,OH       -1.174         45       UticaRome,NY       0.397       104       Indianapolis,IN       -1.193         46       DavenportMolineRock IslandIAIL       0.330       105       BuffaloNiagara FallsNY       -1.204         47       CantonMassillon,OH       0.292       106       Baton RougeLA       -1.211         48       KalamazooBattle CreekMI       0.253       107       Mobile,AL       -1.223         49       MelbourneTitusvillePalm BayFL       0.233       108       BeaumontPort ArthurTX       -1.227         50       Erie,PA       0.198       109       Kansas CityMOKS       -1.326         51       Salinas,CA       0.198       110       New OrleansLA       -1.328         52       Tallahassee,FL       0.114       111       Miami,FL       -1.356         53       HamiltonMiddletown,OH       0.088       112       Jackson,MS       -1.385         54       Dutchess CountyNY       0.086       113       SaginawBay City MidlandMI       -1.398         55       RaleighDurhamChapel HillNC       0.061       114       Birmingham,AL       -1.711         56 <td>43</td> <td>LansingEast LansingMI</td> <td>0.415</td> <td>102</td> <td>Toledo,ÓH</td> <td>-1.153</td>	43	LansingEast LansingMI	0.415	102	Toledo,ÓH	-1.153
45       UticaRome,NY       0.397       104       Indianapolis,IN       -1.193         46       DavenportMolineRock IslandIAIL       0.330       105       BuffaloNiagara FallsNY       -1.204         47       CantonMassillon,OH       0.292       106       Baton RougeLA       -1.211         48       KalamazooBattle CreekMI       0.253       107       Mobile,AL       -1.223         49       MelbourneTitusvillePalm BayFL       0.233       108       BeaumontPort ArthurTX       -1.227         50       Erie,PA       0.198       109       Kansas CityMOKS       -1.326         51       Salinas,CA       0.198       110       New OrleansLA       -1.328         52       Tallahassee,FL       0.114       111       Miami,FL       -1.356         53       HamiltonMiddletown,OH       0.088       112       Jackson,MS       -1.385         54       Dutchess CountyNY       0.086       113       SaginawBay City MidlandMI       -1.398         55       RaleighDurhamChapel HillNC       0.061       114       Birmingham,AL       -1.711         56       Des MoinesIA       0.040       115       Newark,NJ       -1.772         57       Cha	44	Fayetteville,NC	0.407	103	DaytonSpringfield,OH	-1.174
46       DavenportMolineRock IslandIAIL       0.330       105       BuffaloNiagara FallsNY       -1.204         47       CantonMassillon,OH       0.292       106       Baton RougeLA       -1.211         48       KalamazooBattle CreekMI       0.253       107       Mobile,AL       -1.223         49       MelbourneTitusvillePalm BayFL       0.233       108       BeaumontPort ArthurTX       -1.227         50       Erie,PA       0.198       109       Kansas CityMOKS       -1.326         51       Salinas,CA       0.198       110       New OrleansLA       -1.328         52       Tallahassee,FL       0.114       111       Miami,FL       -1.356         53       HamiltonMiddletown,OH       0.088       112       Jackson,MS       -1.385         54       Dutchess CountyNY       0.086       113       SaginawBay City MidlandMI       -1.398         55       RaleighDurhamChapel HillNC       0.061       114       Birmingham,AL       -1.711         56       Des MoinesIA       0.040       115       Newark,NJ       -1.772         57       CharlestonNorth CharlestonSC       0.040       116       ClevelandLorainElyria,OH       -1.998	45	UticaRome,NY	0.397	104	Indianapolis,IN	-1.193
47       CantonMassillon,OH       0.292       106       Baton RougeLA       -1.211         48       KalamazooBattle CreekMI       0.253       107       Mobile,AL       -1.223         49       MelbourneTitusvillePalm BayFL       0.233       108       BeaumontPort ArthurTX       -1.227         50       Erie,PA       0.198       109       Kansas CityMOKS       -1.236         51       Salinas,CA       0.198       110       New OrleansLA       -1.328         52       Tallahassee,FL       0.114       111       Miami,FL       -1.356         53       HamiltonMiddletown,OH       0.088       112       Jackson,MS       -1.385         54       Dutchess CountyNY       0.086       113       SaginawBay City MidlandMI       -1.398         55       RaleighDurhamChapel HillNC       0.061       114       Birmingham,AL       -1.711         56       Des MoinesIA       0.040       115       Newark,NJ       -1.772         57       CharlestonNorth CharlestonSC       0.040       116       ClevelandLorainElyria,OH       -1.998         58       Knoxville,TN       0.018       117       MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI       -2.023         59	46	DavenportMolineRock IslandIAIL	0.330	105	BuffaloNiagara FallsNY	-1.204
48       KalamazooBattle CreekMI       0.253       107       Mobile,AL       -1.223         49       MelbourneTitusvillePalm BayFL       0.233       108       BeaumontPort ArthurTX       -1.227         50       Erie,PA       0.198       109       Kansas CityMOKS       -1.236         51       Salinas,CA       0.198       110       New OrleansLA       -1.328         52       Tallahassee,FL       0.114       111       Miami,FL       -1.356         53       HamiltonMiddletown,OH       0.088       112       Jackson,MS       -1.385         54       Dutchess CountyNY       0.086       113       SaginawBay City MidlandMI       -1.398         55       RaleighDurhamChapel HillNC       0.061       114       Birmingham,AL       -1.711         56       Des MoinesIA       0.040       115       Newark,NJ       -1.772         57       CharlestonNorth CharlestonSC       0.040       116       ClevelandLorainElyria,OH       -1.998         58       Knoxville,TN       0.018       117       MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI       -2.023         59       LakelandWinter HavenFL       0.017       118       Flint,MI       -2.051	47	CantonMassillon,OH	0.292	106	Baton RougeLA	-1.211
49       MelbourneTitusvillePalm BayFL       0.233       108       BeaumontPort ArthurTX       -1.227         50       Erie,PA       0.198       109       Kansas CityMOKS       -1.236         51       Salinas,CA       0.198       110       New OrleansLA       -1.328         52       Tallahassee,FL       0.114       111       Miami,FL       -1.356         53       HamiltonMiddletown,OH       0.088       112       Jackson,MS       -1.385         54       Dutchess CountyNY       0.086       113       SaginawBay City MidlandMI       -1.398         55       RaleighDurhamChapel HillNC       0.061       114       Birmingham,AL       -1.711         56       Des MoinesIA       0.040       115       Newark,NJ       -1.772         57       CharlestonNorth CharlestonSC       0.040       116       ClevelandLorainElyria,OH       -1.998         58       Knoxville,TN       0.018       117       MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI       -2.023         59       LakelandWinter HavenFL       0.017       118       Flint,MI       -2.051	48	KalamazooBattle CreekMI	0.253	107	Mobile,AL	-1.223
50         Erie,PA         0.198         109         Kansas CityMOKS         -1.236           51         Salinas,CA         0.198         110         New OrleansLA         -1.328           52         Tallahassee,FL         0.114         111         Miami,FL         -1.356           53         HamiltonMiddletown,OH         0.088         112         Jackson,MS         -1.355           54         Dutchess CountyNY         0.086         113         SaginawBay City MidlandMI         -1.398           55         RaleighDurhamChapel HillNC         0.061         114         Birmingham,AL         -1.711           56         Des MoinesIA         0.040         115         Newark,NJ         -1.772           57         CharlestonNorth CharlestonSC         0.040         116         ClevelandLorainElyria,OH         -1.998           58         Knoxville,TN         0.018         117         MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI         -2.023           59         LakelandWinter HavenFL         0.017         118         Flint,MI         -2.051	49	MelbourneTitusvillePalm BayFL	0.233	108	BeaumontPort ArthurTX	-1.227
51       Salinas,CA       0.198       110       New OrleansLA       -1.328         52       Tallahassee,FL       0.114       111       Miami,FL       -1.356         53       HamiltonMiddletown,OH       0.088       112       Jackson,MS       -1.385         54       Dutchess CountyNY       0.086       113       SaginawBay City MidlandMI       -1.398         55       RaleighDurhamChapel HillNC       0.061       114       Birmingham,AL       -1.711         56       Des MoinesIA       0.040       115       Newark,NJ       -1.772         57       CharlestonNorth CharlestonSC       0.040       116       ClevelandLorainElyria,OH       -1.998         58       Knoxville,TN       0.018       117       MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI       -2.023         59       LakelandWinter HavenFL       0.017       118       Flint,MI       -2.051	50	Erie,PA	0.198	109	Kansas CityMOKS	-1.236
52       Tallahassee,FL       0.114       111       Miami,FL       -1.356         53       HamiltonMiddletown,OH       0.088       112       Jackson,MS       -1.385         54       Dutchess CountyNY       0.086       113       SaginawBay City MidlandMI       -1.398         55       RaleighDurhamChapel HillNC       0.061       114       Birmingham,AL       -1.711         56       Des MoinesIA       0.040       115       Newark,NJ       -1.772         57       CharlestonNorth CharlestonSC       0.040       116       ClevelandLorainElyria,OH       -1.998         58       Knoxville,TN       0.018       117       MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI       -2.023         59       LakelandWinter HavenFL       0.017       118       Flint,MI       -2.051	51	Salinas,CA	0.198	110	New OrleansLA	-1.328
53       HamiltonMiddletown,OH       0.088       112       Jackson,MS       -1.385         54       Dutchess CountyNY       0.086       113       SaginawBay City MidlandMI       -1.398         55       RaleighDurhamChapel HillNC       0.061       114       Birmingham,AL       -1.711         56       Des MoinesIA       0.040       115       Newark,NJ       -1.772         57       CharlestonNorth CharlestonSC       0.040       116       ClevelandLorainElyria,OH       -1.998         58       Knoxville,TN       0.018       117       MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI       -2.023         59       LakelandWinter HavenFL       0.017       118       Flint,MI       -2.051	52	Tallahassee,FL	0.114	111	Miami,FL	-1.356
54Dutchess CountyNY0.086113SaginawBay City MidlandMI-1.39855RaleighDurhamChapel HillNC0.061114Birmingham,AL-1.71156Des MoinesIA0.040115Newark,NJ-1.77257CharlestonNorth CharlestonSC0.040116ClevelandLorainElyria,OH-1.99858Knoxville,TN0.018117MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI-2.02359LakelandWinter HavenFL0.017118Flint,MI-2.051	53	HamiltonMiddletown,OH	0.088	112	Jackson,MS	-1.385
55         RaleighDurhamChapel HillNC         0.061         114         Birmingham,AL         -1.711           56         Des MoineslA         0.040         115         Newark,NJ         -1.772           57         CharlestonNorth CharlestonSC         0.040         116         ClevelandLorainElyria,OH         -1.998           58         Knoxville,TN         0.018         117         MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI         -2.023           59         LakelandWinter HavenFL         0.017         118         Flint,MI         -2.051	54	Dutchess CountyNY	0.086	113	SaginawBay City MidlandMl	-1.398
56         Des MoinesIA         0.040         115         Newark,NJ         -1.772           57         CharlestonNorth CharlestonSC         0.040         116         ClevelandLorainElyria,OH         -1.998           58         Knoxville,TN         0.018         117         MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI         -2.023           59         LakelandWinter HavenFL         0.017         118         Flint,MI         -2.051	55	, RaleighDurhamChapel HillNC	0.061	114	Birmingham,AL	-1.711
57CharlestonNorth CharlestonSC0.040116ClevelandLorainElyria,OH-1.99858Knoxville,TN0.018117MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI-2.02359LakelandWinter HavenFL0.017118Flint,MI-2.051	56	Des MoinesIA	0.040	115	Newark,NJ	-1.772
58         Knoxville,TN         0.018         117         MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI         -2.023           59         LakelandWinter HavenFL         0.017         118         Flint,MI         -2.051	57	CharlestonNorth CharlestonSC	0.040	116	ClevelandLorainElyria,OH	-1.998
59 LakelandWinter HavenFL 0.017 118 Flint,MI -2.051	58	Knoxville,TN	0.018	117	MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI	-2.023
	59	LakelandWinter HavenFL	0.017	118	Flint,MI	-2.051

### **Legacy of Place**

High legacy of place costs are associated with lower growth rates in employment and population, higher business taxes, an older infrastructure including housing, a less favorable climate and higher crime rates. The metro cities in table 13 are ranked from the highest legacy of place costs (positive score) to the lowest legacy of place costs (negative score). Obviously, metro areas such as Tampa Bay and Orlando are associated with low legacy costs, and metro areas such as Jersey City and Utica, New York experience high legacy costs. Recognizing their shared heritage of industrialization during the first half of the twentieth century, it is not surprising that the four NEO metro areas are clustered together and are in the top third of the list of metro areas, indicating high legacy of place costs.

## Table 13. Rank of Sample Metropolitan Areas According to Legacy of Place

Rank	x Metro Area	Score	Rank	Metro Area	Score
1	Jersey City,NJ	3.337	60	Tacoma,WA	-0.256
2	UticaRome,NY	2.637	61	Bakersfield,CA	-0.284
3	ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton,PA	2.339	62	Santa BarbaraSanta MariaLompoc,CA	-0.296
4	Binahamton,NY	2.177	63	HamiltonMiddletown,OH	-0.297
5	Svracuse.NY	1.928	64	Colorado Springs.CO	-0.326
6	Rochester,NY	1.804	65	Boise City,ID	-0.333
7	BuffaloNiagara Falls.NY	1.551	66	Salt Lake CityOaden.UT	-0.360
8	Dutchess County.NY	1.546	67	San Luis ObispoAtascaderoPaso Robles.	CA-0.378
9	BergenPassaic.NJ	1.474	68	HickoryMorgantonLenoir.NC	-0.386
10	Erie.PA	1.309	69	GalvestonTexas City.TX	-0.393
11	Trenton.NJ	1.285	70	Jackson.MS	-0.426
12	Lincoln.NE	1.241	71	Macon.GA	-0.439
13	Pittsburgh,PA	1.229	72	BoulderLonamont.CO	-0.441
14	Reading.PA	1.229	73	EugeneSpringfield.OR	-0.445
15	DavenportMolineRock Island.IA-IL	1.202	74	AustinSan Marcos.TX	-0.460
16	AllentownBethlehemEaston.PA	1.193	75	RaleighDurhamChapel Hill.NC	-0.477
17	, PeoriaPekin,IL	1.085	76	Oakland,CA	-0.525
18	CantonMassillon,OH	0.992	77	AugustaAiken,GASC	-0.568
19	Migmi.FL	0.937	78	San Diego.CA	-0.571
20	AppletonOshkoshNeengh.WI	0.900	79	Little RockNorth Little Rock.AR	-0.576
21	York,PA	0.883	80	RichmondPetersburg,VA	-0.612
22	Des Moines,IA	0.862	81	New Orleans,LA	-0.614
23	Newark,NJ	0.861	82	BegumontPort Arthur.TX	-0.620
24	South Bend,IN	0.850	83	ShreveportBossierLA	-0.623
25	LansinaEast Lansina,MI	0.835	84	Huntsville,AL	-0.647
26	Toledo,OH	0.799	85	Fort WorthArlington,TX	-0.652
27	Madison,WI	0.772	86	Reno,NV	-0.655
28	MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI	0.729	87	StocktonLodi,CA	-0.663
29	Lancaster,PA	0.706	88	Knoxville,TN	-0.673
30	YoungstownWarren,OH	0.702	89	Ventura,CA	-0.674
31	Fort Wayne,IN	0.669	90	Fayetteville,NC	-0.689
32	Rockford,IL	0.660	91	Santa Rosa,CA	-0.710
33	ClevelandLorainElyria,OH	0.639	92	GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Point,NC	C -0.739
34	Spokane,WA	0.613	93	Modesto,CA	-0.782
35	SaginawBay CityMidland,MI	0.565	94	Tucson,AZ	-0.838
36	Springfield,MO	0.518	95	GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson,SC	-0.859
37	Akron,OH	0.4/0	96	Corpus Christi, IX	-0.868
38	DaytonSpringfield,OH	0.388	97	Forf Lauderdale,FL	-0.892
39	KalamazooBattle Creek,MI	0.359	98	Nashville, IN	-0.904
40	Grand RapidsMuskegonHolland,MI	0.309	99	MelbourneLitusvillePalm Bay,FL	-0.938
41		0.245	100		-0.976
42	AtlanticCape May, NJ	0.222	101	Birmingnam,AL Tallahasaa El	-0.981
43	VisaliaTulareFonerville,CA	0.202	102	Mart Pales Barrela Barre Paters El	-0.904
44	Lexington, NT	0.199	103	vvest Palm BeachBoca Katon,FL	-0.984
45	Johnson CityKingsponBrisioi, IN-VA	0.190	104	Sun Jose, CA Peneggela El	1 0 2 0
40	Favottovillo Springdalo Pogors AP	0.166	105	Orango County CA	-1.020
47	Fresho CA	0.134	100	Mobile Al	1 165
40	Middlesey Somerset Hunterdon NI	0.137	107	Charleston North Charleston SC	1 1 7 2
50	MonmouthOcean NI	0.043	100	Fort MyersCape Coral Fl	-1.172
51	ProvoOrem LIT	-0.008	110	Daytona Beach El	-1 199
52	Denver CO	-0.045	111	ValleioFairfieldNana CA	-1 226
53	Flint.MI	-0.074	112	LakelandWinter Haven Fl	-1.241
54	SeattleBellevueEverett WA	-0.147	113	SarasotaBradenton, Fl	-1.247
55	Tulsa,OK	-0.159	114	Fort PiercePort St. Lucie.FL	-1.250
56	, Oklahoma City,OK	-0.176	115	Jacksonville,FL	-1.251
57	,, Kansas City,MO-KS	-0.205	116	, Orlando,FL	-1.294
58	Salinas,CA	-0.207	117	TampaSt. Petersburg,FL	-1.302
59	Lubbock,TX	-0.256	118	Baton Rouge,LA	-1.401

#### **Income Equality**

Results show that income equality is positively associated with employment and output growth. Three of the four NEO metro areas are bunched at the top of the middle third of the distribution with respect to this factor, while Cleveland is in the lower part of the middle third. It is interesting that Cleveland is higher than San Diego with respect to income equality, while Akron is very close to Tampa Bay.

#### **Lessons from Selected Research: Income Equality**

A study completed by the Brookings Institution<sup>10</sup> focusing on economic inequality in the nation's 50 largest major metropolitan areas confirms that the 1990s were much better for cities and suburbs overall than the 1980s. In addition, the study reports that after a 30-year relative decline, central cities stopped falling behind their suburbs in per capita income during the 1990s. (Cleveland improved its standing since 2000). The researchers note that the national statistics, however, do not reflect the fact that significant gaps exist between cities and suburbs in the Northeast and Midwest. Yet suburban inequality in the Midwest and Northeast is less than in other regions of the country.

The study notes that scholars believe that the decline in concentrated poverty at the neighborhood levels may be due in part to a prosperous economy and tight job markets, which elevated distressed markets. The authors argue that the stubborn persistence of inequality even during the 1990s may be caused by municipal boundaries that continue to separate economic classes in the regional economy.

Spatial inequalities can generate pernicious regional competitiveness by fueling the abandonment of older parts of a region, accelerating sprawl and its costs, and making it difficult for broad coalitions to address these problems. Suburban exclusion inhibits economic productivity and labor mobility by separating lowincome workers from areas of job growth in the region. A geographic mismatch between lower-skilled jobs and affordable housing is evident in many metro areas. Another public policy raised in this study is that lower-income workers have inferior access to local public goods such as education, parks, and police because they reside in jurisdictions with few taxable resources and more demands for government expenditures.

<sup>10.</sup> Todd Swanstron, Colleen Casey, Robert Flack and Peter Dreier. Pulling Apart: Economic Segregation among the Suburbs and Central Cities in Major Metropolitan Areas October 2004 Brookings Institution.

## Table 14. Rank of Sample Metropolitan Areas According to Income Equality Score

Rank	Metro Areas	Score	Rank	Metro Areas	Score
1	ValleioFairfieldNapa.CA	2.479	60	MiddlesexSomersetHunterdon.NJ	0.126
2	AppletonOshkoshNeengh,WI	1.751	61	Orange County.CA	0.119
3	Fort Wayne,IN	1.409	62	GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson,SC	0.115
4	Grand RapidsMuskegonHolland,MI	1.348	63	South Bend,IN	0.113
5	Santa Rosa,CA	1.317	64	Reading, PA	0.110
6	MonmouthOcean,NJ	1.279	65	Oakland,CA	0.022
7	Colorado Springs,CO	1.144	66	AustinSan Marcos,TX	-0.022
8	Des Moines,IA	1.124	67	Erie,PA	-0.044
9	HamiltonMiddletown,OH	1.103	68	Knoxville,TN	-0.055
10	Tacoma,WA	1.093	69	KalamazooBattle Creek,MI	-0.086
11	Denver,CO	1.071	70	DaytonSpringfield,OH	-0.100
12	Lancaster,PA	1.061	71	RichmondPetersburg,VA	-0.150
13	FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR	1.054	72	Toledo,OH	-0.166
14	York,PA	1.045	73	Syracuse,NY	-0.179
15	Salt Lake City,UT	0.981	74	Johnson CityKingsportBristol,TN-VA	-0.202
16	MelbourneTitusvillePalm Bay,FL	0.961	75	Little RockNorth Little Rock,AR	-0.225
17	Ventura,CA	0.952	76	EugeneSpringfield,OR	-0.243
18	AtlanticCape May,NJ	0.914	77	UticaRome,NY	-0.276
19	HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC	0.887	78	West Palm BeachBoca Raton,FL	-0.278
20	SeattleBellevueEverett,WA	0.885	79	ClevelandLorainElyria,OH	-0.286
21	SarasotaBradenton,FL	0.885	80	RaleighDurhamChapel Hill,NC	-0.286
22	Orlando,FL	0.850	81	Oklahoma City,OK	-0.307
23	PeoriaPekin,IL	0.824	82	SaginawBay CityMidland,MI	-0.318
24	Boise City,ID	0.814	83	Huntsville,AL	-0.320
25	Dutchess County,NY	0.788	84	Spokane,WA	-0.329
26	Rockford,IL	0.742	85	San Diego,CA	-0.355
27	Kansas City,MO-KS	0.735	86	Pittsburgh,PA	-0.401
28	Daytona Beach,FL	0.733	87	BoulderLongmont,CO	-0.434
29	Lincoln,NE	0./20	88	Modesto,CA	-0.485
30	Indianapolis,IN	0.707	89	Flint,MI	-0.512
31	Jacksonville,FL	0.689	90	Lexington, KY	-0.520
32	Fayetteville,NC	0.682	91	Rochester,NY	-0.528
33	Ann Arbor,MI	0.654	92	CharlestonNorth Charleston, SC	-0.583
34	ProvoOrem,01	0.61/	93		-0.594
35		0.604	94	Newark,NJ	-0.6/6
36	Fort MeyersCape Coral,FL	0.585	95		-0./31
3/ 20	Reno, INV	0.556	90	ButtaloNiagaraNY Bimainahawa Al	-0.801
30	San Jose,CA	0.540	97	Birmingnam,AL	-0.821
39	Salinas,CA	0.540	70 00	AugustaAiken, GASC	-0.033
40	Fort Lauderdale, FL	0.010	99 100	Bedumont-Port Arthur, IX	-0.840
41	San Luis ObispoAlascaderoPaso,CA	0.497	100	Sania BarbaraSania MariaLompoc,CA	-0.000
42	DevensoroWinsion-SalemTight Fi, N	0 470	101	Mahila Al	-0.888
43	Fort Worth Arlington TX	0.477	102	Stockton Lodi CA	-0.711
44	Fort Pierce Port St. Lucia El	0.301	103	Montgomon Al	1.051
45	Scrapton Wilkes Barre, Hazleton PA	0.354	104	Corpus Christi IX	-1.000
40	Tampa-St. Petersburg El	0.330	105	Baton Rouge LA	-1.703
48	Akron OH	0.326	100	Tucson A7	-1 273
40	Madison WI	0.315	108	lersev City NI	-1 277
50	BergenPassaic NI	0.282	109	Pensacola Fl	-1 285
51	MilwaukeeWaukesha.WI	0.207	110	Macon GA	-1.696
52	Nashville,TN	0.201	111	Jackson.MS	-1,808
53	CantonMassillon,OH	0.198	112	ShreveportBossier City.LA	-1.956
54	LakelandWinter Haven FL	0.187	113	Lubbock.TX	-1.965
55	LansinaEast Lansina MI	0.169	114	Tallahassee,FL	-2.047
56	AllentownBethlehemEaston.PA	0.156	115	New Orleans,LA	-2.064
57	YoungstownWarren.OH	0.131	116	, Bakersfield,CA	-2.421
58	GalvestonTexas City,TX	0.130	117	VisaliaTularePorterville,CA	-2.799
59	Springfield,MO	0.129	118	Fresno,CA	-2.819

#### **Locational Amenities**

According to the statistical analysis, the locational amenities factor has one of the lowest relative contributions to the growth measures. It is interesting that amenities do not affect employment or output growth, but they do affect per capita income growth. Since locational amenities, as measured here, includes the arts, the transportation system, and good health facilities, it is not surprising that Cleveland ranked high in the top third since it has world-renown cultural institutions and health facilities.

#### **Lessons from Selected Research: Locational Amenities**

Researcher Paul Gottliebk studied whether amenities are an important factor in companies' location decisions. He writes that there is no evidence that firms react to "locational amenities" to the exclusion of other factors in their location decisions. He emphasizes that for high-tech firms the existence of agglomeration economies is perhaps the most important location factor. Citing work by Alberta Charney, Gottlieb notes that this finding is understandable. Charney argues that "amenities are not likely to be important location factors to firms selecting a site within a metropolitan area because employees and managers can live in pleasant surroundings and send their children to good schools while working in an area with none of these characteristics; employees will thus lengthen their commutes without penalty.

Gottlieb reviews the literature and offers the following policy recommendations. Jurisdictions should focus on basics like schools, environment, crime, and congestion. Amenities should be regional. Adjacent jurisdictions may wish to cooperate when emphasizing amenities. Tax transfer may assist a community that is implementing a residential amenity program, with the direct benefits of commercial development going to its neighbor. Finally, an amenities strategy should be sensitive to city size. That is, standards should be achieved relative to cities of comparable size. It would be impossible for Bozeman, Montana, to achieve the cultural level of New York City.

<sup>11.</sup> Paul Gottlieb. Amenities as Economic Development Tool: Is There Enough Evidence? Economic Development Quarterly, 1994.

### Table 15. Rank of Sample Metropolitan Areas According to Locational Amenities Score

Rank	Metro Area	Score	Rank	Metro Area	Score
1	Salt Lake CityOgden,UT	2.040	60	Fort Wayne, IN	0.050
2	San Diego,CA	1.542	61	CharlestonNorth Charleston, SC	0.029
3	Syracuse,NY	1.412	62	Bakersfield,CA	-0.006
4	BuffaloNiagara Falls,NY	1.409	63	LansingEast Lansing,MI	-0.012
5	Miami,FL	1.371	64	Binghamton,NY	-0.063
6	TampaSt. Petersburg,FL	1.320	65	Baton Rouge,LA	-0.086
7	Orlando,FL	1.291	66	Pensacola,FL	-0.096
8	MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI	1.267	67	Johnson CityKingsportBristol,TN-VA	-0.153
9	Kansas City,MO-KS	1.218	68	South Bend, IN	-0.192
10	Greensboro-Winston-Salem-High Pt,NC	1.182	69	CantonMassillon,OH	-0.192
11	Indianapolis,IN	1.178	70	ShreveportBossier City,LA	-0.210
12	ClevelandLorainElyria,OH	1.163	71	Mobile,AL	-0.247
13	Pittsburgh,PA	1.134	/2	FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR	-0.261
14	Rochester, NY	1.116	/3	AtlanticCape May,NJ	-0.269
15	SeattleBellevueEverett,WA	1.075	/4		-0.279
16	Orange County,CA	1.0/3	/5	AllentownBethlehemEaston,PA	-0.293
1/		1.057	/0 77	UticaKome, N f	-0.3/3
10	Most Palm Boach Boca Paton El	1.050	70	Saringfield MO	es,CA-0.376
17	New Orleans I A	1.052	70	Deutopa Boach El	-0.400
20	Tuccon AZ	1.030	79	Colorado Springs	-0.460
21	Nashville TN	1.040	81	Youngstown Warren OH	-0.470
22	Greenville-Sportanburg-Anderson SC	0.995	82	lancaster PA	-0.505
20	Denver CO	0.987	83	Tallabassee Fl	-0.537
25	Fort Lauderdale El	0.923	84	SagingwBay CityMidland MI	-0 541
26	DavtonSpringfield OH	0.919	85	Reading PA	-0.604
27	Santa BarbaraSanta MariaLompoc.C	A0.906	86	MelbourneTitusvillePalm Bay.FL	-0.636
28	OklahomaOK	0.888	87	HickoryMorgantonLenoir.NC	-0.675
29	Fort WorthArlington,TX	0.874	88	Rockford,IL	-0.712
30	Toledo,OH	0.795	89	Lubbock,TX	-0.717
31	SarasotaBradenton,FL	0.795	90	Corpus Christi,TX	-0.729
32	Tacoma,WA	0.769	91	Santa Rosa,CA	-0.820
33	Lexington,KY	0.657	92	Jackson,MS	-0.830
34	Spokane,WA	0.614	93	Huntsville,AL	-0.849
35	Newark,NJ	0.601	94	LakelandWinter Haven, FL	-0.954
36	KalamazooBattle Creek, MI	0.589	95	VisaliaTularePorterville,CA	-0.959
37	Little RockNorth Little Rock,AR	0.565	96	Flint,MI	-1.050
38	ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton,PA	0.549	97	Ann Arbor,MI	-1.060
39	AppletonOshkoshNeenah,Wl	0.527	98	BeaumontPort Arthur,TX	-1.075
40	Boise City,ID	0.520	99	Modesto,CA	-1.075
41	Oakland,CA	0.503	100	AugustaAiken,GASC	-1.125
42	Jacksonville,FL	0.492	101	Fort PiercePort St. Lucie, FL	-1.136
43	Birmingham,AL	0.447	102	Jersey City, NJ	-1.143
44	Akron,OH	0.405	103	BergenPassaic, NJ	-1.140
45	EugeneSpringfield, OK	0.399	104	Irenton, NJ Brava Orana LIT	-1.1/3
40	Grana RapidsMuskegonHollana,Mi	0.395	105	Venture CA	-1.220
47 18	Relaigh Durham Chanal Hill NC	0.304	100	Middlesov, Somerset, Hunterden NI	-1.240
40 10		0.373	107	Foresteville NC	-1.201
50	Richmond Petersburg VA	0.340	100	Monmouth Ocean NI	-1.3/8
51	Lincoln NF	0.204	110	Macon GA	-1.349
52	San Jose CA	0.257	111	Montgomery Al	-1.370
53	Des Moines, IA-IL	0.256	112	ValleioFairfieldNapa.CA	-1.416
54	Fort MeyersCape Coral. FL	0.190	113	Dutchess County, NY	-1.464
55	Fresno,CA	0.145	114	StocktonLodi,CA	-1.488
56	, DavenportMolineRock Island, IA-IL	0.138	115	, BoulderLongmont,CO	-1.652
57	Salinas,CA	0.134	116	HamiltonMiddletown,OH	-1.790
58	Madison,WI	0.128	117	York,PA	-1.914
59	Erie,PA	0.094	118	Galveston City,TX	-2.353

#### **Business Dynamics**

The business dynamics factor positively affects employment growth but does not affect per capita income growth. It has a negative effect on productivity growth. Considerable churning of the local economy is due to the openings and closings of small service firms, which in general pay low wages and are not very productive. At the same time, a high concentration of employment in manufacturing is associated with low growth, as indicated by its negative loading with the other two variables within the business dynamics factor. Canton and Akron rank in the top third of the distribution, while Cleveland and Youngstown are in the middle third (table 16).

#### **Lessons from Selected Research: Business Dynamics**

CHI Research in its report for the Office of Advocacy of the Small Business Administration<sup>12</sup> examined small patenting firms and the contribution made by technical change to long-term economic growth. The report provides evidence of the significant role that small firms play in today's economy and the importance of understanding the small firm role in innovative networks. Key findings include:

- Small firms produce more highly cited patents than large firms on average. Small firm patents are twice as likely as large firm patents to be among the 1 percent most cited patents, meaning that small firm patents are on average more technically important than large firm patents.
- The small firms are more productive in terms of patents per employees than larger firms. More productive firms are younger in age than the large firms, but are not new startups. Persistence is a guiding characteristic of small patenting firms and they may be thought of as "serial innovators," a term suggested by Leigh Buchanan at Inc. magazine.
- Small firm innovation is very closely linked to scientific research and is more high-tech or leading-edge.
- Small firm innovation is more extensively linked to outside technology while large firms build more of their own technology.
- Small firm innovators are more dependent on local technology and pursue leading-edge technical niches. The current interest at the local level in industry clusters focusing on innovation should assist disproportionately small firms because the local technological environment is an important resource for small firms.
- Any barriers to their participation in new technologies or exclusion from policy development concerning those technologies would be most unfortunate

<sup>12.</sup> Small Serial Innovators: The Small Firm Contribution To Technical Change, CHI Research, Inc. under contract number SBAHQ-01-C-0149 Release Date: February, 27 2003.

# Table 16. Rank of Sample Metropolitan Areas According to Business Dynamics Score

Rank	Metro Areas	Score	Rank	Metro Areas	Score
1	San JoseCA	2.635	60	Trenton,NJ	0.030
2	HickoryMorgantonLenoir,NC	2.273	61	Des MoinesIA	0.020
3	AppletonOshkoshNeenah,WI	1.558	62	Rochester,NY	0.007
4	Grand RapidsMI	1.520	63	San DiegoCA	-0.051
5	DaytonSpringfield,OH	1.436	64	Tucson,AZ	-0.137
6	GreenvilleSpartanburgAnderson,SC	1.363	65	Corpus ChristiTX	-0.137
7	Orange CountyCA	1.314	66	AustinSan MarcosTX	-0.139
8	Fort WaynelN	1.243	67	RaleighDurhamChapelNC	-0.144
9	Modesto,CA	1.229	68	Lubbock,TX	-0.147
10	StocktonLodi,CA	1.221	69	Santa BarbaraCA	-0.163
11	Rockford,IL	1.214	70	Lincoln,NE	-0.166
12	MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI	1.188	71	Springfield,MO	-0.172
13	South BendIN	1.093	/2	VisaliaIularePorterville,CA	-0.1/5
14	Lancaster, PA	1.086	/3	Binghamton,NY	-0.201
15	loledo,OH	1.058	/4	luisa,OK	-0.218
16	York,PA	1.024	/5		-0.238
1/	HamiltonMiddletown,OH	0.989	/0		-0.255
10		0.932	70	Mobile, AL	-0.276
19	Jonnson City INVA	0.8/9	/8 70	Keno,INV	-0.295
20	Additional CA	0.002	79	Reversfield CA	-0.340
21	Greenshoro Winston Salem High Pt NC	0.010	81	Seattle Bellevue Everett WA	-0.372
22	Flint MI	0.733	82	Pittsburgh PA	-0.379
23	Huntsville Al	0.735	83	Salt Lake Cityl IT	-0.373
24	Fort WorthTX	0.713	84	Fugenes-Springfield OR	-0.486
26	MiddlesexSomersetHunterdon NI	0.699	85	LakelandWinter HavenFl	-0 492
27	Favetteville.NC	0.691	86	Jacksonville.Fl	-0.532
28	Birminaham.AL	0.645	87	Orlando.FL	-0.536
29	FavettevilleSpringdaleRogers.AR	0.631	88	Tallahassee.FL	-0.551
30	SaginawBay City MidlandMI	0.630	89	Denver,CO	-0.551
31	CantonMassillon,OH	0.630	90	BergenPassaic,NJ	-0.557
32	Baton RougeLA	0.623	91	ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton,PA	-0.569
33	RichmondPetersburg,VA	0.597	92	Syracuse,NY	-0.597
34	Akron,OH	0.587	93	Newark,NJ	-0.610
35	Knoxville,TN	0.587	94	GalvestonTexas City TX	-0.617
36	Indianapolis,IN	0.580	95	BoulderLongmont,CO	-0.768
37	Reading,PA	0.552	96	Salinas,CA	-0.775
38	LansingEast LansingMl	0.532	97	Pensacola,FL	-0.828
39	AugustaAiken,GASC	0.509	98	Tacoma,WA	-0.829
40	Madison,WI	0.508	99	Boise City,ID	-0.855
41	PeoriaPekin,IL	0.505	100	TampaSt. Petersburg,FL	-0.934
42	Lexington,KY	0.465	101	Colorado Springs,CO	-0.936
43	DavenportMolineRock IslandIAIL	0.444	102	Santa Rosa,CA	-0.943
44	ClevelandLorainElyria,OH	0.424	103	Jersey City,NJ	-0.991
45	Beaumont-Port Arthur IX	0.303	104	Spokane, WA	-1.028
40	AllentownBethlenemEdston,PA	0.348	105	MelbourneIlfusvillePalm Bay, FL	-1.204 ablas CA 1.250
47	VallejoFalmelaNapa,CA	0.333	100	Julian Roma NIV	0DIES,CA-1.250
40	Kapaga CituMO	0.270	107	Dutchess County NY	-1.4/1
47 50	Macon GA	0.232	100	Provo Orem LIT	-1.4/3
51	Ann ArborMI	0.213	110	Fort Lauderdale Fl	-1.400
52	Ventura CA	0.173	111	Migmi El	-1 643
53	New Orleansl A	0.170	112	Davtona Beach.Fl	-1 862
54	YoungstownWarren OH	0.164	113	MonmouthOcean NI	-1 878
55	Jackson,MS	0.115	114	Fort PiercePort St. Lucie.FL	-1.898
56	ShreveportBossier CityLA	0.100	115	Fort MyersCape Coral.FL	-1.934
57	Fresno,CA	0.092	116	SarasotaBradenton,FL	-2.016
58	BuffaloNiagara FallsNY	0.091	117	, West Palm BeachBoca Raton,FL	-2.075
59	Erie,PA	0.079	118	AtlanticCape MayNJ	-2.181

#### **Urban/Metro Structure**

This factor positively affects employment and per capita income, in part because it reflects a less fragmented system of government. The NEO metro areas lie in the middle third of the distribution of metro areas with respect to this factor (table 17). Akron has the highest score, and Youngstown the lowest.

#### Lessons from Selected Research: Urban/Metro Structure

Researchers Pastor, Dreier, Grigsby, and Lopez-Garza have found that efforts to reduce central city poverty lead to an increase in regional income. Collecting data on 74 metropolitan areas in the U.S., these researchers conducted an econometric study focusing on how growth itself will lower poverty by raising the demand for labor.

"Doing good and doing well went hand-in-hand for regions. Community developers and low-income individuals can also benefit from connecting to the larger region, particularly to the emerging sectors of sustainable employment. Across the country, those neighborhoods involved in broad strategic alliances with other partners do better in generating income and resources. Community-based organizations that have understood emerging business clusters and trained their constituents for these new industries are yielding results in employment. And individuals who escape the negative effects of concentrated poverty, who link to a new set of broader networks, tend to earn higher wages regardless of where they eventually choose to live."<sup>13</sup>

They also conducted case studies on "best" performers in growth and equity, which included Boston, San Jose/Santa Clara, and Charlotte. The research attributes part of Boston's success to "first-source hiring agreements" as well as "linkage" policies that helped to insure that poorer communities would share in the housing and employment expansion of that decade. The Boston program did not assume that growth would be enough to reduce poverty. In addition, heavy emphasis was placed on integrating the Community Development Commissions into the process.

Charlotte, North Carolina, undertook an innovative antipoverty effort designed to concentrate development efforts on the oldest and poorest neighborhoods in the city and adopted a county "scattered-site" strategy to deconcentrate public housing and the poor. Charlotte's commitment to a multidimensional approach to poverty reduction is viewed by urban expert Neal Pierce as "equaled in few cities around the nation."

San Jose benefited by creating a culture of collaboration; Boston focused on using social equity measures during a high-growth period; and Charlotte linked cities, suburbs, and counties toward antipoverty efforts.

In San Jose, however, a center of electronics production, Joint Venture Silicon Valley Network devoted little time to incorporating poorer communities into its planning and concentrated redevelopment plans in the downtown. As a result, the area's growth was accompanied by an increase in central city poverty. According to Pastor et al. "The San Jose experience serves as a warning to community developers and antipoverty activists about the limits of approaches that exclusively focus on growth."

13. National Housing Institute, Shelterforce Online January/February 1998. Article is drawn from the 1997 study, Growing Together: Linking Regional and Community Development in a Changing Economy. By Manuel Pastor, Jr., Peter Dreier, Eugene Grigsby III, and Marta Lopez-Garza 1997.

# Table 17. Rank of Sample Metropolitan Areas According to Urban/Metro Score

Rank	Metro Area	Score	Rank	Metro Area	Score
1	Lincoln.NE	2.526	60	VisaliaTularePorterville,CA	-0.007
2	Corpus Christi,TX	1.983	61	AppletonOshkoshNeenah,WI	-0.008
3	Colorado Springs,CO	1.802	62	Trenton,NJ	-0.013
4	Lubbock,TX	1.610	63	HamiltonMiddletown,OH	-0.029
5	Jacksonville,FL	1.440	64	Grand RapidsMuskegonHolland,MI	-0.034
6	Des Moines,IA	1.382	65	Ventura,CA	-0.069
7	Reno,NV	1.287	66	Binghamton,NY	-0.141
8	Indianapolis,IN	1.151	67	UticaRome,NY	-0.154
9	Tulsa,OK	1.120	68	Fort MeyersCape CoralFL	-0.168
10	Jersey CityNJ	1.089	69	CantonMassillon,OH	-0.173
11	Montgomery,AL	1.084	70	Santa BarbaraSanta MariaCA	-0.173
12	Madison,WI	1.083	71	Fort PiercePort St. Lucie, FL	-0.174
13	AustinSan MarcosTX	1.078	72	FayettevilleSpringdaleRogers,AR	-0.203
14	San JoseCA	1.050	73	ProvoOrem,UT	-0.203
15	Fort WaynelN	1.041	74	Macon,GA	-0.237
16	Oklahoma City,OK	0.927	75	GreensboroWinston-SalemHigh Point	, NC -0.308
17	Springfield,MO	0.871	76	SeattleBellevueEverett,WA	-0.311
18	MilwaukeeWaukesha,WI	0.869	77	ClevelandLorainElyria,OH	-0.373
19	Fayetteville,NC	0.868	78	MelbourneTitusvillePalm Bay, FL	-0.375
20	Tucson,AZ	0.845	79	DaytonSpringfield,OH	-0.380
21	Toledo,OH	0.826	80	BoulderLongmont,CO	-0.387
22	San Diego,CA	0.729	81	SarasotaBradenton,FL	-0.396
23	Fresno,CA	0.709	82	Daytona Beach, FL	-0.411
24	Rockford,IL	0.643	83	AugustaAiken,GASC	-0.451
25	PeoriaPekin,IL	0.639	84	Reading,PA	-0.453
26	Salinas,CA	0.634	85	Rochester,NY	-0.485
27	VallejoFairfieldNapa,CA	0.607	86	Orlando,FL	-0.514
28	ShreveportBossier City,LA	0.595	8/	Birmingham,AL	-0.515
29	Jackson,MS	0.593	88	Salt Lake CityOgden,UT	-0.516
30	Spokane,WA	0.586	89	San Luis ObispoAtascaderoPaso Robl	es,CA-0.566
31	lallahassee,FL	0.56/	90	Knoxville, IN	-0.575
32		0.518	91	Oakland,CA	-0.5/5
33	Bakersfield,CA	0.501	92	YoungstownWarren,OH	-0.614
34		0.485	93		-0.655
33		0.470	94	Charlester, Nerth Charlester, FL	-0.003
30		0.400	93	Pichmand Potersburg VA	-0.000
37 20	Erie, FA Stackton Ladi CA	0.440	90 07	Fort Laudordalo, El	-0.736
20	SiockionLoui,CA	0.360	77		-0.733
39	Mahila Al	0.377	70 00	Lancasier, FA	-0.773
40	Raton Pougo I A	0.330	77 100	Dutchass County NY	-0.780
41	Kansas City MO KS	0.341	100	Atlantic Cape May NI	-0.770
42	Boise City ID	0.332	107	AllentownBethlehemFaston PA	-0.857
40	Huntsville Al	0.311	102	MonmouthOcean NI	-0.007
44	Fort Worth-Arlington TX	0.288	103	ScrantonWilkes-BarreHazleton PA	-0.927
46	Nashville TN	0.200	104	York PA	-0.971
47	Modesto CA	0.277	106	KalamazooBattle Creek MI	-1 026
48	Tacoma WA	0.258	107	Migmi Fl	-1 027
49	BegumontPort Arthur TX	0.230	108	Orange County CA	-1.052
50	DavenportMolineRock Island IA-II	0.159	100	Pensacola Fl	-1 102
51	GalvestonTexas City TX	0.153	110	Newark NI	-1 167
52	Svracuse NY	0 130	111	Pittsburgh PA	-1 167
53	Flint.MI	0.105	112	SagingwBay CityMidland, MI	-1.223
54	BuffaloNiagara Falls NY	0.070	113	HickoryMorgantonLenoir.NC	-1.345
55	LansingEast Lansing, MI	0.069	114	West Palm BeachFL	-1.354
56	RaleighDurhamChapel Hill, NC	0.062	115	BergenPassaic.NJ	-1.474
57	New Orleans, LA	0.061	116	Johnson CityKingsportBristol.TN-VA	-1.547
58	Santa Rosa,CA	0.061	117	GreenvilleSpartanburaAnderson SC	-2.214
59	EugeneSpringfield,OR	0.059	118	MiddlesexSomersetHunterdon,NJ	-3.765
	-				

The development of the dashboard indicators follows directly from the results of the factor analysis. Each of the dashboard indicators is constructed by applying weights to the most current available reading of the variables that loaded high on each of the factors. The weighted values are summed for all the variables associated with the factor. The weights are derived from the factor loadings. Finally, the result was indexed so that 2004 equals 100.<sup>14</sup>

To observe how the dashboard indicators may move in the future, we calculated the index values for the four metropolitan areas for 2003 and 2004. The results are shown in table 18. The more dramatic changes in the indexes occurred in the skilled workforce index. Akron's skilled workforce index moved downward by 4.9 percent and Canton's by 7.2 percent. The skilled workforce index improved slightly for Cleveland and Youngstown, but neither area exhibited an increase that approached the sample mean of 4.5 percent. Movements in most of the other dashboard indexes were more modest. All of the areas saw an improvement in their immigrant assimilation index and racial inclusion index. It is important to note that the areas' indexes for income equality, locational amenities, and business dynamics remained unchanged because annual updates of the data are not available.

Indexes		Skilled workforce	Urban assimilation	Racial inclusion	Legacy of place	Income equality	Locational amenities	Business dynamics	Urban/ metro structure
Akron	2003	105.2	99.7	99.7	100.1	100.0	100.0	100.0	99.7
	2004	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0
	Pct. Chg	-4.9%	0.3%	0.3%	-0.1%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.3%
Canton-Massillon	2003	107.7	98.4	99.5	100.1	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.7
	2004	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0
	Pct. Chg	-7.2%	1.6%	0.5%	-0.1%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	-0.7%
Cleveland-Lorain-Elyria	2003	99.2	99.3	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	99.5
	2004	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0
	Pct. Chg	0.8%	0.7%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.5%
Youngstown-Warren	2003	99.5	99.5	99.6	100.4	100.0	100.0	100.0	97.9
	2004	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0
	Pct. Chg	0.5%	0.5%	0.4%	-0.4%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	2.2%
National mean index	2003	95.7	100.4	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	99.8
	2004	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0
	Pct. Chg	4.5%	-0.4%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.2%

Table 18. Dashboard Indicators for 2003 and 2004 using 2004 Weights

14. We distinguish between indicators and indexes by designating factors comparing metropolitan areas as indicators and indicators computed over time as indexes. The reason for the distinction is that to track the indicators over time, we must set the indicator to a specific value in a specific year so that we can observe how the value changes over time. The convention is to set the value to 100 in a particular year. We chose 2004 as the reference year but the decision is arbitrary. In contrast, the values of the indicators recorded in the tables ranking the metropolitan areas have been computed such that the sample mean equals zero, with no reference to changes over time. Therefore, we make the distinction between indicator and index. It is also possible to track the component variables of each of the eight indicators. While doing so loses the richness of the measure, it may be useful at times in order to follow the progress of certain initiatives carried out in a region or metropolitan area. For instance, if a region decides that increasing the percentage of residents with a bachelor's degree is important for improving regional economic growth, then focusing on that variable will help to track the progress of that initiative. Another possibility is that a region may decide that promoting high-tech startups is important, which follows from our broader factors. If so, a region may decide to track statistics on high-tech startups. It may be the case that such statistics are not available for all metropolitan areas from a common source, but even if the coverage is limited, it could be an important indicator for tracking that initiative.

These eight dashboard indicators provide the means to track changes in the four NEO metropolitan areas of factors that have been shown to be strongly correlated with the region's economic performance. Nevertheless, these indicators have one important limitation. Many of the variables used cannot be updated on an annual basis. For instance, two of the three variables used in the racial inclusion indicator cannot be updated until the 2010 Census. Most of the variables used in the locational amenities indicator come from a publication which is updated only periodically. While the advisory committee at this time has decided not to explore efforts to find alternative data series, this decision should be reviewed periodically so that the indexes are available on a timely basis.

Nonetheless, proxies, which may be available more frequently, could be substituted for some of these variables. For instance, the variables used to estimate racial inclusion are collected only by the decennial census, so they are available once every ten years. One possible alternative is to use the racial composition of school districts within the region. These figures may not be available on a national basis, but they should be available on a metropolitan basis, particularly if there is sufficient interest in the area to encourage the school districts to supply such information. This proxy may not be as comprehensive in its coverage of the population as the overall census, but it may prove useful in tracking progress on a more frequent basis.

Another important variable that is not collected on a timely basis is the gross change in employment due to the openings, closings, expansions, and contractions of local businesses. This variable, along with the percentage of businesses employing fewer than 20 workers, proved to be highly correlated with employment growth. The variable used in the analysis was taken from a special run of Census data. Replicating this on an annual or biannual basis may prove to be too costly, especially for the entire sample of metropolitan areas used in this analysis. The College of Urban Affairs of Cleveland State University receives data on individual enterprises on an ongoing basis. These data can be used to construct business dynamics similar to those computed for the indicators, but only for metropolitan areas within Ohio. At some future date,

the Bureau of Labor Statistics may provide similar statistics for metropolitan areas throughout the country.

With respect to the display of the information, it is important that the indicators are framed within a broader context, as emphasized in the description of the development of the dashboard indicators. Displaying the indicators without such a framework renders them less valuable for conveying an understanding of the regional growth process to the broader community, for informing the discourse on regional policy and strategy, and for monitoring the progress of the region.

# VII. Lessons for the NEO Economy

The indicators are constructed from a large set of variables that reflect the multidimensional nature of the regional economic growth process. The indicators combine these variables into eight factors that, when related to regional measures of economic growth, identify the factors that are most highly correlated with the regional economic growth. Several key lessons emerge from this analysis for the NEO economy.

The first lesson is that no one factor is the key ingredient of economic growth. It is tempting to try to identify a "silver bullet" that will turn a slowmoving economy based on traditional industries into a vibrant, high-performance one based on cutting-edge, high-tech industries. As the indicators suggest, many factors come into play. These factors include attributes associated with a knowledge economy, such as a skilled workforce and innovative and entrepreneurial businesses. They also include an attitude of being open to new ideas and to new ways of doing things, as reflected in accepting new immigrants and the nurturing of businesses owned by minority and ethnic groups. Additional factors also include societal goals and quality of life attributes.

The second lesson is that a skilled workforce and strong business dynamics are most highly correlated with the four measures of regional economic growth. For growth in output, per capita income, and productivity, a skilled workforce topped the list of indicators.<sup>15</sup>For employment growth, the business dynamics indicator was the most influential factor.

<sup>15.</sup> Our results showing the high correlation between skilled workforce and the three measures of regional economic growth are consistent with the results of a recent report by the Federal Reserve Bank of Cleveland (forthcoming). Their analysis involved a more sophisticated approach that sought to determine the causal relationship between variables related to a skilled workforce, namely, graduation rates and patents, and per capita income. They found that college graduation rates and patents dominate the magnitude and statistical significance of all the variables included in their regression. When we relate the individual variables associated with the skilled workforce indicator to per capita income growth, we also find that the percentage with a bachelor's degree and patents are the most influential variables in the regression.

The third lesson is that the pursuit of societal goals, such as racial inclusion and lower income dispersion, are very compatible with economic growth. In fact, the analysis shows that those regions with a higher degree of racial inclusion and lower income dispersion have higher regional economic growth, particularly as measured by output growth.

The fourth lesson is that locational amenities are not as important to regional growth as the other factors included in the analysis. Investing in cultural and recreational amenities may enhance the attractiveness of the region for more highly skilled workers, but focusing on amenities alone is not enough to ensure future economic growth. Other factors must be in place for growth to happen.

The fifth lesson is that an area's regional economic growth is influenced by its history, and this is reflected in the indicator referred to as "legacy of place." Those areas that have a long history of housing traditional industries face competitiveness pressure from lower-cost regions and from newer, more robust industries, and they typically experience slower growth. These same regions may also be burdened with social costs, such as higher unemployment and the need for public assistance, social ills such as higher crime rates, and the higher costs and taxes associated with supporting services to meet these needs.

One of the priorities facing the NEO region is to find ways to increase output and productivity. Output growth of the four metropolitan areas in the NEO region lags behind the average growth of the 118 comparison metro areas. The Cleveland-Lorain-Elyria metropolitan area experienced the highest growth rate in output between 1994 and 2004 among the four metro areas but it still fell below the nation's average growth by 12 percentage points – 26.3 percent compared with an average of 38.8 percent. Akron was a close second at 24.1 percent, followed by Canton-Massillon at 21.4 percent and Youngstown-Warren at 3.1 percent during the 10-year period we studied. The NEO metropolitan areas fared slightly better with respect to productivity growth. The Cleveland metro area was above the average rate for the 118 metropolitan areas, posting a 22.6 percent increase between 1994 and 2004 compared to an average rate of 18.9 percent. Canton-Massillon was next with 18.1 percent, followed by Akron at 16.5 percent, and Youngstown-Warren at 6.8 percent.

According to our analysis, the skilled workforce factor is most highly correlated with output growth and productivity growth. Therefore, those metropolitan areas with a more highly skilled workforce typically experience higher output and productivity growth.

The skilled workforce indicator comprises seven variables. However, when statistically related to output growth and productivity growth, two variables stand out in their correlation with these two growth measures. These variables are the percentage of the workforce with a bachelor's degree and the number of patents per employee. Three of the four metropolitan areas in the NEO region are below the sample average in the percentage of people with bachelor's degrees. Youngstown-Warren has the lowest proportion of college-educated workers with 10.3 percent, Canton-Massillon is slightly higher at 11.5 percent, and Cleveland is next at 14.9 percent. Only Akron is above average, at 16.2 percent, but only by a percentage point.

The four metropolitan areas exhibit similar rankings for patents. Youngstown, Canton, and Cleveland are all below the sample average, and Akron is above average. In comparison, Austin is sixth with respect to patents per employee; with over twice as many as Akron and nearly nine times as many as Youngstown.

It is clear that the NEO region lags behind other metropolitan areas with respect to two important factors affecting growth in output and productivity-college education and patents. Boosting these two factors can lead to future economic growth. However, it may require more than simply increasing these two factors. Future growth requires that a college education leads to skills demanded by expanding and innovative industries. It also requires that there is the necessary research and development, conducted either at the industry or university levels or both, to generate new ideas that can lead to new products and processes. Such skill levels and technical expertise can also be reflected in the concentration of occupations with high skill requirements, such as technical, managerial, and professional occupations. However, higher skills and advanced technology do not necessarily lead to a specific industrial structure. Achieving a higher level of workforce skills does not dictate that a region's economy becomes concentrated in biotechnology or the latest technology breakthrough. Rather, it allows a region to pursue different paths and adjust more readily to changes in the economic environment. In fact, a more skilled workforce may lead to greater diversity across regions' industrial bases because greater workforce skills position a region to pursue different economic paths. The point is that a skilled workforce is manifested along several dimensions, and it is up to the local area policymakers to determine, through additional investigation and discussion, the key areas that need attention.

Finally, the fifth lesson from the analysis is that older metropolitan areas, such as those in the NEO region, suffer from high legacy of place costs. Their legacy of aging industries and infrastructure and the concomitant social needs can impede future growth. The legacy of place costs indicator captures attributes such as an aging infrastructure, fragmented governmental structure, social assistance needs, and an unfavorable climate. All four metropolitan areas in the NEO region are in the upper third with respect to legacy of place costs. For instance, Canton-Massillon is 18th highest among the 118 metropolitan areas in the sample with respect to legacy of place costs. Comparing that ranking with its ranking of 91 with respect to output growth illustrates the potential drag on output growth. While the legacy of place cost indicator is not the most highly correlated factor with respect to output growth, its modest effect on output suggests that metropolitan areas in this situation must work even harder to overcome their historical inertia.

### **VIII.** Conclusion

The dashboard indicators developed in this paper are based upon an analytical framework that provides a comprehensive perspective of the multidimensional nature of regional growth but at the same time identifies a manageable set of factors that are correlated with several measures of regional growth. Such an approach captures the richness of the regional growth process while offering the ability to focus on factors that are key to future growth.

The eight dashboard indicators are distilled from a set of 40 variables that capture a broad set of attributes characterizing 118 metropolitan areas. The resulting indicators reflect not only economic factors but also social attributes and physical and cultural amenities. The analysis shows that both economic and noneconomic factors contribute to regional growth.

The analysis offers a profile of growing regions. Regions that have experienced higher-than-average growth are associated with a skilled workforce that can apply their skills to productive uses such as patent development, which results in high productivity in emerging sectors such as information. High growth regions also are related to a dynamic economy which experiences high levels of both openings and closings of establishments, so firms with new ideas and innovations are replacing older, less productive ones. High growth regions also tend to score high on social issues such as promoting racial inclusion and income equality, and they benefit from an urban and government structure that meets the needs of business as well as its citizens. Yet, regions must come to terms with their past. Older regions must deal with legacy costs, including aging infrastructure, a high demand for social services, and the cost through higher taxes needed to address these issues. These issues can be overcome, but as shown in the anecdotes presented in sidebars, it is through finding new ways to build on their assets and resources and not through holding on to past practices and institutions.

Five lessons follow from the analysis:

- No one factor determines whether a region's economy grows or not
- Factors vary in the degree to which they contribute to regional economic growth
- Regions can pursue societal goals without jeopardizing their economic growth
- Locational amenities are not as important to regional growth as the other factors included in the analysis, such as a skilled workforce
- An area's regional economic growth is influenced by its history.

The analysis also reveals that a skilled workforce contributes the most to

growth in output, per capita income, and productivity. Therefore, the analysis suggests that a focused regional economic development agenda should give considerable attention to issues related to improving the skill level of the workforce through providing greater opportunities for residents to attend college and through attracting more college-educated residents. Another dimension of a skilled workforce, as reflected in the indicator, is putting these skills to productive use, such as assuring that the skills attained in school are those needed by industries, that job opportunities for college-educated workers are available in the region, and that sufficient resources are devoted to research and development so the newly acquired knowledge can be put to work.

To conclude, our evidence-based approach of developing indicators offers insights for local stakeholders to structure an economic development agenda that focuses on issues and initiatives that are directly related to growth. Furthermore, the indicators, by encompassing not only important economic factors but also societal values and quality of life attributes, allow the region's stakeholders to track their progress in transforming the region not only in terms of its economic growth but also with respect to improving its civil society.

# **Special Acknowledgement**

We want to give a special thanks to members of the Northeast Ohio Regional Economic Indicators Advisory Group, who actively participated during all stages of the development of this report:

Ziona Austrian	Cleveland State University
Mary Scott Cebul	The Fund for Our Economic Future
Edward Hill	Cleveland State University
Robert Jaquay	The Fund for Our Economic Future
Steven Minter	Cleveland State University
Hunter Morrison	Youngstown State University
Mark Schweitzer	Federal Reserve Bank of Cleveland
James Shanahan	Lorain Community College
Mark Sniderman	Federal Reserve Bank of Cleveland
Bradley Whitehead	The Fund for Our Economic Future

# Appendix A Primary Source Data Behind the Variables Used for Factor Analysis

I. Productivity/innovation         1. Productivity of the information sector         2. Productivity of the manufacturing sector         3. Number of patents per employee         4. Size of establishments         5. Proprietor's share of total income         6. Employment dynamics as measured by the sum of jobs created due to startups and expansions plus the jobs lost due to closings and contractions divided by base employment         7. University research and development         1. Degrees (percentage holding bachelor's and graduate degrees)         2. Research universities located in the metropolitan area
1. Productivity of the information sector       Economy.com         2. Productivity of the manufacturing sector       Economy.com         3. Number of patents per employee       U.S. Patent & Trademark Office & BEA employment         4. Size of establishments       U.S. Census Bureau, County Business Patterns         5. Proprietor's share of total income       Bureau of Economic Analysis         6. Employment dynamics as measured by the sum of jobs created due to startups and expansions plus the jobs lost due to closings and contractions divided by base employment       W.E. Upjohn Institute. Based on special-run Census         7. University research and development       National Science Foundation         1. Degrees (percentage holding bachelor's and graduate degrees)       U.S. Census Bureau         2. Research universities located in the metropolitan area       Savageau, D. (2000) Places Rated Almanac. Defined by colleges with over 15,000 enrollmen
2. Productivity of the manufacturing sector       Economy.com         3. Number of patents per employee       U.S. Patent & Trademark Office & BEA employment         4. Size of establishments       U.S. Census Bureau, County Business Patterns         5. Proprietor's share of total income       Bureau of Economic Analysis         6. Employment dynamics as measured by the sum of jobs created due to startups and expansions plus the jobs lost due to closings and contractions divided by base employment       W.E. Upjohn Institute. Based on special-run Census         7. University research and development       National Science Foundation         1. Degrees (percentage holding bachelor's and graduate degrees)       U.S. Census Bureau         2. Research universities located in the metropolitan area       Savageau, D. (2000) Places Rated Almanac. Defined by colleges with over 15,000 enrollmen
3. Number of patents per employee       U.S. Patent & Trademark Office & BEA employment         4. Size of establishments       U.S. Census Bureau, County Business Patterns         5. Proprietor's share of total income       Bureau of Economic Analysis         6. Employment dynamics as measured by the sum of jobs created due to startups and expansions plus the jobs lost due to closings and contractions divided by base employment       W.E. Upjohn Institute. Based on special-run Census         7. University research and development       National Science Foundation <b>II. Education II. Education</b> 2. Research universities located in the metropolitan area       Savageau, D. (2000) Places Rated Almanac. Defined by colleges with over 15,000 enrollmen
employment         4. Size of establishments       U.S. Census Bureau, County Business Patterns         5. Proprietor's share of total income       Bureau of Economic Analysis         6. Employment dynamics as measured by the sum of jobs created due to startups and expansions plus the jobs lost due to closings and contractions divided by base employment       W.E. Upjohn Institute. Based on special-run Census         7. University research and development       National Science Foundation <b>II. Education</b> Image: Consus Bureau         2. Research universities located in the metropolitan area       Savageau, D. (2000) Places Rated Almanac. Defined by colleges with over 15,000 enrollmen
4. Size of establishments       U.S. Census Bureau, County Business Patterns         5. Proprietor's share of total income       Bureau of Economic Analysis         6. Employment dynamics as measured by the sum of jobs created due to startups and expansions plus the jobs lost due to closings and contractions divided by base employment       W.E. Upjohn Institute. Based on special-run Census         7. University research and development       National Science Foundation <b>II. Education</b> Image: Consus Bureau         2. Research universities located in the metropolitan area       Savageau, D. (2000) Places Rated Almanac. Defined by colleges with over 15,000 enrollmen
5. Proprietor's share of total income       Bureau of Economic Analysis         6. Employment dynamics as measured by the sum of jobs created due to startups and expansions plus the jobs lost due to closings and contractions divided by base employment       W.E. Upjohn Institute. Based on special-run Census         7. University research and development       National Science Foundation         II. Education       I. Degrees (percentage holding bachelor's and graduate degrees)       U.S. Census Bureau         2. Research universities located in the metropolitan area       Savageau, D. (2000) Places Rated Almanac. Defined by colleges with over 15,000 enrollmen
6. Employment dynamics as measured by the sum of jobs created due to startups and expansions plus the jobs lost due to closings and contractions divided by base employment       W.E. Upjohn Institute. Based on special-run Census         7. University research and development       National Science Foundation         1. Degrees (percentage holding bachelor's and graduate degrees)       U.S. Census Bureau         2. Research universities located in the metropolitan area       Savageau, D. (2000) Places Rated Almanac. Defined by colleges with over 15,000 enrollmen
due to startups and expansions plus the jobs lost due to closings and contractions divided by base employment       Census         7. University research and development       National Science Foundation         II. Education       Image: Census Bureau         2. Research universities located in the metropolitan area       Savageau, D. (2000) Places Rated Almanac. Defined by colleges with over 15,000 enrollmen
and contractions divided by base employment       National Science Foundation         7. University research and development       National Science Foundation         II. Education       U.S. Census Bureau         2. Research universities located in the metropolitan area       Savageau, D. (2000) Places Rated Almanac. Defined by colleges with over 15,000 enrollment
7. University research and development       National Science Foundation         II. Education       U.S. Census Bureau         1. Degrees (percentage holding bachelor's and graduate degrees)       U.S. Census Bureau         2. Research universities located in the metropolitan area       Savageau, D. (2000) Places Rated Almanac. Defined by colleges with over 15,000 enrollmen
II. Education           1. Degrees (percentage holding bachelor's and graduate degrees)         U.S. Census Bureau           2. Research universities located in the metropolitan area         Savageau, D. (2000) Places Rated Almanac. Defined by colleges with over 15,000 enrollment
1. Degrees (percentage holding bachelor's and graduate degrees)       U.S. Census Bureau         2. Research universities located in the metropolitan area       Savageau, D. (2000) Places Rated Almanac. Defined by colleges with over 15,000 enrollmen
2. Research universities located in the metropolitan area Savageau, D. (2000) Places Rated Almanac. Defined by colleges with over 15,000 enrollmen
Defined by colleges with over 15,000 enrollmen
and granting advanced degrees.
3. Occupations with high education requirements (professional, U.S. Census Bureau
managment, and technical)
4. Composite measure of skill content of workers Bureau of Labor Statistics
III. Racial Inclusion
1. Percentage African American U.S. Census Bureau
2. Percentage Hispanic U.S. Census Bureau
3. Percentage Asian U.S. Census Bureau
4. Percentage foreign born U.S. Census Bureau
5. Income gap (income at the 90th percentile minus income at 10th HUD - Family income estimates
divided by income at the 10th percentile)
6. Spatial concentration of poverty (percent of children in high- Jargowsky, P. (1997) Poverty and Place.
poverty census tracts)
7. Racial dissimilarity index Cutler, Glaeser and Vigdor (1999). Access via
http://trinity.aas.duke.edu/~/vigdor/segregation
8. Racial isolation index Cutler, Glaeser and Vigdor (1999). Access via
http://trinity.aas.duke.edu/~[vigdor/segregation
9. Homeownership rate U.S. Census Bureau
10. Concentration of poverty in the core city U.S. Census Bureau
11. Children between the ages of 16 and 19 not working or in
school.
12. Dependence the construction less than 19.
and areastar than 45
and greater man os
I. Commuting Times
Commoning innes     O.J. Cerisos Boredu     O.J. Cerisos Boredu     Sources Dated Almanac     Sources Dated Almanac
2. An index Savageau, D. (2000) Fraces Rated Almanac
3. Recreation index Savagadu, D. (2000) Places Rated Almanac
4. Clinicite index
5. Treammidex Savageau, D. (2000) Places Rated Almanac
6. Tarispontation maex Savageau, D. (2000) Places Rated Almanac
Cost of mining     Survey and the second secon
Cover of doing husiness: tax rate index     Economy com
2. Number of city government within matconolitan grad divided by IIIS Consus Burgau
2. Nomber of dry governments within meropolitich dred divided by 0.3. Censos boredo
3. Core city's share of metropolitan population IIIS Census Bureau
Additional Variables not Associated with the Five Themes
1 Cost of doing business: Jabor cost index
2 Cost of doing business: apprav cost index Economy.com
2. Cost of doing business: energy cost index Economy.com
4 Percentage of housing stock built before 1940
5 Concentration of manufacturing jobs